IN THE UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

ELEKTA INC.
Petitioner
v.

VARIAN MEDICAL SYSTEMS, INC.
Patent Owner

Case IPR2016-01904
Patent No. 6,888,919

PATENT OWNER'S PRELIMINARY RESPONSE.

DOCKET ALARM
Find authenticated court documents without watermarks at docketalarm.com.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Page

PETITIONER'S LIST OF EXHIBITS v

I. INTRODUCTION 1

II. OVERVIEW OF THE '919 PATENT 1

A. State of the Art 1

B. Subject Matter of the '919 Patent 11

III. CLAIM CONSTRUCTION 17

A. Level of Skill in the Art 17

B. Legal Standard 18

C. "gantry" 19

D. "a second gantry that is rotatable" 23

E. "articulable end [of the second gantry]" 27

F. "extending and retracting [the second radiation source]" 29

IV. PETITIONER HAS NOT SHOWN A REASONABLE LIKELIHOOD THAT AT LEAST ONE CLAIM OF THE '919 PATENT IS UNPATENTABLE 32

A. Legal Standard 32

B. Claims 1, 3, 4, 9, and 11 are not Anticipated by Jaffray '502 36

C. The Challenged Claims are Not Obvious Over Jaffray '502 in View of Watanabe. 49

D. Ground III is Redundant. 70

DOCKET ALARM

Find authenticated court documents without watermarks at docketalarm.com.

E. There is No Motivation to Combine Jaffray '502 and Watanabe with Maschke. 72

V. CONCLUSION 74

DOCKET ALARM Find authenticated court documents without watermarks at docketalarm.com.

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

Page(s)

CASES

ActiveVideo Networks v. Verizon Commc'ns, Inc.,
694 F.3d 1312 (Fed. Cir. 2012) 35

Bell Atl. Network Servs. v. Covad Commc'ns Grp.,
262 F.3d 1258 (Fed. Cir. 2001) 19

CBS Interactive Inc. v. Helferich Patent Licensing, LLC,
Case IPR2013-00033, Paper 122 (P.T.A.B. Mar. 3, 2014) 19

Dominion Dealer Solutions, LLC v. AutoAlert, Inc.,
Case IPR2013-00220 (JL), Paper 9 (P.T.A.B Aug. 15, 2013) 33, 34

Ex Parte Hindle,
Appeal 2012-003332 (P.T.A.B. July 17, 2014).....33

*Gordon * Howard Assocs., Inc. v. LunarEye, Inc.*,
Case IPR2014-00712, Paper 8 (P.T.A.B. Oct. 17, 2014) 17

In re Fine,
837 F.2d 1071 (Fed. Cir. 1988) 33

In re Gordon,
733 F.2d 900 (Fed. Cir. 1984) 35, 61, 70

In re Hyatt,
708 F.2d 712 (Fed. Cir. 1983) 18

In re Ratti,
270 F.2d 810 (CCPA 1959).....*passim*

Karsten Mfg. Corp. v. Cleveland Golf Co.,
242 F.3d 1376 (Fed. Cir. 2001) 33

Kinetic Techs., Inc. v. Skyworks Solutions, Inc.,
IPR2014-00529, Paper 8 (P.T.A.B. Sept. 23, 2014).....35

KSR Int'l Co. v. Teleflex Inc.,
550 U.S. 398 (2007).....33, 34

DOCKET ALARM
Find authenticated court documents without watermarks at docketalarm.com.

Liberty Mutual Ins. Co. v. Progressive Casualty Ins. Co.,
CBM2012-00003, Paper 7 (P.T.A.B. Oct. 25, 2012) 70, 71

Net MoneyIN v. VeriSign, Inc.,
545 F.3d 1359 (Fed. Cir. 2008) 33

Nissim Corp. v. Time Warner, Inc.,
Appeal No. 2011-011260 (B.P.A.I. Feb. 6, 2012).....18

Par Pharma, Inc. v. TWI Pharma, Inc.,
773 F.3d 1186 (Fed. Cir. 2014) 35

TRW Automotive US LLC v. Manga Elecs. Inc.,
Case IPR2014-00259, Paper 19 (P.T.A.B. June 26, 2014) 34

Verdegaal Bros. v. Union Oil Co. of Cal.,
814 F.2d 628 (Fed. Cir. 1987) 32

STATUTES

35 U.S.C. § 103(a) 33

OTHER AUTHORITIES

37 C.F.R. § 42.61 4

37 C.F.R. § 42.62 4

37 C.F.R. § 42.64 4

37 C.F.R. § 42.107 1

M.P.E.P. § 2131 32

DOCKET ALARM
Find authenticated court documents without watermarks at docketalarm.com.

DOCKET ALARM

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts

Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research

With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips

Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS
Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS
Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS
Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.