

IN THE UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE,)	
)	
)	
)	Case No. (Not Yet Assigned)
Petitioner,)	
)	In re <i>Inter Partes</i> Review of U.S.
v.)	Patent No. 8,438,221
)	
ENVISIONIT, LLC,)	
)	
Patent Owner.)	

EXPERT REPORT OF RANDALL A. SNYDER

TABLE OF CONTENTS

I. Introduction	1
II. Professional Background and Qualifications.....	1
A. Education	1
B. Experience	1
C. Publications	3
D. Prior Testimony	3
E. Compensation	4
III. Understanding Of Patent Law	4
A. Anticipation	4
B. Obviousness.....	5
IV. Person of Ordinary Skill in the Art.....	8
V. Materials Considered.....	9
VI. List of Exhibits.....	9
VII. Background.....	10
A. Telecommunications Standards.....	10
B. Communications Protocols.....	12
C. The Cell Broadcast Services (“CBS”) Standard Protocol.....	14
D. Cell Broadcast Services (“CBS”) Standard Reference Model	15
VIII. State of the Art at the Time of the Patent	19
A. Cell Broadcast Standards, Services and Applications.....	19
B. Protocol Messaging, Parameters, Verification and Validation	23
C. Recording and Logging of Communications and Data.....	26
D. Cell Broadcast Geographic Area	28
E. System Access Control, User Roles and Permissions.....	31
IX. Summary of Opinions.....	33

X.	U.S. Patent No. 8,438,221	34
XI.	The Asserted Claims of the ‘221 Patent are Invalid as Being Obvious over the Prior Art	36
	A. Description of the Patent	36
	B. Introduction to the 3GPP Standard.....	37
	C. Introduction to Gundlegård	38
	D. Introduction to Mani.....	38
	E. Introduction to Zimmers.....	38
	F. Introduction to Sandhu	38
	G. Introduction to Rieger.....	39
XII.	§ 103 Obviousness Prior Art Analysis	39
	A. Gundlegård in View of the 3GPP Standard, Sandhu and Rieger in View of Zimmers	39
	B. Mani in View of the 3GPP Standard, Sandhu and Rieger in View of Zimmers	53
XIII.	Motivation to Combine Prior Art References	60
	A. Motivation to Combine Gundlegård with the 3GPP Standard.....	61
	B. Motivation to Combine Gundlegård with Sandhu	62
	C. Motivation to Combine Gundlegård with Rieger in View of Zimmers	63
	D. Motivation to Combine Mani with the 3GPP Standard	68
	E. Motivation to Combine Mani with Sandhu.....	69
	F. Motivation to Combine Mani with Rieger in View of Zimmers	70
XIV.	Conclusion.....	73

I. INTRODUCTION

[1] My name is Randall A. Snyder. I have been retained by the Civil Division Department of Justice to provide expert analysis in the above-referenced matter concerning U.S. Patent No. 8,438,221 (“the ‘221 Patent”) assigned to EnvisionIT, LLC. (Ex. 1001.)

II. PROFESSIONAL BACKGROUND AND QUALIFICATIONS

[2] I have over 30 years of experience in mobile telecommunications network and system architecture, engineering, design and technology.

[3] I consider myself to be an expert in the field of cellular and wireless telecommunications and networking technology per my qualifications described below. A true and correct copy of my *curriculum vitae* is attached as Ex. 1012, along with a list of cases where I served as a testifying or consulting expert.

A. Education

[4] I have a Bachelor’s Degree in Mathematics from Franklin and Marshall College. More detail regarding my education may be found in my *curriculum vitae*. (Ex. 1012.)

B. Experience

[5] I have experience in the fields of both wireline and wireless telecommunications networking technology. I have taught many classes and seminars on both wireline and wireless telecommunication network technologies

and have been a panelist and speaker at numerous conferences at the Institute of Electrical and Electronics Engineers (“IEEE”), the Personal Communication Society (“PCS”), and the Cellular Telecommunications and Internet Association (“CTIA”). I spent seven years developing standards within the American National Standards Institute’s subsidiary organization, the Telecommunications Industry Association (“TIA”), providing technical contributions and authoring and editing telecommunications proposed standards documents. Most notably, I authored and oversaw the standardization of Interim Standard 93, providing interconnection technology between wireline and wireless networks, which is a fully accredited national standard of the American National Standards Institute (“ANSI”).

[6] I am the co-author of the McGraw-Hill books “Mobile Telecommunications Networking with IS-41,” and “Wireless Telecommunications Networking with ANSI-41, 2nd edition” published in 1997 and 2001, respectively. Each of these books contains an extensive chapter on cellular text messaging technology. I have been issued 29 patents myself on telecommunications networking technology. I have been hired as a consultant by the CTIA, as well as by many wireline and wireless telecommunications companies, including Bell Laboratories, McCaw Cellular, AirTouch, AirTouch International, AT&T Wireless, AT&T Mobility, Lucent, Nokia, Ericsson, Motorola, Samsung, Siemens, Nextwave, MCI, Daewoo, Globalstar, T-Mobile, Sprint, U.S. Cellular, Teleglobe Canada, Teledesic

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.