

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

BEFORE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

APOTEX INC., APOTEX CORP., and,
ARGENTUM PHARMACEUTICALS LLC

Petitioners,

v.

NOVARTIS AG.,

Patent Owner.

Case IPR2017-00854

Patent 9,187,405 B2

Teleconference

January 24, 2017

1:02 p.m.

Transcript of Proceedings

**Apotex v. Novartis
IPR2017-00854
NOVARTIS 2087**

1 A P P E A R A N C E S:

2 Presiding:

3 The Honorable ROBERT A. POLLOCK,
4 Administrative Patent Judge

5 Attorneys for Petitioner Apotex:

6 STEVEN W. PARMELEE, ESQ.

7 JAD MILLS, ESQ.

8 Wilson Sonsini Goodrich & Rosati
9 701 Fifth Avenue, Suite 5100
10 Seattle, WA 98104-7036

11 E-mail: sparmellee@wsgr.com
12 jmills@wsgr.com

13 Attorneys for Patent Owner Novartis AG:

14 JANE M. LOVE, PhD

15 ROBERT TRENCHARD, ESQ.

16 Gibson, Dunn & Crutcher, LLP

17 200 Park Avenue
18 New York, New York 10166-0193

19 E-mail: jlove@gibsondunn.com
20 rtrenchard@gibsondunn.com

21 Attorneys for Petitioner Argentum
22 Pharmaceuticals:

23 DEBRA YELLIN, ESQ.

24 SHANNON M. LENTZ, ESQ.

25 Crowell & Moring LLP

1001 Pennsylvania Avenue NW
Washington, D.C. 20004-2595

E-mail: dyellin@crowell.com
Slentz@crowell.com

20
21
22
23
24
25

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

A P P E A R A N C E S: (Continued)

Attorneys for Petitioner Sun
Pharmaceutical:

SAMUEL PARK, ESQ.
Winston & Strawn LLP
Metlife Building
200 Park Avenue
New York, New York 10166
E-mail: spark@winston.com

Attorneys for Petitioner Teva Actavis

AMANDA HOLLIS, ESQ.
Kirkland & Ellis LLP
300 North LaSalle
Chicago, IL 60654
E-mail: Amanda.hollis@kirkland.com

ALSO PRESENT:

JUDGE LORA M. GREEN
JUDGE CHRISTOPHER N. KAISER
* * *

1

2

HON. POLLOCK: Good afternoon,
ladies and gentlemen. This call is in
relation to IPR2017-00854. This is
Judge Pollock. I have with me Judges
Green and Kaiser. I would like to
start with a role call. Who do I have
for Petitioner Apotex?

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

MR. PARMELEE: Good afternoon,
Your Honor. This is Steve Parmelee
and Jad Mills for Petitioner Apotex.

12

13

HON. POLLOCK: Good afternoon.
Petitioner Argentum?

14

15

16

MS. LENTZ: Yes, good afternoon,
Your Honor. This is Shannon Lentz and
Debra Yellin.

17

18

HON. POLLOCK: Petitioner Teva
Actavis.

19

20

21

MS. HOLLIS: Good afternoon.
This is Amenda Hollis from Kirkland &
Ellis for those Petitioners.

22

23

HON. POLLOCK: And Petitioner
Sun Pharma.

24

25

MR. PARK: This is Sam Park from
Winston & Strawn for Sun Pharm.

1

HON. POLLOCK: And who is on the
line for Patent Owner Novartis?

2

3

4

MR. TRENTCHARD: Good afternoon,
Your Honor. This is Robert Trenchard
and Jane Love from Gibson Dunn &
Crutcher. And for Your Honor's
information, we do have a court
reporter. Her name is Lisa. She is
on the line.

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

HON. POLLACK: Excellent. And
Patent Owner Novartis, you engaged the
court reporter today?

12

13

14

MR. TRENCHARD: We did, Your
Honor, and we will file the transcript
as soon as we get it.

15

16

17

HON. POLLOCK: All right. If
you would file that as an exhibit when
it is available. But in addition, if
you have access to a rough draft of
the transcript, kindly forward a
courtesy copy to us via the trial's
e-mail as soon as possible.

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

MR. TRENCHARD: Absolutely, Your
Honor.

25

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.