

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

LG ELECTRONICS, INC. AND ZTE (USA) INC.,
Petitioners,

v.

PAPST LICENSING GMBH & CO., KG,
Patent Owner.

Case IPR2017-00443
United States Patent No. 6,470,399

**PATENT OWNER PAPST LICENSING GMBH & CO., KG'S RESPONSE
UNDER 37 C.F.R. § 42.120**

TABLE OF CONTENTS

I.	STATEMENT OF MATERIAL FACTS IN DISPUTE.....	1
II.	INTRODUCTION.....	1
	A. STATEMENT OF RELIEF REQUESTED	1
	B. OVERVIEW OF THE ‘399 PATENT	2
	C. LEVEL OF ORDINARY SKILL IN THE ART	5
	D. CLAIM CONSTRUCTION.....	7
	E. SUMMARY OF PATENT OWNER’S ARGUMENTS	9
III.	PATENT OWNER’S RESPONSE TO PETITIONERS’ GROUNDS OF REJECTION.....	11
	A. MURATA, SCHMIDT, LIN, BERETTA AND THE MICROSOFT PRESS COMPUTER DICTIONARY DO NOT RENDER CLAIMS 1-8, 10-11 AND 13-15 OBVIOUS	11
	1. OVERVIEW OF MURATA	11
	2. OVERVIEW OF SCHMIDT	13
	3. OVERVIEW OF LIN.....	13
	4. MURATA, SCHMIDT, LIN, BERETTA AND THE MICROSOFT PRESS COMPUTER DICTIONARY DO NOT DISCLOSE THE “WHEREIN THE FIRST COMMAND INTERPRETER IS CONFIGURED IN SUCH A WAY THAT THE COMMAND INTERPRETER, WHEN RECEIVING AN INQUIRY FROM THE HOST DEVICE AS TO A TYPE OF A DEVICE ATTACHED TO THE MULTI-PURPOSE INTERFACE OF THE HOST DEVICE, SENDS A SIGNAL,	

REGARDLESS OF THE TYPE OF THE DATA TRANSMIT/RECEIVE DEVICE ATTACHED TO THE SECOND CONNECTING DEVICE OF THE INTERFACE DEVICE, TO THE HOST DEVICE WHICH SIGNALS TO THE HOST DEVICE THAT IT IS AN INPUT/OUTPUT DEVICE CUSTOMARY IN A HOST DEVICE” LIMITATION OF INDEPENDENT CLAIM 1 OR THE CORRESPONDING LIMITATIONS OF INDEPENDENT CLAIMS 11 AND 14 OF THE ‘399 PATENT.....14

5. MURATA, SCHMIDT, LIN, BERETTA AND THE MICROSOFT PRESS COMPUTER DICTIONARY DO NOT DISCLOSE THE “WHEREIN THE DRIVERS FOR INPUT/OUTPUT [DEVICES] CUSTOMARY IN A HOST DEVICE COMPRISE A HARD DISK DRIVER, AND THE SIGNAL INDICATES TO THE HOST DEVICE THAT THE HOST DEVICE IS COMMUNICATING WITH A HARD DISK” LIMITATION OF DEPENDENT CLAIM 2 OF THE ‘399 PATENT22

6. MURATA, SCHMIDT, LIN, BERETTA AND THE MICROSOFT PRESS COMPUTER DICTIONARY DO NOT RENDER OBVIOUS DEPENDENT CLAIMS 2-8, 10, 13 AND 15 OF THE ‘399 PATENT.....23

