

By: Christopher Frerking ([chris@ntknet.com](mailto:chris@ntknet.com))  
Reg. No. 42,557

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

---

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

---

MICRON TECHNOLOGY, INC., INTEL CORPORATION  
AND GLOBALFOUNDRIES U.S., INC.

Petitioners

v.

DANIEL L. FLAMM,

Patent Owner

CASE IPR2017-0406  
U.S. Patent No. 5,711,849

**PATENT OWNER'S PRELIMINARY RESPONSE  
UNDER 37 C.F.R. § 42.107**

Mail Stop: PATENT BOARD  
Patent Trial and Appeal Board  
U.S. Patent & Trademark Office  
P.O. Box 1450  
Alexandria, VA 22313-1450

**TABLE OF CONTENTS**

	<u>Page(s)</u>
TABLE OF CONTENTS.....	i
TABLE OF AUTHORITIES .....	ii
EXHIBIT LIST .....	iii
I. Introduction .....	1
II. Overview of the ‘849 Patent.....	1
III. Alkire and Galewski Teach Away from Each Other and Teach Away from the ‘849 Patent.....	3
IV. Alkire and Galewski, Alone or In Combination, Fail to Teach Elements of the ‘849 Patent.....	7
A. Claim Element [1.2] .....	7
B. Claim Element [1.3] .....	8
C. Claim 10 .....	11
D. Claim 20 .....	12
E. Claim 22 .....	13
F. Claim 26 .....	14
V. Dependent Claims .....	15
VI. Conclusion.....	16

**TABLE OF AUTHORITIES**

<b><u>Cases</u></b>	<b><u>Page(s)</u></b>
<i>Hartness Int’l Inc. v. Simplimatic Eng. Co.</i> , 819 F.2d 1100 (Fed. Cir. 1987).....	16
<i>Kimberly Clark Corp. v. Johnson &amp; Johnson</i> , 745 F.2d 1437 (Fed. Cir. 1984).....	16
<b><u>Statutes</u></b>	<b><u>Page(s)</u></b>
37 C.F.R. § 42.107 .....	1
MPEP § 2143.03 .....	16

**EXHIBIT LIST**

Ex. 2001	VLSI Technology (S.M. Sze ed., 1983) (excerpts)
----------	-------------------------------------------------

Daniel L. Flamm, Sc.D., the co-inventor and sole owner of the U.S. Patent No. 5,711,849 (“the ‘849 patent”), through his counsel, submits this preliminary response pursuant to 37 C.F.R. § 42.107 and asks that the Patent Trial and Appeals Board decline to institute *inter partes* review on the instant petition because the petition fails to show a reasonable likelihood that any challenged claim is unpatentable.

## **I. Introduction**

This Petition relies primarily on a combination of papers written by Alkire and Galewski. Alkire relates specifically to a “mathematical model” formulated to analyze transient behavior during film removal for closely spaced wafers in a barrel plasma etching reactor. Alkire, however, even by the admission of Petitioners, lacks the basic elements of Dr. Flamm’s invention. To overcome the shortcomings of Alkire, Petitioners introduce Galewski. Galewski relates to modeling a hot wall silicon epitaxial reactor, which is in a completely different area of technology from either Alkire or the ‘849 patent. That said, Alkire and Galewski, even if combined, lack the basic elements of the ‘849 patent. In fact, those references teach away from each other and, more particularly, from the ‘849 patent.

## **II. Overview of the ‘849 Patent**

The Background of the Invention in the ‘849 patent states the problems Dr.

# Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

## Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

## Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

## Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

## API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

## LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

## FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

## E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.