Paper No. 16

Entered: August 11, 2017

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

APOTEX INC. and APOTEX CORP., and ARGENTUM PHARMACEUTICALS LLC, Petitioners.

v. NOVARTIS AG, Patent Owner.

Case IPR2017-00854¹

Patent 9,187,405 B2

Before LORA M. GREEN, CHRISTOPHER M. KAISER, and ROBERT A. POLLOCK, *Administrative Patent Judges*.

POLLOCK, Administrative Patent Judge.

ORDER Conduct of the Proceeding 37 C.F.R. § 42.5

¹ Case IPR2017-01550 has been joined with this proceeding.



IPR2017-00854; IPR2017-01550

Patent 9,187,405 B2

In response to an August 8, 2017, email communication from Patent Owner, (Ex. 3002), the panel conducted a conference with counsel on August 10, 2017, to discuss scheduling for the deposition of Petitioner's expert, Dr. Giesser. Present were Judges Green, Kaiser, and Pollock; Michael Rosato, Jad Mills, and Steven Parmalee for Petitioner, Apotex; and Robert Trenchard and Jane Love for Patent Owner, Novartis.

As we understand the situation, counsel for Patent Owner has asked for deposition dates of September 18, 19, 20, 27, and 28, as well as October 3 and 4. Dr. Giesser has rejected each of those dates. Petitioner eventually offered three dates: September 8, 22, and 23, which counsel for Patent Owner found unacceptable because September 8 is a trial conflict, Friday, September 22 is Rosh Hashanah, and Saturday, September 23, would have required counsel for Patent Owner to travel cross-country during or immediately after the holiday.

Speaking on behalf of Apotex, Mr. Rosato explained that Dr. Giesser is a practicing physician whose availability is restricted by obligations to patient care. In relying on Dr. Giesser as an expert, however, Petitioner takes on an obligation to make that person reasonably available for cross examination. And although we appreciate Mr. Rosato's representation that Petitioner is willing to come to an agreement regarding a deposition date, Mr. Rosato was warned that if Dr. Giesser is not reasonably made available for cross-examination, we may order Petitioner to show cause why Dr. Giesser's Declaration should not be stricken from the record.

Accordingly, we enter the following order.



IPR2017-00854; IPR2017-01550

Patent 9,187,405 B2

ORDER

ORDERED that Petitioner will offer three additional weekdays that are not Jewish holidays when Dr. Giesser is available for deposition. Such dates will be on or before DUE DATE 1 (currently October 13, 2017). If necessary, parties may stipulate to different dates for DUE DATES 1–5 as set forth in the Scheduling Order.

FURTHER ORDERED that if parties cannot reach agreement regarding a date for Dr. Giesser's deposition by September 1, 2017, they should arrange a conference call with the panel.



IPR2017-00854; IPR2017-01550 Patent 9,187,405 B2

FOR PETITIONER APOTEX:

Steven W. Parmelee
Michael T. Rosato
Jad A. Mills
WILSON SONSINI GOODRICH & ROSATI
sparmelee@wsgr.com
mrosato@wsgr.com
jmills@wsgr.com

FOR PETITIONER ARGENTUM:

Teresa Stanek Rea
Deborah H. Yellin
Shannon M. Lentz
CROWELL & MORING LLP
TRea@Crowell.com
DYellin@crowell.com
SLentz@Crowell.com

Tyler C. Liu
ARGENTUM PHARMACEUTICALS, LLC
TLiu@agpharm.com

FOR PATENT OWNER:

Jane M. Love Robert Trenchard GIBSON, DUNN & CRUTCHER LLP <u>jlove@gibsondunn.com</u> <u>rtrenchard@gibsondunn.com</u>