B. MURATA AND SCHMIDT WOULD NOT BE COMBINED BY ONE SKILLED IN THE ART24

C. *INTER PARTES* REVIEW IS UNCONSTITUTIONAL28

IV. CONCLUSION28

EXHIBIT LIST

Currently and Previously Filed – Patent Owner

Ex. No.	Description
2001	Defendants' Responsive Claim Construction Brief in <i>Papst Licensing GmbH & Co., KG v. Apple, Inc.</i> (6:15-CV-01095-RWS)
2002	<i>In re Papst Licensing Digital Camera Patent Litigation</i> , 778 F.3d 1255 (Fed. Cir. 2015)
2003	Definition of charge-coupled device, <i>Dictionary of Engineering</i> (2015)
2004	<i>Markman</i> Order in <i>Papst Licensing GmbH & Co., KG v. Apple Inc.</i> (6:15-CV-01095-RWS)
2005	Confidential Settlement Agreement Between Huawei Device Co., Ltd. and Papst Licensing GmbH & Co., KG
2006	Declaration of Thomas A. Gafford in Support of Patent Owner Response ("Gafford Declaration")
2007	mkdev Command Definition from IBM Knowledge Center (https://www.ibm.com/support/knowledgecenter/en/ssw_aix_61/com.ibm.aix.cmds3/mkdev.htm)
2008	August 24, 2006 Preliminary Amendment for U.S. Application No. 11/467,092 resulting in '437 Patent
2009	July 17, 2007 Preliminary Amendment for U.S. Application No. 11/467,092 resulting in '437 Patent
2010	January 2, 2008 Preliminary Amendment for U.S. Application No. 11/467,092 resulting in '437 Patent

Previously Filed – Petitioners

Ex. No.	Description
1001	U.S. Patent No. 6,470,399 to Tasler
1002	File History for U.S. Patent No. 6,470,399
1003	Declaration of Kevin C. Almeroth
1004	Curriculum Vitae of Kevin C. Almeroth
1005	U.S. Patent No. 5,508,821 to Murata

1006	Friedhelm Schmidt, <i>The SCSI Bus and IDE Interface</i> (1995)
1007	<i>The Microsoft Press Computer Dictionary</i> (2 nd ed. 1994)
1008	U.S. Patent No. 6,522,432 to Lin
1009	Papst's Opening Claim Constr. Brief and Appendix 8 of Papst's Opening Claim Constr. Brief, <i>Papst Licensing GmbH & Co., KG v. Apple, Inc., et al.</i> , No. 6:15-cv-01095-RWS (E.D. Tex. Nov. 22, 2016)
1010	Papst's Opening Claim Constr. Brief and Decl. of Robert Zeidman, <i>In Re Papst Licensing Dig. Camera Pat. Litig.</i> , MDL No. 1880, 1:07-mc-00493, (D.D.C. June 3, 2016)
1011	Am. Nat'l Standards Inst., Inc., <i>Am. Nat'l Standard for Info. Sys's Small Computer System Interface-2</i> , ANSI X3.131-1994 (1994) ("SCSI Specification")
1012	<i>In re Papst Licensing Dig. Camera Pat. Litig.</i> , 778 F.3d 1255, 1265 (Fed. Cir. 2015)
1013	<i>The Microsoft Press Computer Dictionary</i> (2 nd ed. 1994)
1014	U.S. Patent No. 5,850,484 to Berretta <i>et al.</i>
1015	<i>Intentionally Left Blank</i>
1016	File History for U.S. Patent Application No. 08/411,369
1017	Comparison of excerpts of File History for U.S. Patent Application No. 08/411,369 (Exhibit 1016) and U.S. Patent No. 5,850,484 to Beretta <i>et al.</i> (Ex. 1014)
1018	U.S. Patent No. 4,589,063 to Shah <i>et al.</i>
1019	U.S. Patent No. 5,038,320 to Heath <i>et al.</i>
1020	U.S. Patent No. 5,787,246 to Lichtman <i>et al.</i>
1021	<i>Intentionally Left Blank</i>
1022	Papst's Brief, <i>In re Papst Licensing Dig. Camera Pat. Litig.</i> , No 2014-1110 (Fed. Cir. February 20, 2014)
1023	Rufus P. Turner <i>et al.</i> , <i>The Illustrated Dictionary of Electronics</i> (1991)

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.