

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

APPLE INC.
Petitioner,

v.

PAPST LICENSING GMBH & CO. KG
Patent Owner

Case IPR2016-01864
Patent 6,470,399

**PETITIONER APPLE INC.'S
REPLY TO PATENT OWNER'S RESPONSE**

Mail Stop "PATENT BOARD"
Patent Trial and Appeal Board
U.S. Patent and Trademark Office
P.O. Box 1450
Alexandria, VA 22313-1450

TABLE OF CONTENTS

- I. Claim Construction.....2
- II. Patent Owner’s arguments have no merit.....2
 - A. Patent Owner’s arguments regarding an allegedly missing limitation are based on technical inaccuracies having no support in the record.....3
 - 1. The combination discloses the inquiry response recited in claims 1, 11, and 14.3
 - 2. The combination discloses the driver limitation.8
 - B. A POSITA would have combined Pucci and Schmidt.14
 - C. Patent Owner does not separately argue patentability of claims 3 and 5.18
- III. Patent Owner’s belief of unconstitutionality is not a request for relief.18
- IV. Conclusion.19

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

Cases:

Vivid Techs. v. Amer. Science,
200 F.3d 795 (Fed. Cir. 2000).....2

EXHIBIT LIST

| Ex. No. | Description |
|----------------|---|
| 1001 | U.S. Patent 6,470,399 to Tasler |
| 1002 | File History for U.S. Patent 6,470,399 |
| 1003 | Declaration of Dr. Erez Zadok in Support of Petition for <i>Inter Partes</i> Review of U.S. Patent No. 6,470,399 |
| 1004 | Curriculum Vitae of Dr. Erez Zadok |
| 1005 | <i>Intentionally left blank</i> |
| 1006 | <i>Intentionally left blank</i> |
| 1007 | <i>The SCSI Bus and IDE Interface Protocols, Applications and Programming</i> , by Schmidt, First Edition, Addison-Wesley, 1995 |
| 1008 | <i>Intentionally left blank</i> |
| 1009 | U.S. Patent No. 4,727,512 to Birkner |
| 1010 | U.S. Patent No. 4,792,896 to Maclean |
| 1011 | International Publication Number WO 92/21224 to Jorgensen |
| 1012 | Small Computer System Interface-2 (SCSI-2), ANSI X3.131-1994, American National Standard for Information Systems (ANSI). |
| 1013 | <i>Operating System Concepts</i> , by Silberschatz <i>et al.</i> , Fourth Edition. |
| 1014 | <i>Microsoft Computer Dictionary</i> , Third Edition, Microsoft Press, 1997. |
| 1015 | <i>Intentionally left blank</i> |
| 1016 | <i>In re Papst Licensing Digital Camera Patent Litigation</i> , 778 F.3d 1255 (Fed. Cir. 2015). |
| 1017 | <i>The Art of Electronics</i> , by Horowitz <i>et al.</i> , First Edition, Cambridge University Press, 1980. |
| 1018 | <i>The IEEE Standard Dictionary of Electrical and Electronics Terms</i> , Sixth Edition, 1996. |
| 1019 | <i>Webster's Encyclopedic Unabridged Dictionary of the English Language</i> , Random House, 1996. |
| 1020 | <i>Papst Licensing GmbH & Co., KG v. Apple Inc.</i> , Case No. 6-15-cv-01095 (E.D. Tex.), Complaint filed November 30, 2015 |
| 1021 | "Principles of Data Acquisition and Conversion," Burr-Brown Application Bulletin, 1994. |
| 1022 | "Principles of Data Acquisition and Conversion," Intersil Application Note, October 1986. |
| 1023 | "Sample-and-Hold Amplifiers," Analog Devices MT-090 Tutorial, 2009. |
| 1024 | Declaration of Scott Bennett |

| <u>Ex. No.</u> | <u>Description</u> |
|-----------------------|---|
| 1025 | <i>Discrete-Time Signal Processing</i> , by Oppenheim <i>et al.</i> , First Edition, Prentice-Hall, 1989. |
| 1026-1030 | <i>Intentionally left blank</i> |
| 1031 | Plug-and-Play SCSI Specification, Version 1.0, dated March 30, 1994 (“PNP SCSI”) |
| 1032-1040 | <i>Intentionally left blank</i> |
| 1041 | Pucci, M., “Configurable Data Manipulation in an Attached Multiprocessor,” 1991 |
| 1042 | U.S. Patent No. 4,790,003 to Kepley <i>et al.</i> , titled “Message Service System Network” |
| 1043-1051 | <i>Intentionally left blank</i> |
| 1052 | Usenix Declaration |
| 1053 | U.S. Patent No. 5,617,423 to Li <i>et al.</i> |
| 1054 | Declaration of Dr. Erez Zadok in Support of Reply (Zadok II) |
| 1055 | Transcript of Deposition of Mr. Gafford for IPR2016-01839 |
| 1056 | Transcript of Deposition of Mr. Gafford for IPR2016-01842, -01860, -01863, and -01864 |

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.