

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

APPLE INC.
Petitioner

v.

UNILOC LUXEMBOURG S.A.
Patent Owner

Cases IPR2017-00220 and IPR2017-00221
Patent 7,535,890

DECLARATION OF LEONARD J. FORYS, PH.D.

Mail Stop "PATENT BOARD"
Patent Trial and Appeal Board
U.S. Patent & Trademark Office
P.O. Box 1450
Alexandria, VA 22313-1450

TABLE OF CONTENTS

I.	Introduction.....	1
II.	Qualifications and Expertise.....	4
III.	Legal Understanding.....	12
	A. My Understanding of Claim Construction.....	12
	B. A Person of Ordinary Skill in the Art	12
	C. My Understanding of Obviousness	14
IV.	The '890 Patent.....	19
	A. Overview	19
	B. Claims.....	20
	1. Independent Claims	20
	2. Dependent Claims	22
	C. Prosecution History	23
V.	Claim Construction.....	24
	A. “External Network”	24
VI.	Background of the Technologies Disclosed in the '890 Patent	26
	A. Storing-or-delivering an instant voice message based on recipient availability was well-known.	27
	B. Different types of networks were well-known.....	29
	C. Distributed server architecture was well-known.....	31
	D. Packet-switched networks were well-known	34
	E. Voice Messaging was well-known.....	35
	F. Short Message Service (SMS) was well-known	36
	G. Voice over Packet Networks was well-known.....	39
VII.	Grounds of Unpatentability	41
	A. Meaningful distinction between Vuori and Malik	43
VIII.	Ground 1: The Combination of Vuori and Väänänen Renders Obvious Claims 1-3, 5, 14, 15, 17, 19, 28, 29, 31, 33, 40, 42, 51, 53, 62, and 64.	44
	A. Overview of Vuori.....	44

B.	Overview of Väänänen.....	46
C.	Overview of the Vuori-Väänänen Combination	49
D.	Independent Claim 1	51
1.	[1.P]: “An instant voice messaging system for delivering instant messages over a packet-switched network, the system comprising:”	51
2.	[1.1a]: “a client connected to the network,”	53
3.	[1.1b]: “the client selecting one or more recipients,”	54
4.	[1.1c]: “generating an instant voice message therefor,”	54
5.	[1.1d]: “and transmitting the selected recipients and the instant voice message therefor over the network;”	55
6.	[1.2a]: “and a server connected to the network,”	56
7.	[1.2b]: “the server receiving the selected recipients and the instant voice message therefor,”	56
8.	[1.2c]: “and delivering the instant voice message to the selected recipients over the network,”	57
9.	[1.2d]: “the selected recipients enabled to audibly play the instant voice message,”	61
10.	[1.2e]: “and the server temporarily storing the instant voice message if a selected recipient is unavailable and delivering the stored instant voice message to the selected recipient once the selected recipient becomes available.”	62
E.	Dependent Claims 2, 3, and 5	63
1.	Dependent Claim 2: local network	63
2.	Dependent Claim 3: Internet	67
3.	Dependent Claim 5: delivery to available recipient[s]	67
F.	Independent Claim 14	68
1.	Additional limitations in claim 14	70
(a)	[14.P]: a plurality of packet-switched networks	70
(b)	[14.1a]: local network.....	70

(c)	[14.1b]: external recipients connected to an external network	71
(d)	[14.1d]: transmission over the local network and the external network	71
(e)	[14.2a]: a server connected to the external network	72
(f)	[14.2c]: delivery over the external network	72
G.	Dependent claims 15, 17, and 19	73
1.	Dependent Claim 15: local server.....	73
2.	Dependent Claim 17: Internet.....	75
3.	Dependent Claim 19: delivery to available recipient[s]	75
H.	Independent Claim 28	76
1.	Additional Limitations in Claim 28	78
(a)	[28.P]: a plurality of packet-switched networks	78
(b)	[28.1a]: external network	78
(c)	[28.1b]: recipients connected to a local network	79
(d)	[28.1d]: transmission over the external network	79
(e)	[28.2a], [28.2b]: external server system	79
(f)	[28.2c]: routing	80
(g)	[28.3a], [28.3b], [28.3e]: local server receiving and delivering the message.....	80
2.	Dependent Claim 29: external recipients.....	82
3.	Dependent Claim 31: Internet.....	84
4.	Dependent Claim 33: delivery to available recipient[s]	84
I.	Independent Claim 40	84
1.	Dependent Claim 42: delivery to available recipient[s]	86
J.	Independent Claim 51	86
1.	Dependent Claim 53: delivery to available recipient[s]	88
K.	Independent Claim 62	88
1.	Dependent Claim 64: delivery to available recipient[s]	90

IX.	Ground 2: The Combination of Vuori, Väänänen, and Deshpande Renders Obvious Claims 4, 18, 32, 41, 52, 63.	90
A.	Dependent claims 4, 18, 32, 41, 52, and 63: server providing a list of recipients for client selection.	90
1.	Dependent Claim 4	90
2.	Dependent Claim 18	93
3.	Dependent Claim 32	94
4.	Dependent Claim 41	95
5.	Dependent Claim 52	95
6.	Dependent Claim 63	95
X.	Ground 3: The Combination of Vuori, Väänänen, and Abburi Renders Obvious Claims 6, 20, 34, 43, 54, and 65.	96
A.	Dependent Claims 6, 20, 34, 43, 54, 65: audio file.....	96
1.	Claim 6.....	96
2.	Claim 20.....	98
3.	Claim 34.....	98
4.	Claim 43.....	99
5.	Claim 54.....	99
6.	Claim 65.....	99
XI.	Ground 4: The Combination of Vuori, Väänänen, Abburi, and Daniell Renders Obvious Claim 68.....	100
A.	Dependent Claim 68: file attachment.....	100
XII.	Ground 5: The Combination of Malik and Väänänen Renders Obvious Claims 1-3, 5, 14, 15, 17, 19, 28, 29, 31, 33, 40, 42, 51, 53, 62, and 64.	102
A.	Overview of Malik	102
B.	Overview of the Malik-Väänänen Combination	105
C.	Independent Claim 1	107
1.	[1.P]: “An instant voice messaging system for delivering instant messages over a packet-switched network, the system comprising:”	107

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.