

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

APOTEX INC., APOTEX CORP., ARGENTUM PHARMACEUTICALS LLC,
ACTAVIS ELIZABETH LLC, TEVA PHARMACEUTICALS USA, INC., SUN
PHARMACEUTICAL INDUSTRIES, LTD., SUN PHARMACEUTICAL
INDUSTRIES, INC., AND SUN PHARMA GLOBAL FZE,
Petitioners,

v.

NOVARTIS A.G.,
Patent Owner.

IPR2017-00854¹
Patent No. 9,187,405

PETITIONERS' NOTICE OF OBJECTIONS TO EVIDENCE

¹ Cases IPR2017-01550, IPR2017-01946, and IPR2017-01929 have been joined with this proceeding.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

I.	INTRODUCTION	1
II.	OBJECTIONS	1
	1. Objections to EX2022, and any Reference to/Reliance Thereon.....	1
	2. Objections to EX2024, and any Reference to/Reliance Thereon.....	2
	3. Objections to EX2025 and any Reference to/Reliance Thereon.....	2
	4. Objections to Exs. 2027, 2032, 2033, 2048, 2054, 2056, and 2062 and any Reference to/Reliance Thereon.....	3
	5. Objections to Exs. 2035, 2038, 2040, 2042, 2058, and 2067-2069 and any Reference to/Reliance Thereon	5
	6. Objections to EX2037 and any Reference to/Reliance Thereon.....	7
	7. Objections to EX2039 and any Reference to/Reliance Thereon.....	8
	8. Objections to EX2047 and any Reference to/Reliance Thereon.....	8
	9. Objections to Exs. 2057 and 2070 and any Reference to/Reliance Thereon	8
	10. Objections to Exs. 2063-2066 and any Reference to/Reliance Thereon	9
	11. Objections to Ex. 2072 and any Reference to/Reliance Thereon.....	10
III.	CONCLUSION	11

Case IPR2017-00854
Patent 9,187,405

I. INTRODUCTION

Pursuant to 37 C.F.R. § 42.64(b)(1), Apotex Inc. and Apotex Corp. (“Petitioner”) submits the following objections to Novartis A.G. (“Patent Owner”)’s Exhibits 2022, 2024, 2025, 2026, 2027, 2032, 2033, 2035, 2037, 2038, 2039, 2040, 2042, 2047, 2048, , 2054, 2056, 2057, 2058, 2062-2068, 2069, 2070, and 2072, as listed on Patent Owner’s Updated Exhibit List filed on November 13, 2017, and any reference to or reliance on the foregoing Exhibits in Patent Owner’s Response (“POR”), its expert declarations, or future filings by Patent Owner. As required by 37 C.F.R. § 42.62, Petitioner’s objections below apply the Federal Rules of Evidence (“F.R.E.”).

II. OBJECTIONS

1. Objections to EX2022, and any Reference to/Reliance Thereon

Grounds for Objection: F.R.E. 401, 402 (Irrelevant Evidence Inadmissible); F.R.E. 403 (Excluding Evidence for Prejudice, Confusion, Waste of Time, Duplication, or Other Reasons); F.R.E. 701, 702, 703 (Expert Foundation and Opinions); F.R.E. 802, 803, 805 (Inadmissible Hearsay).

EX2022 is duplicative of expert testimony offered by Patent Owner’s other witnesses. Petitioner further objects to Exhibit 2022 to the extent it relies upon any of Exhibits 2027, 2032, 2033, 2048, 2054, 2056, and 2062 for the truth of the matter asserted. F.R.E. 802.

2. Objections to EX2024, and any Reference to/Reliance Thereon

Grounds for Objection: F.R.E. 401, 402 (Irrelevant Evidence Inadmissible); F.R.E. 403 (Excluding Evidence for Prejudice, Confusion, Waste of Time, or Other Reasons); F.R.E. 701, 702, 703 (Expert Foundation and Opinions); F.R.E. 802, 803, 805 (Inadmissible Hearsay).

EX2024 is duplicative of expert testimony offered by Patent Owner's other witnesses. Petitioner further objects to Exhibit 2024 to the extent it relies upon any of Exhibits 2027, 2032, 2033, 2048, 2054, 2056, and 2062 for the truth of the matter asserted. F.R.E. 802.

3. Objections to EX2025 and any Reference to/Reliance Thereon

Grounds for Objection: F.R.E. 401, 402 (Irrelevant Evidence Inadmissible); F.R.E. 403 (Excluding Evidence for Prejudice, Confusion, Waste of Time, or Other Reasons); F.R.E. 602 (Foundation); F.R.E. 701, 702 (Expert Foundation and Opinions); F.R.E. 801, 802, 803, 805 (Inadmissible Hearsay); F.R.E. 901 (Authenticating Evidence).

EX2025 is duplicative of expert testimony offered by Patent Owner's other witnesses. Petitioner further objects to Exhibit 2025 to the extent it relies upon any of Exhibits 2027, 2032, 2033, 2048, 2054, 2056, and 2062 for the truth of the matter asserted. F.R.E. 802.

Case IPR2016-00712
Patent 8,927,592

4. Objections to Exs. 2027, 2032, 2033, 2048, 2054, 2056, and 2062 and any Reference to/Reliance Thereon

Grounds for Objection: F.R.E. 401, 402 (Irrelevant Evidence Inadmissible); F.R.E. 403 (Excluding Evidence for Prejudice, Confusion, Waste of Time, or Other Reasons); F.R.E. 602 (Foundation); F.R.E. 801, 802, 803, 805 (Inadmissible Hearsay); F.R.E. 901 (Authenticating Evidence).

Patent Owner describes EX2017 as the “American Autoimmune Related Diseases Association, Inc. Autoimmune Disease List,” which was accessed from www.aarda.org/diseaselist on October 5, 2017.

Patent Owner describes EX2032 as “Fingolimod, Chemical Abstract Registry No. 162359-55-9.” Patent Owner provides no source information or publication date.

Patent Owner describes EX2033 as “2-amino-2-[2-(4-octylphenyl)ethyl]propane-1,3-diol;hydrochloride, Chemical Abstract Registry No. 162359-56-0.” Patent Owner provides no source information or publication date.

Patent Owner describes EX2048 as “Park et al. ‘Peripheral Blood FTY720 Pharmacokinetic/Pharmacodynamic (PK/PD) Modeling in Renal Transplanted Recipients,’ Abstract #707, *Kidney: Pharmacogenetics, Kinetics and New Drug*, p. 333-334.” Patent Owner provides no source information or publication date.

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.