

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

---

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

---

APPLE INC.  
Petitioner

v.

VALENCELL, INC.  
Patent Owner

---

Case IPR2017-00319  
U.S. Patent No. 8,923,941

---

**PETITIONER APPLE INC.'S  
REPLY TO PATENT OWNER RESPONSE**

***Mail Stop "PATENT BOARD"***  
Patent Trial and Appeal Board  
U.S. Patent and Trademark Office  
P.O. Box 1450  
Alexandria, VA 22313-1450

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

I.	Introduction.....	1
II.	Claim 1 of the '941 Patent.....	1
III.	As shown by the Petition, the combination of Luo and Crow renders claim 1 obvious.....	2
	A. Luo and Crow are analogous art.....	2
	B. The combination of Luo and Crow suggests that respiration rate can be extracted. ....	5
	C. As shown in the Petition, the combination of Luo and Crow suggests limitations [1.4] and [1.5], and a POSA would have been motivated to combine Luo and Crow to render claim 1 obvious. ....	11
	D. A POSA would have been motivated to combine Luo and Crow because they are directed to similar physiological monitoring devices. ....	14
IV.	Mault and Al-Ali render claim 1 obvious.....	16
	A. Mault and Al-Ali are analogous art.....	16
	B. Mault discloses a single monitoring device capable of sensing both heart rate and respiration rate data. ....	16
	C. Claim 1 does not require a PPG sensor capable of having its signals processed to produce a serial data output from which respiration rate can be extracted.....	17
	D. The combination of Mault and Al-Ali suggests processing signals from the at least one motion sensor and signals from the at least one PPG sensor into a serial data output of physiological information and motion-related information. ....	18
	E. A POSA would have had a reason to combine Mault with Al-Ali. ....	19
V.	PO waived arguments specific to the dependent claims. ....	21
VI.	PO's contention of unconstitutionality is not a proper request for relief. ....	21
VII.	Conclusion .....	22

**PETITIONER'S UPDATED EXHIBIT LIST**

<b>Exhibit No.</b>	<b>Description</b>
<b>1001</b>	U.S. Patent No. 8,923,941 to LeBoeuf <i>et al.</i> , issued December 30, 2014
<b>1002</b>	U.S. Patent No. 8,923,941 File History
<b>1003</b>	Declaration of Dr. Majid Sarrafzadeh
<b>1004</b>	<i>Curriculum Vitae</i> of Dr. Majid Sarrafzadeh
<b>1005</b>	<i>Valencell, Inc. v. Apple Inc.</i> , Case No. 5-16-cv-00010 (E.D.N.C), Complaint filed January 4, 2016
<b>1006</b>	U.S. Patent Application Publication No. 2005/0209516 to Fraden, published September 22, 2005
<b>1007</b>	<i>Intentionally left blank</i>
<b>1008</b>	U.S. Patent Application Publication No. 2008/0081972 to Debreczeny, published April 3, 2008
<b>1009</b>	Japanese Patent Application Publication No. 2005/040261 A to Numaga <i>et al.</i> , published February 17, 2005
<b>1010</b>	Certified English-language translation of Japanese Patent Application Publication No. 2005/040261 A to Numaga <i>et al.</i> , published February 17, 2005
<b>1011</b>	U.S. Patent Application Publication No. 2003/0065269 to Vetter <i>et al.</i> , published April 3, 2003
<b>1012 -1015</b>	<i>Intentionally left blank</i>
<b>1016</b>	U.S. Patent Application Publication No. 2009/0105556 to Fricke <i>et al.</i> , published April 23, 2009
<b>1017</b>	<i>Intentionally left blank</i>
<b>1018</b>	U.S. Patent No. 3,704,706 to Herczfeld <i>et al.</i> , issued December 5, 1972
<b>1019</b>	U.S. Patent No. 5,297,548 to Pologe, issued March 29, 1994
<b>1020</b>	Med. Sci. Series, Int'l Fed'n for Med. and Biological Eng'g and the Int'l Org. for Med. Physics, Design of Pulse Oximeters (J.G. Webster ed., Inst. of Physics Publ'g 1997)
<b>1021</b>	John Allen, <i>Photoplethysmography and its application in clinical physiological measurement</i> , Physiological Measurement 28 (2007)
<b>1022</b>	U.S. Patent Application Publication No. 2008/0132798 to Hong <i>et al.</i> , published June 5, 2008
<b>1023</b>	U.S. Patent Application Publication No. 2008/0177162 to Bae <i>et al.</i> , published July 24, 2008

