

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

FORD MOTOR COMPANY
Petitioner,

v.

VERSATA DEVELOPMENT GROUP, INC.
Patent Owner.

U.S. Patent No. 7,882,057

Case No.: IPR2017-00150

**DECLARATION OF DR. PHILIP GREENSPUN IN SUPPORT
OF *INTER PARTES* REVIEW UNDER 35 U.S.C. § 311 *ET SEQ.*
AND 37 C.F.R. § 42.100 *ET SEQ.* (CLAIMS 17, 30, AND 44-46 OF
U.S. PATENT NO. 7,882,057)**

TABLE OF CONTENTS

List of Exhibits.....3

I. Qualifications and Professional Experience.....7

II. Relevant Legal Standards13

III. Level of Ordinary Skill in the Art14

IV. The '057 Patent.....15

V. The '057 Patent Prosecution History.....25

VI. Challenged Claims of the '057 Patent Viewed in their Broadest Reasonable Interpretation26

VII. Scope and Content of the Prior Art (Summary)26

VIII. Prior Art: Loomans, U.S. Patent 7,873,503.....41

IX. Prior Art: “A Customization Approach for Structure Products in Electronic Shops” (“Stahl”).....43

X. Grounds for Challenge.....48

 A. Ground 1 – Claims 17, 30, 44 And 45-46 Obvious Based On Loomans In View Of Stahl And The General Knowledge Of A Person Having Ordinary Skill In The Art48

 1. Analysis of Claims 17, 30, and 44.....48

 a. Claim 17.....48

 b. Reasons to Combine Loomans with Stahl.....94

 c. Claim 30.....98

 d. Claim 44.....113

 2. Analysis of Claims 45 and 46.....119

 a. Claim 45.....119

 b. Claim 46.....165

XI. Conclusion.....169

List of Exhibits

Exhibit No.	Description	Date	Identifier
1301	U.S. Patent No. 7,882,057	Feb. 1, 2011	'057 Patent
1302	Expert Declaration of Dr. Philip Greenspun	n/a	Greenspun Decl.
1303	Curriculum Vitae of Dr. Philip Greenspun	n/a	Greenspun CV
1304	U.S. Patent No. 7,882,057 File History	n/a	'057 Patent File History
1305	U.S. Patent No. 7,873,503 to Loomans et al.	Jan. 18, 2011	Loomans
1306	A. Stahl, R. Bergmann, S. Schmitt, <u>A Customization Approach for Structured Products in Electronic Shops</u> , <i>Electronic Commerce: The End of the Beginning, 13th International Bled Electronic Commerce Conference</i> (June 19-21, 2000)	Jun. 2000	Stahl
1307	Alexander Kott, Gerald Agin, David Fawcett, <u>Configuration Tree Solver: A Technology for Automated Design and Configuration</u> , <i>ASME Journal of Mechanical Design</i> 114(1): 187-195 (1992)	1992	Kott
1308	L. Anselma, D. Magro, and P. Torasso, <u>Automatically Decomposing Configuration Problems</u> , <i>AI*IA 2003: Advances in Artificial Intelligence</i> , Lecture Notes in Computer Science, Volume 2829, pp. 39-52 (2003)	2003	Anselma

Exhibit No.	Description	Date	Identifier
1309	D. Magro and P. Torasso, <u>Decomposing and Distributing Configuration Problems</u> , <i>Artificial Intelligence: Methodology, Systems, and Applications</i> , Lecture Notes in Computer Science, Volume 2443, pp. 81-90 (2002)	2002	Magro
1310	Judith Bachant, John McDermott, <u>R1 Revisited: Four Years in the Trenches</u> , <i>AI Magazine</i> Volume 5, Number 3 (1984)	1984	Bachant
1311	John McDermott, <u>R1: A Rule-Based Configurer of Computer Systems</u> , <i>Artificial Intelligence</i> (1982)	1982	McDermott
1312	Bryan M. Kramer, <u>Knowledge-Based Configuration of Computer Systems Using Hierarchical Partial Choice</u> , <i>IEEE</i> (1991)	1991	Kramer
1313	Bei Yu and Hans Jorgen Skovgaard, <u>A Configuration Tool to Increase Product Competitiveness</u> , <i>IEEE Intelligent Systems</i> , 34-41 (July/August 1998)	1998	Yu
1314	U.S. Patent Application Publication No. 2003/0187950 to Rising	Oct. 2, 2003	Rising
1315	Martin R. Wagner, <u>Understanding the ICAD System</u> , ICAD, Inc., 1990	1990	ICAD
1316	Oracle Configurator Developer, User's Guide, Release 11i for Windows 95/98/2000 and Windows NT 4.0	April 2002	Oracle
1317	Stefan Schulz, <u>CBR-Works A State-of-the-Art Shell for Case-Based Application Building</u> , TECINNO GmbH, 1999	1999	CBR Works Paper

Exhibit No.	Description	Date	Identifier
1318	Richard M. Stallman and Gerald Jay Sussman, <u>Forward Reasoning and Dependency-Directed Backtracking In a System for Computer-Aided Circuit Analysis</u> , MIT Artificial Intelligence Laboratory, Memo No. 380, Sept. 1976	Sept. 1976	Stallman
1319	Bergmann Declaration	Oct. 14, 2016	
1320	Schmitt Declaration	Oct. 3, 2016	
1321	Winston Textbook	1992	
1322	<i>Ford v. Versata</i> , Versata Answer & Counterclaims (Dkt. #59)	10/28/15	
1323	<i>Versata v. Ford</i> , Versata Complaint (Dkt. #1)	5/7/15	
1324	<i>Ford v. Versata</i> , Opinion and Order Denying Motion to Dismiss (Dkt. #55)	10/14/15	
1325	<i>Versata v. Ford</i> , Order to File Notice of Good Cause (Dkt. #68)	11/5/15	
1326	<i>Versata v. Ford</i> , Versata Notice Regarding Dismissal (Dkt. #69)	11/30/15	
1327	<i>Versata v. Ford</i> , Order of Dismissal (Dkt. #70)	12/3/15	
1328	<i>Ford v. Versata</i> , Amended Complaint (Dkt. #6)	3/16/15	

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.