

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

LUPIN LTD. and LUPIN PHARMACEUTICALS INC.

Petitioners,

v.

HORIZON THERAPEUTICS, LLC

Patent Owner.

IPR2017-01159
U.S. Patent No. 9,254,278

PETITIONERS' REPLY

Mail Stop PATENT BOARD
Patent Trial and Appeal Board
United States Patent and Trademark Office
PO Box 1450
Alexandria, Virginia 22313-1450

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	<u>Page</u>
1. Horizon Is Collaterally Estopped from Arguing Unpatentability.....	1
2. Horizon Has Not Offered Any Evidence That Justifies Changing the Board’s Findings in the ’559 FWD or Those Reached at Institution.....	4
3. Horizon Mischaracterizes the Prior Art.....	5
(a) The Prior Art Does Not Teach Away From Adjusting Dosage When Plasma Ammonia Was at or Under the ULN	5
(b) POSAs Used Ammonia Levels to Adjust Drug Dosage.....	9
4. Claims 1-3, 5, 9, and 13 Are Not Patentable	12
5. There Was Motivation to Combine the Cited Prior Art References	14
(a) Any Purported Differences Between the Nitrogen Scavenging Drugs in Simell and the ’859 Publication Are Irrelevant.....	14
(b) LPI is a UCD	16
(c) A POSA Would Have Combined the Cited References	17
6. Horizon’s Arguments Regarding POSA Level and Dr. Vaux’s Qualifications Should be Rejected	18
7. Petitioners Have Shown a Reasonable Expectation of Success.....	20

8. Conclusion.....23

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

	Page(s)
Cases	
<i>Allergan, Inc. v. Apotex Inc.</i> , 754 F.3d 952 (Fed. Cir. 2014).....	17
<i>Alza Corp. v. Mylan Labs, Inc.</i> , 464 F.3d 1286 (Fed. Cir. 2006).....	21
<i>Black v. Office of Pers. Mgmt.</i> , 641 F. App'x 1007 (Fed. Cir. 2016).....	3
<i>In re Freeman</i> , 30 F.3d 1459 (Fed. Cir. 1994).....	1
<i>Innovation Toys, LLC v. MGA Entm't, Inc.</i> , 637 F.3d 1314 (Fed. Cir. 2011).....	17
<i>Iron Grip Barbell Co., Inc. v. USA Sports, Inc.</i> , 392 F.3d 1317 (Fed. Cir. 2004).....	12
<i>Jet, Inc. v. Sewage Aeration Sys.</i> , 223 F.3d 1360 (Fed. Cir. 2000).....	1
<i>KSR Int'l Co. v. Teleflex Inc.</i> , 550 U.S. 398 (2007).....	5
<i>Leo Pharmaceutical Products Ltd. v. Rea</i> , 726 F.3d 1346 (Fed. Cir. 2013).....	9
<i>Liberty Mut. Ins. Co. v. FAG Bearings Corp.</i> , 335 F.3d 752 (8th Cir. 2003).....	3
<i>In re Merck & Co.</i> , 800 F.2d 1091 (Fed. Cir. 1986).....	17
<i>Nestle USA, Inc. v. Steuben Foods, Inc.</i> , 884 F.3d 1350 (Fed. Cir. 2018).....	1, 2

Ohio Willow Wood Co. v. Alps South, LLC,
735 F.3d 1333 (Fed. Cir. 2013).....2

In re Peterson,
315 F.3d 1325 (Fed. Cir. 2003).....12, 13

Pharmacia & Upjohn Co. v. Mylan Pharms., Inc.,
170 F.3d 1373 (Fed. Cir. 1999).....3

Other Authorities

Charles Alan Wright et al., 18 Fed. Prac. & Proc. Juris. § 4426 (3d
ed.).....4

Charles Alan Wright et al., Federal Practice and Procedure § 4433 (2d
ed. 2002)3

Restatement (Second) of Judgments § 13 (1982).....3

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.