

IN THE UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

ELEKTA INC.

Petitioner

v.

VARIAN MEDICAL SYSTEMS, INC.

Patent Owner

Case IPR2016-01902

Patent No. 6,888,919

PATENT OWNER'S PRELIMINARY RESPONSE.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	Page
PETITIONER’S LIST OF EXHIBITS.....	i
I. INTRODUCTION.....	1
II. OVERVIEW OF THE ’919 PATENT.....	1
A. State of the Art.....	1
B. Subject Matter of the ’919 Patent.....	12
III. CLAIM CONSTRUCTION.....	18
A. Level of Skill in the Art.....	19
B. Legal Standard.....	20
C. “gantry”.....	21
D. “a second gantry that is rotatable”.....	25
E. “articulable end [of the second gantry]”.....	29
F. “extending and retracting [the second radiation source]”.....	31
IV. PETITIONER HAS NOT SHOWN A REASONABLE LIKELIHOOD THAT AT LEAST ONE CLAIM OF THE ’919 PATENT IS UNPATENTABLE.....	34
A. Legal Standard.....	34
B. Claims 1-4, 9, 11, and 13 are Not Obvious Over Barnea in View of Watanabe.....	38
C. Petitioner Has Failed to Show that Grady Anticipates Claim 13.....	60
V. CONCLUSION.....	68

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

	Page(s)
CASES	
<i>ActiveVideo Networks v. Verizon Commc 'ns, Inc.</i> , 694 F.3d 1312 (Fed. Cir. 2012)	36
<i>Bell Atl. Network Servs. v. Covad Commc 'ns Grp.</i> , 262 F.3d 1258 (Fed. Cir. 2001)	20
<i>CBS Interactive Inc. v. Helferich Patent Licensing, LLC</i> , Case IPR2013-00033, Paper 122 (P.T.A.B. Mar. 3, 2014)	20
<i>Dominion Dealer Solutions, LLC v. AutoAlert, Inc.</i> Case IPR2013-00220, Paper 9 (P.T.A.B. Aug 15, 2013)	35, 36, 37, 57
<i>Ex Parte Hindle</i> , Appeal 2012-003332 (P.T.A.B. July 17, 2014)	35
<i>Gordon * Howard Assocs., Inc. v. LunarEye, Inc.</i> , Case IPR2014-00712, Paper 8 (P.T.A.B. Oct. 17, 2014)	19
<i>In re Fine</i> , 837 F.2d 1071 (Fed. Cir. 1988)	35
<i>In re Gordon</i> , 733 F.2d 900 (Fed. Cir. 1984)	37, 42, 51, 53
<i>In re Hyatt</i> , 708 F.2d 712 (Fed. Cir. 1983)	20
<i>In re Morris</i> , 127 F.3d 1048 (Fed. Cir. 1997)	19
<i>In re Ratti</i> , 270 F.2d 810 (CCPA 1959)	37, 42, 51
<i>In re Skvorecz</i> , 580 F.3d 1262 (Fed. Cir. 2009)	20
<i>InTouch Technologies, Inc. v. VGO Comm 'ns, Inc.</i> , 751 F.3d 1327 (Fed. Cir. 2014)	52

Karsten Mfg. Corp. v. Cleveland Golf Co.,
242 F.3d 1376 (Fed. Cir. 2001)38

Kinetic Techs., Inc. v. Skyworks Solutions, Inc.,
IPR2014-00529, Paper 8 (P.T.A.B. Sept. 23, 2014).....36

KSR Int’l Co. v. Teleflex Inc.,
550 U.S. 398 (2007).....35, 36, 57

Microsoft Corp. v. Proxyconn, Inc.,
789 F.3d 1292 (Fed. Cir. 2015)20

Net MoneyIN v. VeriSign, Inc.,
545 F.3d 1359 (Fed. Cir. 2008)37

Nissim Corp. v. Time Warner, Inc.,
Appeal No. 2011-011260 (B.P.A.I. Feb. 6, 2012).....20

Par Pharma, Inc. v. TWI Pharma, Inc.,
773 F.3d 1186 (Fed. Cir. 2014)37

TRW Automotive US LLC v. Manga Elecs. Inc.,
Case IPR2014-00259, Paper 19 (P.T.A.B. June 26, 2014)35, 36

Verdegaal Bros. v. Union Oil Co. of Cal.,
814 F.2d 628 (Fed. Cir. 1987)37

STATUTES

35 U.S.C. § 103(a)35

OTHER AUTHORITIES

37 C.F.R. §§ 42.61, 62, 644

37 C.F.R. § 42.645

37 C.F.R. § 42.1071

M.P.E.P. § 213137

PETITIONER'S LIST OF EXHIBITS

Ex.	Description
2001	Declaration of Kenneth Gall
2002	U.S. Patent No. 5,448,607
2003	U.S. Patent No. 6,614,036
2004	U.S. Patent No. 5,727,554
2005	U.S. Patent No. 5,724,400
2006	IEC International Standard 60601-2-1, Second edition, June 1998

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.