

IN THE UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

United States Patent No.: 8,309,375	§ Attorney Docket No.: 1285100-0002
Inventors: Yoshinori Shimizu, et al.	§ Petitioner: VIZIO, Inc.
Formerly Application No.: 12/942,792	§
Issue Date: Nov. 13, 2012	§
Filing Date: Nov. 9, 2010	§
Former Group Art Unit: 2812	§
Former Examiner: A. Mustapha	§

For: LIGHT EMITTING DEVICE AND DISPLAY

MAIL STOP PATENT BOARD
Patent Trial and Appeal Board
United States Patent and Trademark Office
Post Office Box 1450
Alexandria, Virginia 22313-1450

**DECLARATION OF DR. PAUL R. PRUCNAL
IN SUPPORT OF PETITION FOR *INTER PARTES* REVIEW OF
UNITED STATES PATENT NO. 8,309,375**

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	Page
I. INTRODUCTION	1
II. BACKGROUND AND QUALIFICATIONS	2
III. PRIORITY DATE AND ONE OF ORDINARY SKILL	10
IV. MATERIALS RELIED UPON	11
V. BACKGROUND ON THE STATE OF THE ART	11
A. Color, Chromaticity, and CIE Chromaticity Curve	11
B. Development of White Light LEDs	19
C. Cerium-Activated Yttrium Aluminum Garnet (YAG) Phosphor	21
VI. ANALYSIS OF THE '375 PATENT	24
A. Overview of the '375 Patent.....	24
B. Overview of the '375 Patent Prosecution History	29
C. Claim Construction of the '375 Patent Claims	30
VII. OVERVIEW OF THE PRIOR ART REFERENCES	31
A. Overview of U.S. Patent No. 6,600,175 (“Baretz”).....	31
B. Overview of U.S. Patent No. 3,699,478 (“Pinnow”)	37
C. Overview of S. Nakamura et al., “High-Power InGaN Single-Quantum-Well-Structure Blue And Violet Light-Emitting Diodes” (“Nakamura”)	38
D. Overview of U.S. Patent 4,024,070 (“Schuil”)	40
VIII. THE CHALLENGED CLAIMS ARE INVALID.....	42
A. Legal Standards	42
B. Claims 1 and 4 are Obvious by Baretz in view of Pinnow	46

1. Claim 1	47
a. Preamble: “A <i>method for manufacturing a light emitting device comprising:</i> ”	47
b. Element [1.A.1]: “ <i>preparing a light emitting component having an active layer of a semiconductor</i> ”	48
c. Element [1.A.2]: “ <i>said active layer comprising a gallium nitride based semiconductor containing indium and being capable of emitting a blue color light having a spectrum with a peak wavelength within the range from 420 to 490 nm;</i> ”	52
d. Element [1.B.1]: “ <i>preparing a phosphor capable of absorbing a part of the blue color light emitted from said light emitting component and emitting a yellow color light having a broad emission spectrum comprising a peak wavelength existing around the range from 510 to 600 nm and a tail continuing beyond 700 nm</i> ”	53
e. Element [1.B.2]: “ <i>wherein selection of said phosphor is controlled based on an emission wavelength of said light emitting component; and</i> ”	74
f. Element [1.C.1]: “ <i>combining said light emitting component and said phosphor so that the blue color light from said light emitting component and the yellow color light from said phosphor are mixed to make a white color light</i> ”	75
g. Element [1.C.2]: “ <i>wherein a chromaticity point of the white color light is on a straight line connecting a point of chromaticity of the blue color light and a point of chromaticity of the yellow color light, and</i> ”	84
h. Element [1.D]: “ <i>wherein a content of said phosphor in said light emitting device is selected to obtain a desired chromaticity of the white color light</i> ”	92
i. Baretz in view of Pinnow discloses “preparing” a light emitting component and phosphor.....	93

2.	Claim 4	99
C.	Claims 1 and 4 are Obvious by Baretz in view of Pinnow, and further in view of Nakamura and Schuil	100
1.	Claim 1	100
a.	Preamble: “ <i>A method for manufacturing a light emitting device comprising:</i> ”	100
b.	Element [1.A.1]: “ <i>preparing a light emitting component having an active layer of a semiconductor</i> ”	101
c.	Element [1.A.2]: “ <i>said active layer comprising a gallium nitride based semiconductor containing indium and being capable of emitting a blue color light having a spectrum with a peak wavelength within the range from 420 to 490 nm;</i> ”	103
d.	Element [1.B.1]: “ <i>preparing a phosphor capable of absorbing a part of the blue color light emitted from said light emitting component and emitting a yellow color light having a broad emission spectrum comprising a peak wavelength existing around the range from 510 to 600 nm and a tail continuing beyond 700 nm</i> ”	104
e.	Element [1.B.2]: “ <i>wherein selection of said phosphor is controlled based on an emission wavelength of said light emitting component; and</i> ”	106
f.	Element [1.C.1]: “ <i>combining said light emitting component and said phosphor so that the blue color light from said light emitting component and the yellow color light from said phosphor are mixed to make a white color light</i> ”	106
g.	Element [1.C.2]: “ <i>wherein a chromaticity point of the white color light is on a straight line connecting a point of chromaticity of the blue color light and a point of chromaticity of the yellow color light, and</i> ”	107

h. Element [1.D]: “ <i>wherein a content of said phosphor in said light emitting device is selected to obtain a desired chromaticity of the white color light</i> ”	107
i. Reasons to combine Baretz, Pinnow, Nakamura, and Schuil 107	
2. Claim 4	112
IX. CONCLUSION.....	112

APPENDIX A (Curriculum Vitae)

APPENDIX B (List of Materials Considered)

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.