

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

REACTIVE SURFACES LTD. LLP,

Petitioner,

v.

TOYOTA MOTOR CORPORATION,

Patent Owner.

Case IPR2016-01914

Patent No. 8,394,618 B2

PATENT OWNERS' JOINT MOTION TO DISMISS

TABLE OF CONTENTS

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES ii

INTRODUCTION 1

I. BACKGROUND 1

II. ARGUMENT..... 2

 A. Eleventh-Amendment Sovereign Immunity Extends to
 Inter Partes Reviews..... 8

 B. The University Is Entitled to Assert Sovereign Immunity..... 8

 C. The Merits of This IPR Petition Cannot Be Adjudicated
 in the University’s Absence. 11

 D. The University’s Sovereign Immunity Cannot Be Ignored
 Because of Petitioner’s Speculative Policy Concerns..... 18

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

Cases

A123 Sys. v. Hydro-Quebec,
626 F.3d 1213 (Fed. Cir. 2010)16

Abbott Labs. v. Cordis Corp.,
710 F.3d 1318 (Fed. Cir. 2013)3

Adams v. Bell,
711 F.2d 161 (D.C. Cir. 1983) (en banc).....14

Biomedical Patent Mgmt. Corp. v. California,
505 F.3d 1328 (Fed. Cir. 2007)20

Covidien LP v. Univ. of Fla. Research Found. Inc.,
IPR2016-01274, -01275, -01276,
Paper 21 (Jan. 25, 2017) 1, 2, 4, 5, 8, 9, 11, 18

Cyanotech Corp. v. United States Nutraceuticals, LLC,
2013 U.S. Dist. LEXIS 16948 (D. Haw. Feb. 7, 2013).....16

Dainippon Screen Mfg. Co. v. CFMT, Inc.,
142 F.3d 1266 (Fed. Cir. 1998)17

Delano Farms Co. v. Cal. Table Grape Comm’n,
623 F. Supp. 2d 1144 (E.D. Cal. 2009)16

Enter. Mgmt. Consultants, Inc. v. United States,
883 F.2d 890 (10th Cir. 1989)13, 15, 17

Ethicon, Inc. v. United States Surgical Corp.,
135 F.3d 1456 (Fed. Cir. 1998)19

Faibisch v. Univ. of Minn.,
304 F.3d 797 (8th Cir. 2002)11

FCC v. Pottsville Broad. Co.,
309 U.S. 134 (1940).....8

Fluent v. Salamanca Indian Lease Auth.,
928 F.2d 542 (2d Cir. 1991)14

FMC v. S.C. State Ports Auth.,
535 U.S. 743 (2002).....2, 4, 6, 8, 11, 12

Hoeffner v. Univ. of Minn.,
948 F. Supp. 1380 (D. Minn. 1996)8, 10, 11

Issaenko v. Univ. of Minn.,
57 F. Supp. 3d 985 (D. Minn. 2014)11

Lapides v. Bd. of Regents,
535 U.S. 613 (2002).....19

Philippines v. Pimentel,
553 U.S. 851 (2008).....1, 12, 14, 14, 15, 17

Raygor v. Regents of the Univ. of Minn.,
534 U.S. 533 (2002).....9

Regents of the Univ. of Cal. v. Doe,
519 U.S. 425 (1997).....8, 9

Richmond v. Bd. of Regents of Univ. of Minn.,
957 F.2d 595 (8th Cir. 1992)11

Shermoen v. United States,
982 F.2d 1312 (9th Cir. 1992)15

Shire Dev. LLC v. Lucerne Biosceinces, LLC,
IPR2014-00739, Paper 26 (May 5, 2015)7

Shire Dev. LLC v. Lucerne Biosciences, LLC,
IPR2014-00739, Paper 33 (Jun. 4, 2015)5

Star Tribune Co. v. Univ. of Minn. Bd. of Regents,
683 N.W.2d 274 (Minn. 2004)9

Three Affiliated Tribes of Ft. Berthold Reservation v. Wold Eng'g, P. C.,
476 U.S. 877 (1986).....14

Treleven v. Univ. of Minn.,
73 F.3d 816 (8th Cir. 1996)8, 9, 11

Vas-Cath, Inc. v. Curators of the Univ. of Mo.,
473 F.3d 1376 (Fed. Cir. 2007)2, 3, 6, 7

Walstad v. Univ. of Minn. Hosps.,
442 F.2d 634 (8th Cir. 1971)11

White v. Univ. of Cal.,
765 F.3d 1010 (9th Cir. 2014)14

Wichita & Affiliated Tribes of Oklahoma v. Hodel,
788 F.2d 765 (D.C. Cir. 1986).....13, 14

Constitutions, Statutes, and Regulations

35 U.S.C. § 24.....5

35 U.S.C. § 132.....3

35 U.S.C. § 133.....3

35 U.S.C. § 312(a) (2006).....3

35 U.S.C. § 313.....5

35 U.S.C. § 314(a)3, 4, 6

35 U.S.C. § 315(e)7

35 U.S.C. § 316(a)4

35 U.S.C. § 318.....4

37 C.F.R. § 41.23

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.