

trials@uspto.gov

571-272-7822

IPR2016-00948, Paper No. 36

IPR2016-00949, Paper No. 37

June 23, 2017

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

VALVE CORPORATION,
Petitioner,

v.

IRONBURG INVENTIONS LTD.,
Patent Owner.

IPR2016-00948 (Patent 8,641,525 B2)
IPR2016-00949 (Patent 9,089,770 B2)

RECORD OF ORAL HEARING
Oral Hearing Held: Monday, June 5, 2017

Before PHILLIP J. KAUFFMAN, MEREDITH C. PETRAVICK, and
MITCHELL G. WEATHERLY, Administrative Patent Judges.

The above-entitled matter came on for hearing on Monday, June
5, 2017, at the U.S. Patent and Trademark Office, 600 Dulany
Street, Alexandria, Virginia, in Courtroom B, at 1:00 p.m.

IPR2016-00948 (Patent 8,641,525 B2)

IPR2016-00949 (Patent 9,089,770 B2)

A P P E A R A N C E S

ON BEHALF OF THE PETITIONER, VALVE CORPORATION:

JOSHUA C. HARRISON, ESQUIRE
REYNALDO BARCELO, ESQUIRE
BARCELO, HARRISON & WALKER, LLP
2901 West Coast Highway
Suite 200
Newport Beach, California 92663
(949) 340-9736

ON BEHALF OF THE PATENT OWNER, IRONBURG
INVENTIONS LTD.:

EHAB SAMUEL, ESQUIRE
YASSER M. EL-GAMAL, ESQUIRE
MANATT, PHELPS & PHILLIPS, LLP
695 Town Center Drive
Fourteenth Floor
Costa Mesa, California 92626
(714) 338-2740

IPR2016-00948 (Patent 8,641,525 B2)

IPR2016-00949 (Patent 9,089,770 B2)

1 scope of reply, you'll see that that case cites to 37 C.F.R.
2 42.23(b), which expressly says that the proper scope of reply
3 includes what's in their Patent Owner's response.

4 And so not only is the subclass and class on the
5 face of the very patents that have been in evidence the
6 entire case, but in addition to that, it's responsive to
7 their Patent Owner's response.

8 Can I have the next slide, please?

9 The second issue that I would like to address
10 that's disputed is this business about the preamble not being
11 limiting and so forth. Our argument isn't that the word,
12 Hand-held, appears in the preamble, but it's because it's in
13 the preamble, it's not limiting. That is not our argument.
14 It's almost a tempest in a teapot.

15 We're kind of scratching our heads as to they're
16 worried about that. We're fine with the preamble being
17 limiting. The word, Hand-held, though, covers an actual
18 thing in Tosaki called handgrips 14A. Tosaki actually
19 says -- excuse me -- first thing -- I just want to grab
20 Tosaki.

21 JUDGE KAUFFMAN: For the record, we're talking
22 about Slide 3 of the Petitioner's demonstratives?