

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

LUPIN LTD. AND LUPIN PHARMACEUTICALS INC.,

Petitioner

v.

HORIZON THERAPEUTICS, LLC,

Patent Owner

Case IPR 2017-01159

Patent 9,254,278

HORIZON THERAPEUTICS, LLC'S PATENT OWNER RESPONSE

TABLE OF CONTENTS

I.	INTRODUCTION	1
II.	BACKGROUND	7
	A. Prior Art at Issue.....	7
	B. Technical Background on Treatment of UCDs.....	7
	C. Overview of the '278 Patent.....	10
III.	LUPIN'S DEFINITION OF ONE OF ORDINARY SKILL IN THE ART IS OVERLY BROAD	14
IV.	CLAIM INTERPRETATION	17
	A. "upper limit of normal"	18
	B. "the subject"	18
V.	CLAIMS 1-15 WOULD NOT HAVE BEEN OBVIOUS IN VIEW OF THE ASSERTED PRIOR ART	20
	A. A POSA Would Not Have Been Motivated to Increase the Dosage of Glycerol Phenylbutyrate Based on Normal Plasma Ammonia Levels	20
	1. The '859 Publication and the Prior Art as a Whole Taught That Normal Plasma Ammonia Levels Were Acceptable.....	20
	2. The Potential Variability of Normal Plasma Ammonia Levels Would Not Have Motivated a POSA to Increase the Dosage of Glycerol Phenylbutyrate	31
	3. Lupin's Obviousness Analysis Hinges on Dr. Vaux's Conclusory and Unsupported Testimony	35
	B. One of Ordinary Skill Would Have Had No Motivation to Combine the Teachings of the '859 Publication with Those of Blau or Simell.....	40

::

1.	Simell Concerns the Dosing of Different Drugs for a Different Condition Than the '859 Publication	42
2.	Simell and Blau Do Not Address the Use of Normal Fasting Plasma Ammonia Levels to Treat UCDS.....	46
3.	Simell, Blau and Brusilow '979 Fail to Cure the Deficiencies of the '859 Publication.....	48
C.	The Prior Art Did Not Disclose or Suggest the Limitations of Claims 1-3, 5, 9 and 13	50
D.	Lupin Fails to Demonstrate a Reasonable Expectation of Success	55
VI.	CONCLUSION.....	59

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

Cases

Allergan, Inc. v. Sandoz, Inc.,
726 F.3d 1286 (Fed. Cir. 2013)38

Alza Corp. v. Mylan Labs, Inc.,
464 F.3d 1286 (Fed. Cir. 2006)39

Ashland Oil, Inc. v. Delta Resins & Refractories, Inc.,
776 F.2d 281 (Fed. Cir. 1985) 36, 40

Broadcom Corp. v. Emulex Corp.,
732 F.3d 1325 (Fed. Cir. 2013)55

C.R. Bard, Inc. v. Med. Components, Inc.,
IPR2015-01660, Paper 9 (P.T.A.B. Feb. 9, 2016)38

Catalina Mktg. Int’l v. Coolsavings.com, Inc.,
289 F.3d 801 (Fed. Cir. 2002)19

Disney Enter., Inc. v. Kappos,
923 F. Supp. 2d 788 (E.D. Va. 2013)26

Envtl. Designs, Inc. v. Union Oil Co.,
713 F.2d 693 (Fed. Cir. 1983)16

Graham v. John Deere Co.,
383 U.S. 1 (1966)41

Hospitality Core Services LLC v. Nomadix, Inc.,
IPR2016–00052, Paper 8, 2016 WL 2909164 (P.T.A.B. Apr. 27, 2016)17

In re Cyclobenzaprine Extended-Release Patent Litigation,
676 F.3d 1063 (Fed. Cir. 2012) 41, 55

In re Kahn,
441 F.3d 977 (Fed. Cir. 2006)38

In re Paulsen,
30 F.3d 1475 (Fed. Cir. 1994)18

In re Van Geuns,
988 F.2d 1181 (Fed. Cir. 1993)17

In re Wilson,
311 F.2d 266 (C.C.P.A. 1962).....26

Leo Pharm. Prods. Ltd. v. Rea,
726 F.3d 1346 (Fed. Cir. 2013)22

Mintz v. Dietz & Watson, Inc.,
679 F.3d 1372 (Fed. Cir. 2012)42

Oil States Energy Servs., LLC v Greene’s Energy Group, LLC,
No. 16-712 (cert. granted June 12, 2017).....59

Pitney Bowes, Inc. v. Hewlett-Packard Co.,
182 F.3d 1298 (Fed. Cir. 1999)19

Verlander v. Garner,
348 F.3d 1335 (Fed. Cir. 2003)38

Zimmer Biomet Holdings, Inc. v. Four Mile Bay, LLC,
IPR2016-00011, Paper 8 (P.T.A.B. Apr. 1, 2016)38

Regulations

37 C.F.R. § 4259

37 C.F.R. § 42.65(a)..... 36, 40, 47

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.