

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

---

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

---

APOTEX INC., APOTEX CORP., ARGENTUM PHARMACEUTICALS LLC,  
ACTAVIS ELIZABETH LLC, TEVA PHARMACEUTICALS USA, INC., SUN  
PHARMACEUTICAL INDUSTRIES, LTD., SUN PHARMACEUTICAL  
INDUSTRIES, INC., AND SUN PHARMA GLOBAL FZE,  
Petitioners,

v.

NOVARTIS A.G.,  
Patent Owner.

---

IPR2017-00854<sup>1</sup>  
Patent No. 9,187,405

---

REPLY DECLARATION OF LESLIE Z. BENET, PH.D.

---

---

<sup>1</sup> Cases IPR2017-01550, IPR2017-01946, and IPR2017-01929 have been joined  
with this proceeding.

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

I.	QUALIFICATIONS .....	1
II.	SCOPE OF WORK .....	8
III.	PTAB’S INSTITUTION DECISION.....	10
	A. Person Of Ordinary Skill In The Art .....	11
	B. Claim Construction .....	12
IV.	KOVARIK DISCLOSES A 0.5 MG DAILY DOSAGE MAINTENANCE THERAPY, NOT A HYPOTHETICAL DOSE .....	14
V.	EFFICACY OF KOVARIK’S 0.5 MG DAILY DOSAGE MAINTENANCE THERAPY IS NOT DEPENDENT ON A LOADING DOSE REGIMEN.....	16
VI.	THE PRIOR ART DOES NOT TEACH AWAY FROM THE 0.5 MG DAILY DOSE.....	19
	A. Webb, Kahan 2003 And Park Do Not Teach Away From The 0.5 mg Daily Dose. ....	19
	1. A POSA Would Not Read Webb As Establishing That At Least 70% Lymphopenia Was Necessary For Achieving Therapeutic Efficacy. ....	20
	2. A POSA Would Not Read Kahan 2003 As Discrediting The 0.5 mg Dose For Achieving Therapeutic Efficacy. ....	25
	3. A POSA Would Not Read Park As Discrediting The 0.5 mg Dose For Achieving Therapeutic Efficacy. ....	28
	B. Subsequent Prior Art References Undermine The Proposed Teaching Away Argument. ....	32
	1. A POSA Would Have Understood Kataoka To Suggest The 0.5 mg Maintenance Dose Would Be Efficacious In Humans Against RR-MS. ....	33
	2. A POSA Would Have Understood Kataoka To Suggest The 0.5 mg Maintenance Dose Would Have Substantially Similar Efficacy In Humans Against RR-MS As The 1.25 mg Dose. ...	36
	3. A POSA Would Have Understood The Prior Art Phase II Clinical Trial Publications To Suggest the 0.5 mg Maintenance Dose Would Have Therapeutic Efficacy In Humans Against	

RR-MS. ....	42
C. Iterative Clinical Trials Do Not Undermine The Rationale For Using A 0.5 mg Dose.....	47
VII. SUBSTANTIALLY EQUIVALENT CLINICAL EFFICACY OF 0.5 MG AS COMPARED TO 1.25 MG WAS NOT UNEXPECTED.....	49
A. Intermittent Dosing And Angiogenesis Measurement Are Not Part Of The '405 Patent Claims. ....	51
B. Dr. Steinman's 60% Reduction Of The 1.25 mg Dose Is Premised On A False And Arbitrary Analysis.....	53
VIII. DRS. STEINMAN AND JUSKO DO NOT APPLY THE BROADEST REASONABLE CONSTRUCTION OF DAILY DOSAGE.....	55
IX. CONCLUSION .....	59
X. CONCLUDING STATEMENTS.....	60

I, Leslie Z. Benet, declare as follows:

**I. QUALIFICATIONS**

1. I am currently a Professor of Bioengineering and Therapeutic Sciences, Schools of Pharmacy and Medicine, at the University of California, San Francisco (“UCSF”).

2. I received my Bachelor of Arts in English in 1959 and my Bachelors of Science in Pharmacy in 1960 from the University of Michigan. In 1962, I received a Master’s Degree in Pharmaceutical Chemistry, also from the University of Michigan. Three years later, in 1965, I was awarded a doctorate degree from UCSF in Pharmaceutical Chemistry. Since obtaining that degree, I have received nine honorary doctorate degrees, five from European universities and four from US institutions, the last in June, 2016 from the University of Lisbon. I held a licentiate in Pharmacy and am a credentialed Applied Pharmacologists with the American Board of Clinical Pharmacology.

3. In 1965, I joined the faculty of the School of Pharmacy at Washington State University, in Pullman, Washington. In 1969, I joined the Departments of Pharmacy and Pharmaceutical Chemistry within the School of Pharmacy at UCSF as an Assistant Professor. From 1969 to 1976, I progressed first from Assistant Professor to Associate Professor, and then to Professor. I served as chairman of the department at UCSF from 1978-1998.

4. My areas of specialization over the course of my career include pharmacokinetics/pharmacodynamics, biopharmaceutics, drug delivery and dosage forms, drug metabolism, drug transporters, bioequivalence, animal and human drug pharmacology and other scientific aspects of drug regulatory issues.

5. In addition to my teaching responsibilities, I have held leadership positions in a number of organizations in my field of study, including:

- a. From 1985 to 1986, I served as President of the Academy of Pharmaceutical Research and Science (formerly the Academy of Pharmaceutical Sciences).
- b. In 1986, I founded and served as the first President of the American Association of Pharmaceutical Scientists (AAPS). From 1986 to 1993, I variously held the positions of Treasurer, Member, and Chair of the Board of Directors of AAPS.
- c. From 1988 to 2004, I served as a Specialist Member, Chairman, Past Chair and Member of the Executive Committee of the Board of Pharmaceutical Sciences for the International Pharmaceutical Federation (FIP). From 2007 through 2012, I served as Chair of the FIP Foundation for Education and Research.

# Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

## Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

## Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

## Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

## API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

## LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

## FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

## E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.