

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

APPLE INC.,
Petitioner,

v.

IMMERSION CORPORATION,
Patent Owner.

Case IPR2017-01310
Patent No. 8,749,507

**IMMERSION CORPORATION'S
PATENT OWNER PRELIMINARY RESPONSE**

Mail Stop "PATENT BOARD"
Patent Trial and Appeal Board
U.S. Patent and Trademark Office
P.O. Box 1450
Alexandria, VA 22313-1450

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	<u>Page</u>
I. INTRODUCTION	1
II. THE ‘507 PATENT.....	4
III. PROCEDURAL HISTORY	5
IV. THE BOARD SHOULD EXERCISE ITS DISCRETION UNDER 35 U.S.C. §§ 314(A) AND 325(D) TO DENY INSTITUTION.....	6
V. PERSON HAVING ORDINARY SKILL IN THE ART (POSITA).....	13
VI. CLAIM CONSTRUCTION	14
VII. CLAIMS 1-18 ARE NOT OBVIOUS OVER ASTALA IN VIEW OF SHAHOIAN	18
A. Neither Astala Nor Shahoian Discloses The “determining a press if: . . . the change in pressure is greater than a change in pressure threshold” Limitation	18
1. Astala Consistently Teaches Determining Touch Inputs Based Only On Pressure And Time	19
2. Astala Uses “Change In Pressure” For An Entirely Different Purpose, Unrelated To “Determining A Press”	21
3. Petitioner’s Conclusory Obviousness Arguments Fail	28
B. Astala Contains No Disclosure Relating To Haptics, and Shahoian Fails to Remedy the Deficiency	30
C. Astala and Shahoian Do Not Render Obvious Claims 2, 10, and 15	32
D. Additional Dependent Claims	36
VIII. CONCLUSION.....	37

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

	Page(s)
Cases	
<i>In re. Am. Acad. of Sci. Tech. Ctr.</i> , 367 F.3d 1359 (Fed. Cir. 2004)	29
<i>Arendi S.A.R.L. v. Apple Inc.</i> , 832 F.3d 1355 (Fed. Cir. 2016)	29
<i>Cuozzo Speed Techs., LLC v. Lee</i> , 136 S. Ct. 2131, 195 L. Ed. 2d 423 (2016).....	14
<i>PPC Broadband, Inc., v. Corning Optical Comms. RF, LLC</i> , 815 F.3d 747 (Fed. Cir. 2016)	14
Statutes	
35 U.S.C. § 103(a)	2
35 U.S.C. § 314(a)	7, 14, 38
35 U.S.C. § 325(d)	7, 12, 38
Other Authorities	
37 C.F.R. § 42.100(b)	14
37 C.F.R. § 42.108(a).....	14

EXHIBIT LIST

Immersion Ex. 2001	Declaration of Daniel Wigdor, Ph.D. in Support of Immersion Corporation's Patent Owner Preliminary Response
Immersion Ex. 2002	<i>Curriculum Vitae</i> of Daniel Wigdor, Ph.D.
Immersion Ex. 2003	Excerpt from Immersion's ITC Complaint (ITC Inv. No. 337-TA-1004/990)
Immersion Ex. 2004	Excerpt from April 27, 2017 Hearing Transcript (International Trade Commission)
Immersion Ex. 2005	Excerpt from Apple's Invalidity Claim Chart for U.S. Patent No. 8,749,507 Based On U.S. Patent No. 6,590,568 (Astala '568)
Immersion Ex. 2006	Decision on Appeal 2009-015440 in Application 10/723,778 (Board of Patent Appeals and Interferences)
Immersion Ex. 2007	May 13, 2013 Applicant Arguments and Remarks Made in an Amendment in Application 13/441,108
Immersion Ex. 2008	Excerpt from Exhibit 5 to December 16, 2016 Expert Report of Dr. Andy Cockburn regarding Invalidity
Immersion Ex. 2009	U.S. Patent No. 4,555,952 to Jenkins
Immersion Ex. 2010	Excerpt from Apple's Supplemental Interrogatory Responses to Immersion's 6th Set of Interrogatories (Nos. 98-100, 103-104), served September 14, 2016 in ITC Inv. No. 337-TA-1004/990

STATEMENT OF MATERIAL FACTS IN DISPUTE

Petitioner Apple, Inc. did not submit a statement of material facts in this Petition. Accordingly, no response is due pursuant to 37 C.F.R. § 42.23(a), and no facts are admitted.

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.