

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

LG ELECTRONICS, INC.
Petitioner

v.

ATI TECHNOLOGIES ULC
Patent Owner

Case No.: IPR2017-01225
Patent 8,760,454

Declaration of Dr. Nader Bagherzadeh

LG Ex. 1005
LG v. ATI

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	Page
I. INTRODUCTION	1
A. Engagement	1
B. Background and Qualifications	1
C. Compensation and Prior Testimony	3
D. Materials Considered.....	3
II. LEGAL UNDERSTANDINGS.....	4
A. Person of Ordinary Skill in the Art	4
B. Anticipation	4
C. Obviousness.....	5
III. TECHNOLOGY BACKGROUND.....	8
IV. THE '454 PATENT.....	13
A. Prosecution of the '454 Patent	13
B. Person of Ordinary Skill in the Art	16
C. Overview of the '454 Patent.....	17
V. GENERAL ISSUES	19
A. Claims of the '454 Patent That I Am Addressing.....	19
B. Interpretation of Certain Claim Terms	21
C. Prior Art References	21
1. Ex. 1003 - U.S. Patent 7,038,685 to Lindholm et al.....	22
2. Ex. 1004 – WO 00/62182 to Stuttard et al.....	22
3. Ex. 1009 / Ex. 1010 – OpenGL Graphics System: A Specification, Version 1.4, and OpenGL Overview	23
VI. PATENTABILITY ANALYSIS	26
A. Summary of Opinions	26
B. Lindholm as Primary Reference.....	27
1. Brief Overview of Lindholm	27

TABLE OF CONTENTS
(continued)

	Page
2. <u>Ground 1: Lindholm Anticipates Claims 2-11.</u>	32
a. Lindholm Discloses Claim 2.	32
(i) “A unified shader”	32
(ii) “a general purpose register block for maintaining data”	35
(iii) “a processor unit ... wherein the processor unit executes instructions that generate a pixel color in response to selected data from the general purpose register block and generates vertex position and appearance data in response to selected data from the general purpose register block”	36
(iv) “a sequencer, coupled to the general purpose register block and the processor unit, the sequencer maintaining instructions operative to cause the processor unit to execute vertex calculation and pixel calculation operations on selected data maintained in the general purpose register block”	40
b. Lindholm Discloses Claim 3.	45
(i) “A unified shader”	45
(ii) “a processor unit operative to perform vertex calculation operations and pixel calculation operations”	46
(iii) “shared resources, operatively coupled to the processor unit”	49

TABLE OF CONTENTS
(continued)

	Page
(iv) “the processor unit operative to use the shared resources for either vertex data or pixel information and operative to perform pixel calculation operations until enough shared resources become available and then use the shared resources to perform vertex calculation operations”	51
c. Lindholm Discloses Claim 4.	56
(i) “A unified shader”	56
(ii) “a processor unit operative to perform vertex calculation operations and pixel calculation operations”	57
(iii) “shared resources, operatively coupled to the processor unit”	57
(iv) “the processor unit operative to use the shared resources for either vertex data or pixel information and operative to perform vertex calculation operations until enough shared resources become available and then use the shared resources to perform pixel calculation operations”	57
d. Lindholm Discloses Claim 5.	62
(i) “A unified shader”	63
(ii) “a processor unit”	63
(iii) “a sequencer, coupled to the processor unit, the sequencer maintaining instructions operative to cause the processor unit to execute vertex calculation and pixel calculation operations on selected data maintained in a store depending upon an amount of space available in the store”	63

TABLE OF CONTENTS
(continued)

	Page
e. Lindholm Discloses Claim 6.	69
f. Lindholm Discloses Claim 7.	71
g. Lindholm Discloses Claim 8.	72
h. Lindholm Discloses Claim 9.	74
i. Lindholm Discloses Claim 10.	76
j. Lindholm Discloses Claim 11.	77
(i) “A unified shader”	77
(ii) “a processor unit flexibly controlled to perform vertex manipulation operations and pixel manipulation operations based on vertex or pixel workload”	78
(iii) “an instruction store”	78
(iv) “wherein the processor unit of the unified shader performs the vertex manipulation operations and pixel manipulation operations at various degrees of completion based on switching between instructions in the instruction store”	78
3. <u>Ground 2</u> : Lindholm, Alone or in Combination with OpenGL, Renders Claims 2-11 Obvious.	82
a. Claims 2, 8, and 9 In View of Lindholm Alone	83
b. Claim 2, 8, and 9 in View of Lindholm and OpenGL v1.4	84
c. Claims 3-10 in View of Lindholm Alone.....	90
C. Stuttard as Primary Reference.....	91
1. Brief Overview of Stuttard.....	91
2. <u>Ground 3</u> : Stuttard Anticipates Claims 2 and 11.	94
a. Stuttard Discloses Claim 2.	94

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.