

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE
BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

ARGENTUM PHARMACEUTICALS LLC)
)
 Petitioner,)
)
 vs.) No. IPR2017-01053
)
 ALCON RESEARCH, LTD.,)
)
 Patent owner.)

DEPOSITION OF ERNING XIZ, Ph.D.
 May 11, 2018
 Chicago, Illinois 60654
 9:00 a.m.

REPORTED BY:
 JO ANN LOSOYA

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

PRESENT:

Appeared on behalf of Defendants.

FOLEY & LARDNER

321 North Clark Street, Suite 2800

Chicago, Illinois 60654

(312) 832-4378

BY: MICHAEL R. HOUSTON, ESQ.

mhouston@foley.com

Appeared on behalf of the patent owner.

WILLIAMS & CONNOLLY

725 Twelfth Street NW

Washington, DC 20005

(202) 434-5097

BY: ALEXANDER S. ZOLAN, ESQ.

azolanz@wc.com

DAVID M. KRINSKY, ESQ.

dkrinsky@wc.com

REPORTED BY: JO ANN LOSOYA

LICENSE #: 084-002437

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

EXAMINATION

Witness	Page	Line
ERNING XIZ, Ph.D.		
By Mr. Zolan	4	7
By Mr. Houston	107	21

E X H I B I T S

EXHIBIT	DESCRIPTION	PAGE
EXHIBIT 1093	Declaration	5
EXHIBIT 2122	Winslow article	16
EXHIBIT 1002	Original declaration	20
EXHIBIT 1007	Schneider reference	58
EXHIBIT 1003	Xia patent	72
EXHIBIT 104	Chowhan reference	76
EXHIBIT 2121	Deposition transcript	85
EXHIBIT 1042	Systane Free	94
EXHIBIT 1110	Systane Free screenshot	95
EXHIBIT 1111	Systane Free screenshot	95
EXHIBIT 1041	Systane Free screenshot	127

(Witness sworn at 9:04 a.m.)

WHEREUPON:

ERNING XIZ, Ph.D.,

called as a witness herein, having been first duly sworn, was examined and testified as follows:

E X A M I N A T I O N

BY MR. ZOLAN:

Q. Good morning, Dr. Xia.

A. Good morning.

Q. It's good to see you again.

A. Same here.

Q. How does your own experience inform your opinions about how the POSA would understand prior art?

MR. HOUSTON: Objection, form.

THE WITNESS: Can you repeat that?

BY MR. ZOLAN:

Q. Yeah. How does your own experience inform your opinions about how the POSA would understand prior art?

MR. HOUSTON: Same objection.

BY THE WITNESS:

A. You're talking about how the POSA understands the prior art?

Q. Well, what I'm asking is how does your

1 experience, you, as Dr. Xia, who is the expert
2 witness in this case, how does your personal
3 experience inform your opinions about how the person
4 of ordinary skill would understand prior art?

5 A. By definition, the prior art, the date of
6 the publications should be preceding the publication
7 filing date of the patent's applications. So
8 everything, every single publications before that
9 date can be considered as prior art.

10 Q. Okay. I guess I'm not asking what makes
11 something prior art. What I'm asking is when you
12 are reading a reference and you are opining about
13 how that reference would inform the person of
14 ordinary skill, how does your personal experience
15 inform those opinions?

16 A. My base is based on the related
17 information from prior arts, not just everything I
18 read. If I read reference involves zinc, for
19 example, does not mean I will use that publications.

20 Q. Let me make it a little more concrete.
21 I'm going to hand you what has been marked as
22 Exhibit 1093.

23 (Deposition Exhibit 1093 was
24 marked for identification.)

25

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.