

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE
BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

APPLE INC.,
Petitioner,
v.
VALENCELL, INC.,
Patent Owner

PTAB Proceeding No.

IPR2017-00315	Patent no. 8,929,965
IPR2017-00317	Patent no. 8,989,830
IPR2017-00318	Patent no. 8,886,269
IPR2017-00319	Patent no. 8,923,941
IPR2017-00321	Patent no. 8,923,941

CONFERENCE CALL

October 13, 2017

BEFORE:

BRIAN J. McNAMARA, Administrative Patent Judge
JAMES B. ARPIN, Administrative Patent Judge
SHEILA F. McSHANE, Administrative Patent Judge

DIGITAL EVIDENCE GROUP
1730 M Street, NW, Suite 812
Washington, D.C. 20036
(202) 232-0646

Apple 1022
Apple v. Valencell
IPR2017-00317

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22

APPLE v. VALENCELL

A P P E A R A N C E S:

STERNE, KESSLER, GOLDSTEIN & FOX, LLP

Attorneys for Petitioner

1100 New York Avenue

Washington, DC 20005

BY: MICHELLE K. HOLOUBEK, ESQ.

- and -

MICHAEL D. SPECHT, ESQ.

BRAGALONE CONROY PC

Attorneys for Patent Owner

Chase Tower

2200 Ross Avenue

Dallas, Texas 75201-7924

BY: JUSTIN KIMBLE, ESQ.

- and -

WILLIAM KENNEDY, ESQ.

1 APPLE v. VALENCELL

2 P R O C E E D I N G S

3 JUDGE McNAMARA: This is Judge

4 McNamara.

5 MS. HOLOUBEK: Good morning.

6 JUDGE McNAMARA: Judge McShane is

7 on the line and Judge Arpin is here with

8 me as well.

9 Can I have the parties, starting
10 with the Petitioner, tell me who's on the
11 line.

12 MS. HOLOUBEK: Good morning, Your
13 Honor.

14 This is Michelle Holoubek and Mike
15 Specht, Sterne Kessler for Petitioner,
16 Apple, and I wanted to let you know we
17 also have a court reporter on the line.

18 JUDGE McNAMARA: Okay, great I'm
19 glad to hear that.

20 And for the Patent Owner?

21 MR. KIMBLE: This is Justin

22 Kimble for the Patent Owner. In the

1 room with me is also Bill Kennedy and I
2 believe the Patent Owner may have a
3 APPLE v. VALENCELL
4 couple of other attorneys that have
5 dialed in from a separate location.

6 JUDGE McNAMARA: All right.

7 Well, the purpose of this call was
8 actually initiated by us, we wanted to
9 discuss the scheduling order and the
10 possibility of whether or not the Patent
11 Owner is going to want to provide a brief
12 and response -- sorry, the Petitioner is
13 going to want to provide a brief in
14 response to the Patent Owner reply, which
15 is not provided for in the scheduling
16 order right now.

17 As you probably are aware, the
18 Federal Circuit has issued its decision in
19 the Aqua Products case, Aqua Products
20 versus Matal.

21 In our original conference we had
22 told you that the burden of persuasion

1 with respect to the motion to amend was on
2 the Patent Owner.

3 We are now getting guidance by the
4 Federal Circuit that the burden of
5 persuasion, that we have to assess the

6 APPLE v. VALENCELL
7 burden of persuasion without -- we have to
8 assess the motion to amend without putting
9 the burden of persuasion on the Patent
10 Owner.

11 So the question is really directed
12 to the Petitioner.

13 Right now we have scheduled -- the
14 motion to amend has already been filed,
15 there is an opposition to the motion to
16 amend that is yet to be filed, there is a
17 reply to that opposition, but the question
18 to the Petitioner is whether or not you
19 want to incorporate into the schedule a
20 surreply to that -- to the reply?

21 MS. HOLOUBEK: Your Honor, this
22 is counsel for Petitioner.

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.