

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

ELEKTA INC.

Petitioner

v.

VARIAN MEDICAL SYSTEMS, INC.

Patent Owner

IPR2016-01902

**PETITION FOR *INTER PARTES* REVIEW
OF UNITED STATES PATENT NO. 6,888,919**

TABLE OF CONTENTS

I.	STATEMENT OF PRECISE RELIEF REQUESTED FOR EACH CLAIM CHALLENGED	1
II.	PRELIMINARY STATEMENT.....	1
III.	BACKGROUND OF RADIATION THERAPY TECHNOLOGY.....	5
	A. Radiation Treatment Machines	5
	B. Prior Art Recognized in '919 Patent	11
IV.	THE '919 PATENT.....	13
	A. Overview	13
	B. Prosecution History	15
V.	LEVEL OF ORDINARY SKILL.....	17
VI.	CLAIM CONSTRUCTION.....	17
	A. “gantry” [claims 1, 2, 9, 11, and 13]	18
	B. “an articulable end of the second gantry” [claims 1 and 13]	19
	C. “rotatable” [claims 1 and 13]	20
VII.	CLAIMS 1-4, 9, 11, AND 13 ARE UNPATENTABLE BASED ON THE DISCLOSURE OF <i>BARNEA</i> AND <i>WATANABE</i>.....	22
	A. Overview of the Prior Art.....	22
	B. The Combination of <i>Barnea</i> and <i>Watanabe</i> Renders Obvious Claims 1-4, 9, 11, and 13	24
	1. [Claim 1, element 1.a] “An apparatus comprising”	25
	2. [Claim 1, element 1.b] “a first therapeutic radiation source attached to a first gantry”	25
	3. [Claim 1, element 1.c] “at least one second radiation source”	27

4.	[Claim 1, element 1.d] “a second gantry that is rotatable, the second gantry is attached to the first gantry”	28
5.	[Claim 1, element 1.e] “an imager attached to an articulable end of the second gantry”	30
6.	[Claim 2] “The apparatus of claim 1, wherein at least one second radiation source is attached to the second gantry”	36
7.	[Claim 3] “The apparatus of claim 1, wherein the first therapeutic radiation source to propagate therapeutic energy at a first energy level”	37
8.	[Claim 4] “The apparatus of claim 1, wherein at least one second radiation source to propagate diagnostic energy at a second energy level”	37
9.	[Claim 9] “The apparatus of claim 1, wherein the articulable end comprises at least one pivot point between the second gantry and the imager”	38
10.	[Claim 11] “The apparatus of claim 1, wherein the articulable end is capable of folding the imager against the second gantry”	39
11.	[Claim 13, element 13.a] “An apparatus comprising”	41
12.	[Claim 13, element 13.b] “a first radiation source attached to a first gantry”	41
13.	[Claim 13, element 13.c] “at least one second radiation source”	41
14.	[Claim 13, element 13.d] “a second gantry that is rotatable, wherein the second gantry is capable of extending and retracting the second radiation source attached to the second gantry”	42
15.	[Claim 13, element 13.e] “an imager attached to an articulable end of the second gantry”	46

VIII. CLAIM 13 IS UNPATENTABLE BASED ON THE DISCLOSURE OF GRADY	47
A. Overview of the Prior Art.....	47
B. <i>Grady</i> Anticipates Claim 13.....	48
1. [Claim 13, element 13.a] “An apparatus comprising”	48
2. [Claim 13, element 13.b] “a first radiation source attached to a first gantry”	49
3. [Claim 13, element 13.c] “at least one second radiation source”	50
4. [Claim 13, element 13.d] “a second gantry that is rotatable, wherein the second gantry is capable of extending and retracting the second radiation source attached to the second gantry”	51
5. [Claim 13, element 13.e] “an imager attached to an articulable end of the second gantry”	53
IX. MANDATORY NOTICES	55
A. Real Party-in-Interest	55
B. Related Matters.....	55
C. Lead and Backup Counsel.....	55
D. Service Information.....	55
X. CERTIFICATION UNDER 37 C.F.R. § 42.24(d).....	56
XI. GROUNDS FOR STANDING.....	56
XII. PAYMENT OF FEES	56
XIII. CONCLUSION	56
CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE	1

LIST OF EXHIBITS

Petition Exhibit No.	Description
1001	U.S. Patent No. 6,888,919 to Graf (“the ’919 patent”)
1002	Declaration of K. David Steidley, Ph.D.
1003	File Wrapper for U.S. Patent Application No. 10/033,327 (U.S. Patent No. 6,888,919)
1004	U.S. Patent No. 6,325,537 to Watanabe (“Watanabe”)
1005	U.S. Patent No. 6,104,780 to Hanover et al. (“Hanover”)
1006	P. Munro, <i>Portal Imaging Technology: Past, Present, and Future</i> , SEMINARS IN RADIATION ONCOLOGY, vol. 5, no. 2, pp. 115-133 (Apr. 1995) (“Munro”)
1007	Y. Takai et al., <i>Development of a New Linear Accelerator Mounted with Dual X-Ray Fluoroscopy Using Amorphous Silicon Flat Panel X-Ray Sensors to Detect a Gold Seed in a Tumor at Real Treatment Position</i> , INT’L J. OF RADIATION ONCOLOGY, vol. 51, no. 3, at 381 (Nov. 1, 2001)
1008	CHAMBERS SCI. & TECH. DICT. (excerpts) (1991)
1009	MERRIAM-WEBSTER’S COLLEGIATE DICT. (excerpts) (10th ed. 2001)
1010	David Jaffray et al., <i>A Radiographic and Tomographic Imaging System Integrated into a Medical Linear Accelerator for Localization of Bone and Soft-Tissue Targets</i> , INT. J. RADIATION ONCOLOGY BIOL. & PHYS., vol. 45, no. 3, pp. 773-789 (1999) (“Jaffray Article”)
1011	PRINCIPLES AND PRACTICE OF RADIATION ONCOLOGY (excerpts) (Carlos A. Perez & Luther W. Brady eds., 3d ed. 1998)
1012	U.S. Patent No. 5,233,990 to Barnea (“Barnea”)
1013	U.S. Patent No. 4,426,725 to Grady (“Grady”)

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.