

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

APPLE, INC.,
Petitioner,

v.

PAPST LICENSING GMBH & CO., KG,
Patent Owner.

Case IPR2016-01843
Patent 6,470,399

**PATENT OWNER PAPST LICENSING GMBH & CO., KG'S
PRELIMINARY RESPONSE UNDER 37 C.F.R. § 42.107**

TABLE OF CONTENTS

I.	STATEMENT OF MATERIAL FACTS IN DISPUTE	1
II.	INTRODUCTION	1
A.	STATEMENT OF RELIEF REQUESTED	1
B.	OVERVIEW OF THE ‘399 PATENT	2
C.	LEVEL OF ORDINARY SKILL IN THE ART	5
D.	CLAIM CONSTRUCTION	7
E.	SUMMARY OF PATENT OWNER’S ARGUMENTS	9
III.	THE PETITION FAILS TO MEET THE REQUIREMENTS FOR INSTITUTING AN <i>INTER PARTES</i> REVIEW	11
A.	THE BOARD SHOULD NOT INSTITUTE TRIAL BASED ON THE PETITION’S REDUNDANT GROUNDS.....	11
B.	THE BOARD SHOULD NOT INSTITUTE TRIAL BASED ON THE PETITION’S CONCLUSORY OBVIOUSNESS COMBINATIONS	14
C.	THE BOARD SHOULD NOT INSTITUTE TRIAL BECAUSE ART IS NOT PRIOR ART.....	18
IV.	CONCLUSION	24

EXHIBIT LIST

Currently Filed – Patent Owner

Ex. No.	Description
2001	Declaration of Dr. Kenneth Fernald
2002	<i>In re Papst Licensing GmbH & Co. Litigation</i> , Case No. 7-cv-493 (D.D.C.), Order Regarding Claim Construction
2003	Defendants' Responsive Claim Construction Brief in <i>Papst Licensing GmbH & Co., KG v. Apple, Inc.</i> (6:15-CV-01095-RWS)
2004	IEEE Standard Signaling Method for a Bidirectional Parallel Peripheral Interface for Personal Computers, IEEE Std 1284-1994

Previously Filed – Petitioner

Ex. No.	Description
1001	U.S. Patent 6,470,399 to Tasler
1002	File History for U.S. Patent 6,470,399
1003	Declaration of Dr. Erez Zadok in Support of Petition for <i>Inter Partes</i> Review of U.S. Patent No. 6,470,399
1004	Curriculum Vitae of Dr. Erez Zadok
1005	<i>Intentionally left blank</i>
1006	<i>Intentionally left blank</i>
1007	<i>The SCSI Bus and IDE Interface Protocols, Applications and Programming</i> , by Schmidt, First Edition, Addison-Wesley, 1995
1008	<i>Intentionally left blank</i>
1009	U.S. Patent No. 4,727,512 to Birkner
1010	U.S. Patent No. 4,792,896 to Maclean
1011	International Publication Number WO 92/21224 to Jorgensen
1012	Small Computer System Interface-2 (SCSI-2), ANSI X3.131-1994, American National Standard for Information Systems (ANSI).
1013	<i>Operating System Concepts</i> , by Silberschatz <i>et al.</i> , Fourth Edition
1014	<i>Microsoft Computer Dictionary</i> , Third Edition, Microsoft Press, 1997.
1015	<i>Intentionally left blank</i>

1016	<i>In re Papst Licensing Digital Camera Patent Litigation</i> , 778 F.3d 1255 (Fed. Cir. 2015).
1017	<i>The Art of Electronics</i> , by Horowitz <i>et al.</i> , First Edition, Cambridge University Press, 1980.
1018	<i>The IEEE Standard Dictionary of Electrical and Electronics Terms</i> , Sixth Edition, 1996.
1019	<i>Webster's Encyclopedic Unabridged Dictionary of the English Language</i> , Random House, 1996.
1020	<i>Papst Licensing GmbH & Co., KG v. Apple Inc.</i> , Case No. 6-15-cv-01095 (E.D. Tex.), Complaint filed November 30, 2015
1021	"Principles of Data Acquisition and Conversion," Burr-Brown Application Bulletin, 1994.
1022	"Principles of Data Acquisition and Conversion," Intersil Application Note, October 1986.
1023	"Sample-and-Hold Amplifiers," Analog Devices MT-090 Tutorial, 2009.
1024	Declaration of Scott Bennett
1025	<i>Discrete-Time Signal Processing</i> , by Oppenheim <i>et al.</i> , First Edition, Prentice-Hall, 1989
1026-1030	<i>Intentionally left blank</i>
1031	Plug-and-Play SCSI Specification, Version 1.0, dated March 30, 1994 ("PNP SCSI")
1032	<i>Intentionally left blank</i>
1033	U.S. Patent No. 4,970,605 to Fogaroli <i>et al.</i>
1034-1045	<i>Intentionally left blank</i>
1046	U.S. Patent No. 5,915,106 to Ard, titled "Method and System for Operating a Scanner Which Emulates a Disk Drive"
1047	U.S. Patent No. 5,303,064 to Johnson <i>et al.</i> , titled "Image Scanner with Calibration Mechanism to Obtain Full Dynamic Range and Compensated Linear Output"
1048	U.S. Patent No. 5,489,772 to Webb <i>et al.</i> , titled "Variable Optical Sampling Rate Dependent on Requested Scan Resolution"
1049	'399 German Application (DE 197 08 755)
1050	'399 German Application Translated (DE 197 08 755)
1051	Foley, <i>Computer Graphics: Principles and Practice</i> , 2d Edition, 1987

I. STATEMENT OF MATERIAL FACTS IN DISPUTE

Petitioner Apple, Inc. (“Petitioner”) did not submit a statement of material facts in its Petition for *inter partes* review. Paper 2 (Petition). Accordingly, no response to a statement of material facts is due pursuant to 37 C.F.R. § 42.23(a), and no facts are admitted.

II. INTRODUCTION

Patent Owner Papst Licensing GMBH & Co., KG (“Patent Owner”) respectfully submits this Patent Owner Preliminary Response under 35 U.S.C. § 313 and 37 C.F.R. § 42.107(a). It is being timely filed on or before January 19, 2017 pursuant to 37 C.F.R. § 42.107(b).

“The Director may not authorize an *inter partes* review to be instituted unless the Director determines that the information presented in the petition filed under section 311 and any response filed under section 313 shows that there is a reasonable likelihood that the petitioner would prevail with respect to at least 1 of the claims challenged in the petition.” 35 U.S.C. § 314(a). Here, institution should be denied because Petitioner has failed to establish that there is a reasonable likelihood that it will prevail on its propositions of unpatentability.

A. STATEMENT OF RELIEF REQUESTED

Pursuant to 35 U.S.C. § 314(a), Patent Owner respectfully requests that the

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.