Filed: August 25, 2017

Filed on behalf of:
Patent Owner Voip-Pal.com Inc.
By: Kerry Taylor
John M. Carson
KNOBBE, MARTENS, OLSON & BEAR, LLP
2040 Main Street, 14th Floor
Irvine, CA 92614
Tel.: (858) 707-4000
Fax: (858) 707-4001
Email: BoxDigifonica@knobbe.com

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

APPLE INC.

Petitioner,

v.

VoIP-PAL.COM, INC.,

Patent Owner

Case No. IPR2017-01399
U.S. Patent 8,542,815

PATENT OWNER'S PRELIMINARY RESPONSE TO PETITION FOR *INTER PARTES* REVIEW

DOCKET ALARM
Find authenticated court documents without watermarks at docketalarm.com.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Page No.

I. INTRODUCTION 1

II. ARGUMENT 4

A. Introduction to Claimed Subject Matter 4

B. Grounds 1 and 2 Fail Because None of the References Disclose a Caller Dialing Profile 6

1. Chu '684 Does Not Disclose A Caller Dialing Profile As Recited In The Claims 8

a. Overview of Chu '684 8

b. The "Subscriber" Dial Plans in Chu '684 Are Enterprise Dial Plans 9

c. Petitioner Has Admitted That Chu '684 Uses the Word "Subscriber" To Mean an Enterprise Rather Than an Individual Caller 11

d. Petitioner Has Admitted That Chu '684 Does Not Disclose a Caller Dialing Profile 14

e. Despite Previous Admissions, the Present Petition Adopts A Misinterpretation of Chu '684 18

f. Enterprise Dial Plans Cannot Be Relied On To Demonstrate The Claims Are Obvious 23

2. Scott Does Not Disclose a Caller Profile As Recited In The Claims 24

a. Overview of Scott 24

b. The Gateway Application Settings of Scott Is Not a Caller Dialing Profile 26

DOCKET ALARM

Find authenticated court documents without watermarks at docketalarm.com.

TABLE OF CONTENTS
(cont'd.)

Page No.

c. The Petition Does Not Assert That the Gateway Application Settings in Scott Are Caller-Specific.....26

3. Hinchey Does Not Disclose a Caller Dialing Profile As Recited In the Claims.....27

a. Overview of Hinchey.....27

b. The "Dial Plan Schema" of Hinchey Is Not a Caller Profile.....28

c. The Petition Does Not Assert That the Dial Plan Schemas of Hinchey Are Caller-Specific.....29

C. Grounds 1 and 2 Fail Because Petitioner has Misconstrued Claim 1 as Not Requiring an Order of Steps [1b] and [1d].....30

1. Step [1d] depends upon step [1b].....30

2. The Board Must Resolve a Claim Construction Dispute.....31

3. Petitioner Cites to Steps Performed in the Wrong Order.....31

D. Grounds 1 and 2 Fail Because Petitioner's Proposed Combination Would be Inoperative.....33

1. Petitioner Has Proposed a Manner of Combining Chu '684 With Scott That Does Not Work.....34

2. Petitioner Acknowledged In the Previous IPR Proceedings That the Manner of Combination Was Defective.....37

3. Petitioner Has Not Refuted the Patent Owner's Previous Arguments Regarding the Inoperative Nature of the Proposed Combinations.....42

4. Reformatting Only Calls Destined for the PSTN Would be the Operative Manner of Combination.....43

DOCKET ALARM

Find authenticated court documents without watermarks at docketalarm.com.

TABLE OF CONTENTS
(cont'd.)

Page No.

a. Chu ’684 Classifies Calls Using a Prefix Digit As Is Standard For PBX Systems 43

b. Petitioner’s Assertion That Chu ’684 Does Not Operate Like a Conventional PBX is Unsupported.....44

c. Petitioner’s Declarant Admitted That Using a Prefix Digit With Chu ’684 Would Solve The Corruption Of Private Numbers 47

d. Petitioner’s Proposed Combination Is Based on Hindsight.....49

E. Grounds 1 and 2 Fail Because Petitioner’s Proposed Motivation to Combine is Flawed.....50

1. Petitioner Cites to a Non-Existent Deficiency in Chu ’684 as a Reason to Combine References 51

2. Petitioner’s Arguments That Users of Chu ’684 Cannot Dial As If On the PSTN Are Unsupported 52

F. This Follow-On Petition Should be Denied Under 35 U.S.C. §§ 314(a) and/or 325(d).....54

1. The Petition Is Unjustified Under the Factors For 35 U.S.C. § 314(a) 56

a. Same petitioner, same independent claims.....57

b. Petitioner uses the same primary reference, and should have known of the second reference.....57

c. The earlier proceeding was far along when second Petition was filed 58

d. Nearly a year had lapsed between petition filings.....59

DOCKET ALARM

Find authenticated court documents without watermarks at docketalarm.com.

TABLE OF CONTENTS
(cont'd.)

Page No.

e. Petitioner does not explain the purpose for its belated second attack 59

f. Conclusion 60

2. Petitioner will be estopped from maintaining this proceeding 61

III. CONCLUSION 66

DOCKET ALARM

Find authenticated court documents without watermarks at docketalarm.com.

DOCKET ALARM

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts

Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research

With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips

Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS
Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS
Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS
Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.