

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

---

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

---

VALVE CORPORATION  
Petitioner,

v.

IRONBURG INVENTIONS LTD.,  
Patent Owner.

---

Case IPR2017-00136  
Patent 8,641,525

---

**PATENT OWNER RESPONSE**

***Mail Stop "PATENT BOARD"***  
Patent Trial and Appeal Board  
U.S. Patent and Trademark Office  
P.O. Box 1450  
Alexandria, VA 22313-1450

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

	Page
I. INTRODUCTION .....	1
II. CLAIM CONSTRUCTION .....	2
A. Preamble Of Claim 20 Is Limiting .....	2
1. Preamble Is Limiting Because It Provides Antecedent Basis To “The Controller” In The Body Of Claim 20 .....	4
2. Preamble Is Limiting Because It Recites Essential Structure And Breathes Life, Meaning And Vitality Into Claim 20 .....	7
3. Preamble Is Limiting Because The Specification Focuses On Addressing A Prior Art Problem Of A Particular Hand Held Video Game Controller Structure .....	9
4. Petitioner Agrees That Preamble Is Limiting .....	13
B. Meaning of “Hand Held Controller For a Game Console” .....	13
1. Prior Decisions Construing “Hand-Held” .....	13
2. Dr. Stevick’s Testimony In The 948 And 949 IPR Proceedings .....	15
3. Construction Of “Controller For A Game Console” .....	17
III. WÖRN DOES NOT ANTICIPATE CLAIM 20 BECAUSE IT DOES NOT DISCLOSE THE CLAIMED “HAND HELD CONTROLLER FOR A GAME CONSOLE” .....	19
IV. CONCLUSION .....	21

## TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

Page

### CASES

<i>Aevoe Corp. v. AE Tech Co., Ltd.</i> , Case No. 2:12-cv-00053-GMN-RJJ (D. Nev. May 14, 2013).....	15
<i>Apple Inc. v. Memory Integrity, LLC</i> , IPR2015-00159 (PTAB May 11, 2015) .....	18
<i>Asus Computer Int'l v. Exotablet Ltd.</i> , Case No. C 14-1743 PJH (N.D.Cal. Aug. 12, 2014) .....	14
<i>Bell Communications Research, Inc. v. Vitalink Communications Corp.</i> , 55 F.3d 615, 34 USPQ2d 1816 (Fed. Cir. 1995) .....	3
<i>Catalina Marketing Int'l, Inc. v. Coolsavings.com, Inc.</i> , 289 F.3d 801 (Fed. Cir. 2002) .....	3, 4
<i>Chevron N. Am., Inc. v. Milwaukee Elec. Tool. Corp.</i> , IPR2015-00595 (PTAB July 31, 2015), IPR2015-00596 (PTAB July 31, 2015), IPR2015-00597 (PTAB July 31, 2015) .....	14
<i>Dataquill Ltd. v. Huawei Techs. Co. Ltd.</i> , Case No. 2:13-cv-633-JRG-RSP (E.D.Tex. Jan 27, 2015) .....	15
<i>Eaton Corp. v. Rockwell Int'l Corp.</i> , 323 F.3d 1332 (Fed. Cir. 2003) .....	5, 6
<i>General Electric Co. v. Nintendo Co.</i> , 179 F.3d 1350, 50 USPQ2d 1910 (Fed. Cir. 1999) .....	4, 9, 12, 20
<i>Lindsay Corp. v. Valmont Indus., Inc.</i> , IPR2015-01039 (PTAB Sept. 14, 2016) .....	14
<i>McKesson Information Solutions Inc. v. Bridge Medical Inc.</i> , Case No. CIV S-02-2669 FCD KJM (E.D. Cal. June 7, 2005) .....	14, 15
<i>Pacing Techs. LLC v. Garmin Intern. Inc.</i> , 778 F.3d 1021 (Fed. Cir. 2015) .....	5, 6
<i>Pitney Bowes, Inc. v. Hewlett-Packard Co.</i> , 182 F.3d 1298 (Fed. Cir. 1999) .....	4

**TABLE OF AUTHORITIES**  
(continued)

	<b>Page</b>
<i>Responsive Innovs. LLC. v. Holtzbrink Publishers LLC</i> , Case No. 4:08CV1184 (N.D.Ohio April 9, 2013) .....	14
<i>Samsung Elects. Co. Ltd. v. IXI IP, LLC</i> , IPR2015-01442 (PTAB Dec. 30, 2015) .....	7, 8, 12, 14
<i>Schumer v. Lab Computer Sys., Inc.</i> , 308 F.3d 1304 (Fed. Cir. 2002) .....	5, 6
<i>VSR Indus., Inc. v. Cole Kepro Int’l, LLC</i> , IPR2015-00182 (PTAB April 28, 2016) .....	18
<i>Xilinx, Inc. v. Intellectual Ventures I LLC</i> , IPR2013-00029 (PTAB March 12, 2013) .....	18

**UPDATED EXHIBIT LIST**

<b>Exhibit No.</b>	<b>Description</b>
<b>2001</b>	Declaration of Robert Becker
<b>2002</b>	Declaration of Dr. Glen Stevick in support of Patent Owner Preliminary Response
<b>2003</b>	C/V of Dr. Glen Stevick
<b>2004</b>	Excerpts from MERRIAM-WEBSTER'S COLLEGIATE DICTIONARY (10 <sup>th</sup> ed. 1998)
<b>2005</b>	Excerpts from WEBSTER'S NEW AMERICAN DICTIONARY (1995)
<b>2006</b>	Patent 8,641,525 Prosecution History
<b>2007</b>	U.S. Patent 7,859,514 ("Park")
<b>2008</b>	LinkedIn Page of Simon Burgess
<b>2009</b>	LinkedIn Page of Duncan Ironmonger
<b>2010</b>	Scuf Gaming Webpage
<b>2011</b>	Scuf Gaming Press Release
<b>2012</b>	Declaration of Nicoleta Cosereanu
<b>2013</b>	Declaration of Ehab M. Samuel
<b>2014</b>	Patent 9,089,770 Prosecution History
<b>2015</b>	First Petition filed by Petitioner in the 948 IPR
<b>2016</b>	PTAB's Institution Decision in the 948 IPR
<b>2017</b>	Select Pages from KRC2 Controller Workbook
<b>2018</b>	Webpage from <a href="http://www.GebrauchtRoboter.com">www.GebrauchtRoboter.com</a> on Kuka's KRC2 Controller
<b>2019</b>	Webpage from <a href="http://www.eurobots.net">www.eurobots.net</a> on Kuka's KRC2 Controller
<b>2020</b>	Webpage from <a href="http://www.ebay.com">www.ebay.com</a> on Kuka's KRC2 Controller
<b>2021</b>	Declaration of Danielle Mihalkanin
<b>2022</b>	Patent Search Result Based on Petitioner's EX1012, App. A
<b>2023</b>	Motion for Leave to Amend Complaint in District Court

# Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

## Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

## Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

## Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

## API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

## LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

## FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

## E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.