<b>Exhibit No.</b>	<b>Description</b>
<b>1024</b>	U.S. Patent No. 5,807,267 to Bryars <i>et al.</i> issued September 15, 1998
<b>1025</b>	Hyonyoung Han et al., <i>Development of a wearable health monitoring device with motion artifact reduced algorithm</i> , International Conference on Control, Automation and Systems, IEEE (2007)
<b>1026</b>	<i>Intentionally left blank</i>
<b>1027</b>	U.S. Patent Application Publication No. 2004/0186387 to Kosuda <i>et al.</i> , published September 23, 2004
<b>1028</b>	U.S. Patent Application No. 2009/0287067 to Dorogusker <i>et al.</i> , published November 19, 2009
<b>1029 - 1030</b>	<i>Intentionally left blank</i>
<b>1031</b>	U.S. Patent Application No. 2005/059870 to Aceti, published March 17, 2005
<b>1032</b>	G. Comtois & Y. Mendelson, <i>A Comparative Evaluation of Adaptive Noise Cancellation Algorithms for Minimizing Motion Artifacts in a Forehead-Mounted Wearable Pulse Oximeter</i> , IEEE (2007)
<b>1033</b>	Declaration of Gerard P. Grenier in support of G. Comtois & Y. Mendelson, <i>A Comparative Evaluation of Adaptive Noise Cancellation Algorithms for Minimizing Motion Artifacts in a Forehead-Mounted Wearable Pulse Oximeter</i> , IEEE (2007) (Ex. 1032)
<b>1034</b>	U.S. Patent Application Publication No. 2004/0059236 to Margulies <i>et al.</i> , published March 25, 2004
<b>1035</b>	U.S. Patent Application Publication No. 2007/0016086 to Inukai <i>et al.</i> , published January 18, 2007
<b>1036</b>	U.S. Patent Application Publication No. 2003/0236647 to Yoon <i>et al.</i> , published December 25, 2003
<b>1037</b>	International Patent Application Publication No. 2007/013054 to Schwartz, published February 1, 2007
<b>1038</b>	U.S. Patent No. 5,575,284 to Athan <i>et al.</i> , issued November 19, 1996
<b>1039</b>	U.S. Patent No. 5,503,016 to Koen, issued April 2, 1996
<b>1040</b>	<i>Intentionally left blank</i>
<b>1041</b>	U.S. Patent Application Publication No. 2007/0027367 to Oliver <i>et al.</i> , published February 1, 2007
<b>1042</b>	U.S. Patent Application Publication No. 2007/0197881 to Wolf <i>et al.</i> , published August 23, 2007
<b>1043</b>	U.S. Patent Application Publication No. 2005/0075542 to Goldreich, published April 7, 2005

<b>Exhibit No.</b>	<b>Description</b>
<b>1044</b>	International Patent Application Publication No. WO2007/004089 to Moroney <i>et al.</i> , published January 11, 2007
<b>1045</b>	G. Sen Gupta <i>et al.</i> , <i>Design of a Low-cost Physiological Parameter Measurement and Monitoring Device</i> , Instrumentation and Measurement Technology Conference, IEEE (2007)
<b>1046</b>	U.S. Patent Application Publication No. 2006/0084879 to Nazarian <i>et al.</i> , published April 20, 2006
<b>1047</b>	U.S. Patent No. 5,243,992 to Eckerle <i>et al.</i> , issued September 14, 1993
<b>1048</b>	U.S. Patent No. 4,955,379 to Hall, issued September 11, 1990
<b>1049</b>	International Patent Application Publication No. WO 2007/122375 to Crowe <i>et al.</i> , published November 1, 2007
<b>1050</b>	<i>Intentionally left blank</i>
<b>1051</b>	<i>Intentionally left blank</i>
<b>1052</b>	Declaration of Gerard P. Grenier in support of G. Sen Gupta <i>et al.</i> , <i>Design of a Low-cost Physiological Parameter Measurement and Monitoring Device</i> , Instrumentation and Measurement Technology Conference, IEEE (2007) (Ex. 1045) and Hyonyoung Han <i>et al.</i> , <i>Development of a wearable health monitoring device with motion artifact reduced algorithm</i> , International Conference on Control, Automation and Systems, IEEE (2007) (Ex. 1025)
<b>1053</b>	<i>Intentionally left blank</i>
<b>1054</b>	<i>Intentionally left blank</i>
<b>1055</b>	U.S. Patent Application Publication No. 2008/0200774 to Luo, published August 21, 2008
<b>1056</b>	U.S. Patent Application Publication No. 2008/0133699 to Craw <i>et al.</i> , published June 5, 2008
<b>1057</b>	U.S. Patent No. 6,513,532 to Mault <i>et al.</i> , issued February 4, 2003
<b>1058</b>	U.S. Patent Application Publication No. 2003/0181798 to Al-Ali, published September 25, 2003
<b>1059</b>	R.G. Lee <i>et al.</i> "A Mobile Care System With Alert Mechanism" IEEE Transactions on Information Technology in Biomedicine, Vol. 11, Issue 5, September 2007
<b>1060</b>	Declaration of Gerard P. Grenier in support of R.G. Lee <i>et al.</i> "A Mobile Care System With Alert Mechanism" IEEE Transactions on Information Technology in Biomedicine, Vol. 11, Issue 5, September 2007 (Ex. 1059)

# Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

## Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

## Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

## Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

## API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

## LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

## FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

## E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.