# UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD LUPIN LTD. AND LUPIN PHARMACEUTICALS INC., Petitioner V. HORIZON THERAPEUTICS, INC., Patent Owner Case IPR 2016-00829 Patent 9,095,559

## DECLARATION OF DR. GREGORY M. ENNS





## **TABLE OF CONTENTS**

I.	Intr	oduction	1	
II.	Qua	alifications	2	
	A.	Education	2	
	B.	Professional Experience	3	
	C.	Publications and Presentations.	6	
	D.	Honors and Awards	7	
	E.	Professional Organizations and Service Activities	7	
III.	Leg	al Principles	8	
IV.	Sur	nmary of Opinions	10	
V.	Per	Person of Ordinary Skill in the Art		
VI.	Tec	hnology Background	15	
VII.	Ove	erview of the '559 Patent	23	
VIII.	Cla	im Construction	28	
	A.	"upper limit of normal"	28	
	B.	"the subject"	29	
IX.	Prior Art Does Not Disclose or Suggest Subject Matter of Claims 1-1531			
	A.	Prior Art Did Not Disclose Increasing or Initiating A Dosage of Glyceryl Tri-[4-phenylbutyrate] in a Patient With a Plasma		
		Ammonia Level Between Half the ULN and the ULN	31	
	B.	No Motivation To Adjust Treatment Regimen for Subject with Plasma Ammonia Levels in Normal Range	44	
		1. One of Ordinary Skill Would Not Have Been Motivated to		
		Combine the '859 Publication with Simell or Blau	46	



		2. One of Ordinary Skill Did Not Account for a Fasting vs.	
		Fed Ammonia Level When Making Dosing Determinations	53
		3. Prior Art Disclosed Normal Plasma Ammonia Levels Were	
		Acceptable and Only Increased Treatment When Levels	
		Were Well Above Normal	58
	C.	No Reasonable Expectation That An Increased Dosage Would	
		Lower A Patient's Baseline Ammonia or Ensure A Normal	
		Plasma Ammonia	63
	D.	Prior Art Did Not Disclose or Suggest Targeting a Plasma	
		Ammonia Level Below Half the Upper Limit of Normal	65
VI	Cor	polygion	67



I, Dr. Gregory M. Enns, hereby declare as follows:

### I. Introduction

- 1. I, Dr. Gregory M. Enns, have been retained by Finnegan on behalf of Horizon Therapeutics, Inc. as an independent expert in the field of clinical biochemical genetics. My curriculum vitae establish my qualifications in this area. (Ex. 2007.) I am being compensated for the time I spend on this matter, but no part of my compensation depends on the outcome of this proceeding.
- 2. I understand that this proceeding involves U.S. Patent No. 9,095,559 ("the '559 patent"). (Ex. 1001.) I understand that the application for the '559 patent was filed on February 22, 2013, as U.S. Patent Application No. 13/775,000 ("the '000 application"), and that the patent issued on August 4, 2015. (Ex. 1001.) I understand that the '559 patent claims priority to Provisional Application No. 61/542,100 ("the '100 application"), filed on September 30, 2011. (Ex. 1001.) I have therefore considered the state of the art and the prior art available as of September 30, 2011.
- 3. None of my opinions would change if I were to assume in the alternative that the date of invention was February 22, 2013, which is the date on which the application for the '559 patent was filed.
- 4. I understand that Petitioner has asserted that a combination of the '859 Publication (Ex. 1007), Blau (Ex. 1006), and Simell (Ex. 1005) render obvious



claims 1, 2, 4, 5, 7-10, 12, and 13 of the '559 patent and that this combination with the addition Brusilow '84 (Ex. 1004) renders obvious claims 3, 6, 11, 14, and 15. (Petition at 13.) In preparing this declaration, I have considered the '559 patent and its prosecution history, the Petition for *Inter Partes* Review of U.S. Patent No. 9,095,559, the Declaration of Dr. Vaux (Ex. 1002), the prior art and references identified in the Petition and Dr. Vaux's Declaration, my knowledge and expertise in the art, and any additional references cited herein.

## **II.** Qualifications

### A. Education

- 5. I received a Bachelor of Arts degree in Biology from Pomona College in 1984. In 1987, I obtained a Diploma in Medical Science from the University of St. Andrews, Scotland. In 1990, I received my U.K. Medical Degree from the University of Glasgow, Scotland.
- 6. From 1990 to 1991, I was a Junior House Officer at the Royal Hospital for Sick Children and the Glasgow Royal Infirmary, working in both Pediatric Surgery and General Medicine. I then completed my U.S. residency training in Pediatrics at the Children's Hospital of Los Angeles ("CHLA"), beginning as Intern and Resident from 1991 to 1994, and serving as Chief Resident from 1994 to 1995. From 1995 to 1998, I completed a fellowship in Medical Genetics at the University of California, San Francisco, including training in



# DOCKET

# Explore Litigation Insights



Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

# **Real-Time Litigation Alerts**



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time** alerts and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

## **Advanced Docket Research**



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

## **Analytics At Your Fingertips**



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

### API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

#### **LAW FIRMS**

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

#### **FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS**

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

### **E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS**

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.

