

Filed on behalf of Valencell, Inc.

By: Justin B. Kimble (JKimble-IPR@bcpc-law.com)
Jeffrey R. Bragalone (jbragalone@bcpc-law.com)
T. William Kennedy, Jr. (bkennedy@bcpc-law.com)
Marcus Benavides (mbenavides@bcpc-law.com)
Bragalone Conroy PC
2200 Ross Ave.
Suite 4500 – West
Dallas, TX 75201
Tel: 214.785.6670
Fax: 214.786.6680

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

APPLE INC.,
Petitioner,

v.

VALENCELL, INC.,
Patent Owner.

Case IPR2017-00318
U.S. Patent No. 8,886,269

**PATENT OWNER RESPONSE PURSUANT TO
35 U.S.C. § 313 and 37 C.F.R. § 42.107**

Mail Stop PATENT BOARD
Patent Trial and Appeal Board
U.S. Patent & Trademark Office
P.O. Box 1450
Alexandria, Virginia 22313-1450

TABLE OF CONTENTS

I.	Introduction.....	6
II.	Overview of the '269 Patent	8
	A. Description of Embodiments	8
	B. Level of Ordinary Skill in the Art.....	15
	C. Exemplary Claim	16
III.	Summary of Certain Prior Art References Asserted	17
	A. Goodman.....	17
	B. Asada.....	19
IV.	Claim Construction	21
	A. “Cladding Material”	21
	B. “Light Guiding Interface”	25
	C. “Generally Cylindrical”	26
V.	Argument	27
	A. Ground 1: Asada - Single Reference Obviousness – Claims 1, 2, 6, and 7	27
	1. “the inner body portion comprising light transmissive material” ...	30
	2. “wherein the light transmissive material is in optical communication with the at least one optical emitter and the at least one optical detector and is configured to deliver light from the at least one optical emitter to one or more locations of the body of the subject via the at least one window and to collect light from one or more locations of the body of the subject via the at least one window and deliver the collected light to the at least one optical detector ”	35

3. Petitioner is Limited to the Embodiment of Figure 11 in Asada.....	37
B. Ground 2: Asada in view of Hicks - Claim 3	40
C. Ground 3: Asada in view of Hannula – Claims 4 and 5	44
1. Claim 4 - “a light reflective material on at least a portion of one or both of the inner and outer surfaces”.....	44
2. Claim 5 – Picking and Choosing from Asada’s Embodiments	46
D. Ground 4: Asada in view of Delonzor - Claim 8.....	48
E. Ground 5: Asada in view of Al-Ali - Claims 9 and 10.....	48
F. Ground 6: Goodman - Single Reference of Obviousness - Claims 1 and 2	49
1. Goodman Does Not Teach or Suggest a “window formed in the cladding material that serves as a light-guiding interface to the body of the subject”	49
G. Ground 7: Goodman in View of Hicks – Claim 3.....	53
H. Ground 8 - Goodman in View of Hannula – Claim 4	56
1. Considering Goodman and Hannula as a Whole, They Would not be Combined	57
2. Petitioner’s Premise for Combining Goodman and Hannula is Faulty	59
I. Ground 9: Goodman in View of Hannula and further in View of Asada – Claim 5	61
1. Considering Goodman, Hannula, and Asada as a Whole, a POSA Would not Combine Them	62
a) Goodman as a Whole compared to Asada as a Whole	62

b) Goodman as a Whole compared to Hannula as a Whole	64
2. Petitioner’s Premise for Combining Goodman and Asada Is Faulty	64
3. Petitioner’s Premise for Combining Goodman and Hannula is Faulty	66
4. Problems with Adding Components to Goodman	66
J. Ground 10: Goodman in view of Asada – Claims 6 and 7.....	69
K. Ground 11: Goodman in view of Delonzor – Claim 8	72
L. Ground 12: Goodman in view of Al-Ali – Claims 9 and 10	72
VI. The Arguments Apply across the Grounds.....	72
VII. Patent Owner Does Not Consent to the PTAB Adjudicating the Patentability or Validity of the ’269 Patent.....	73
VIII. Conclusion	73

TABLE OF EXHIBITS

Exhibit No.	Description
2001	S. LeBoeuf, et al., Earbud-Based Sensor for the Assessment of Energy Expenditure, HR, and VO2max, OFFICIAL J. AM. C. SPORTS M., 2014, 1046–1052
2002	Biometrics Lab: Performance of Leading Optical Heart Rate Monitors During Interval Exercise Conditions
2003	Valencell website (http://valencell.com/customers/)
2004	CTA - It Is Innovation (i3) Magazine 2016 Innovation-Entrepreneur Awards
2005	Declaration of T. William Kennedy (Aug. 3, 2017)
2006	Webster's Third New International Dictionary, Unabridged (2002) (excerpt)
2007	Declaration of Albert H. Titus in Support of Patent Owner's Response to Petition (Sep. 22, 2017)
2008	<i>Curriculum Vitae</i> of Albert H. Titus
2009	Deposition Transcript of Anthony (Sep. 13, 2017)
2010	Deposition Transcript of Anthony (Sep. 15, 2017)
2011	Mendelson, et al., Noninvasive Pulse Oximetry Utilizing Skin Reflectance Photoplethysmography, IEEE Transactions on Biomedical Engineering, Vol. 35, No. 10, October 1988
2012	Pujary, et al., Photodetector Size Considerations in the Design of a Noninvasive Reflectance Pulse Oximeter for Telemedicine Applications, IEEE, 2003
2013	New Oxford American Dictionary, 2d Ed. (2005) (excerpt)
2014	Declaration of T. William Kennedy (Sep. 22, 2017)

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.