

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
EASTERN DISTRICT OF MICHIGAN
SOUTHERN DIVISION

EVERLIGHT ELECTRONICS CO.,
LTD, and EMCORE CORPORATION,

Plaintiffs,

No. 12-cv-11758

v

NICHIA CORPORATION, and
NICHIA AMERICA CORPORATION,

Defendants.

_____ /

JURY TRIAL - VOLUME XII OF XII

PROCEEDINGS BEFORE THE HONORABLE GERSHWIN A. DRAIN
UNITED STATES DISTRICT JUDGE
Theodore Levin United States Courthouse
231 West Lafayette Boulevard
Detroit, Michigan
Wednesday, April 22, 2015

APPEARANCES:

For the Plaintiffs:

MR. A. MICHAEL PALIZZI
MR. MICHAEL C. SIMONI
Miller, Canfield, Paddock and
Stone, PLC
150 W. Jefferson Avenue, Suite 2500
Detroit, Michigan 48226
(313) 486-7645

MR. RAYMOND N. NIMROD
MR. MATTHEW A. TRAUPTMAN
Quinn Emanuel Urquhart & Sullivan,
LLP
51 Madison Avenue, 29th Floor
New York, New York 10010
(212) 849-7412

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

APPEARANCES:

For the Defendants:

MR. STEVEN J. RIZZI
MR. RAMY E. HANNA
MR. RYAN SCHMID
Foley and Lardner, LLP
90 Park Avenue, 37th Floor
New York, New York 10016
(212) 682-7474

MS. LISA S. MANKOFSKY
MR. MICHAEL KAMINSKI
MS. DEBRA LANGE
Foley & Lardner, LLP
3000 K Street N. W, Suite 600
Washington, DC 20007
(202) 672-5300

Reported by:

Merilyn J. Jones, RPR, CSR
Official Federal Court Reporter
merilyn_jones@mied.uscourts.gov

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

TABLE OF CONTENTS

WITNESSES: PLAINTIFF

PAGE

None

WITNESSES: DEFENDANT

None

OTHER MATERIAL IN TRANSCRIPT:

Jury Verdict

5

EXHIBITS:

Identified

Received

None

1 Detroit, Michigan

2 Wednesday, April 22, 2015 - 4:00 p.m.

3 THE CLERK: All rise. The United States District
4 Court for the Eastern District of Michigan is now in session.
5 Honorable Gershwin A. Drain presiding.

6 Calling Civil Action, Everlight Electronics
7 Company versus Nichia Corporation. Number 12-11758.

8 You may be seated. Please put your appearance on
9 the record.

10 MR. NIMROD: Good afternoon, your Honor.

11 THE COURT: Good afternoon.

12 MR. NIMROD: Ray Nimrod from Quinn Emanuel for
13 Everlight. With me is Matt Traupman, Mike Simoni and Mike
14 Palizzi.

15 MR. RIZZI: Good afternoon, your Honor. Steven
16 Rizzi, Foley and Lardner, for Nichia. With me is Lisa
17 Mankofsky, Debra Lange, Tamy Hanna, Ryan Schmid and Mike
18 Kaminski, and the corporate representative, Mr. Hironori
19 Takagi, is here.

20 THE COURT: Like I mentioned, the jury wrote a
21 note saying a verdict has been reached, so I'm going to have
22 them come in and deliver it.

23 And I'll poll them also.

24 THE CLERK: All rise.

25 (At 4:01 p.m. jury present)

1 THE CLERK: You may be seated.

2 THE COURT: All right, Mr. -- is it "Mong"?

3 JUROR MONG: "Mong", yes.

4 THE COURT: -- Mong. Okay, we've had a little
5 back and forth, you've asked some questions and asked for
6 items; we've tried to answer those as best we could. And the
7 last note that I got says that you have reached a verdict; is
8 that correct?

9 JUROR MONG: That's correct, yes.

10 THE COURT: Can you take the verdict form out and
11 read your answers to us?

12 JUROR MONG: Sure.

13 Just the answers?

14 THE COURT: Well, no, let's read the questions,
15 too.

16 JUROR MONG: Number One: Has Everlight proven by
17 clear and convincing evidence that Claims 2 and 3 of the '925
18 patent are invalid due to anticipation?

19 We find on claim, with regard to Claim 2 the
20 answer would be, "No".

21 And with Claim 3 the answer is, "No".

22 THE COURT: All right.

23 JUROR MONG: Number Two: Has Everlight proven by
24 clear and convincing evidence that Claims 2, 3 and 5 of the
25 '925 patent are invalid due to obviousness?

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.