

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

Microsoft Corporation

Petitioner

v.

Mobile Telecommunications Technologies, LLC

Patent Owner

PTAB Case No. UNASSIGNED

U.S. Patent No. 5,754,946

**PETITION FOR *INTER PARTES* REVIEW
OF U.S. PATENT NO. 5,754,946**

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	Page
EXHIBIT LIST	vi
I. INTRODUCTION	1
II. MANDATORY NOTICES UNDER 37 C.F.R. § 42.8(b)	3
A. REAL PARTY IN INTEREST	3
B. RELATED MATTERS	3
C. NOTICE OF COUNSEL AND SERVICE INFORMATION	3
III. REQUIREMENTS FOR <i>INTER PARTES</i> REVIEW	5
A. GROUND FOR STANDING.....	5
B. FEE FOR <i>INTER PARTES</i> REVIEW	5
C. IDENTIFICATION OF CHALLENGE.....	6
1. Claims Challenged.....	6
2. The Prior Art	6
3. Supporting Evidence Relied upon for the Challenge	6
4. Statutory Grounds of Challenge and Legal Principles	6
5. Claim Construction	7
6. How Claims Are Unpatentable Under Statutory Grounds	7
IV. OVERVIEW OF THE '946 PATENT	8
A. STATE OF PRIOR ART TECHNOLOGIES BEFORE THE '946 PATENT	8
B. PRIORITY DATE OF THE '946 PATENT	9
C. SUMMARY OF THE '946 PATENT.....	9
D. SUMMARY OF PROSECUTION FILE HISTORY.....	10
E. THE CHALLENGED CLAIMS	12
F. LEVEL OF ORDINARY SKILL IN THE ART	15
G. PROPOSED CLAIM CONSTRUCTIONS	16
1. “retransmission”	16

TABLE OF CONTENTS
(continued)

	Page
2. “means for receiving a radio frequency message from the network”	18
3. “means for transmitting, only upon actuation of the switch, a signal to the communications network requesting retransmission of said specified portion of said message”	20
4. “means for receiving said specified portion retransmitted from the communications network and for displaying the received specified portion on the display”	21
5. “means for detecting errors in the received message”	21
6. “means for highlighting said errors when the message is displayed on said display	22
7. “means for transmitting radio frequency signals containing a message to the mobile unit”	22
8. “means for receiving, from the mobile unit, radio frequency signals representing a portion of the message that the user desires retransmission”	23
9. “means for retransmitting radio frequency signals containing the portion of the message to the mobile unit”	23
10. Limitations Regarding a “Portion Of” a Message	24
V. THERE IS A REASONABLE LIKELIHOOD THAT AT LEAST ONE CLAIM OF THE ’946 PATENT IS UNPATENTABLE	24
A. IDENTIFICATION OF THE REFERENCES AS PRIOR ART	24
B. SUMMARY OF INVALIDITY POSITIONS	25
C. DIFFERENT INVALIDITY POSITIONS AGAINST EACH CLAIM ARE INDEPENDENT, DISTINCTIVE, AND NOT REDUNDANT	26
VI. DETAILED EXPLANATION OF GROUNDS FOR UNPATENTABILITY OF CLAIMS 1, 2, 4, AND 7-9 OF THE ’946 PATENT	30

TABLE OF CONTENTS
(continued)

	Page
A. GROUND 3A & 3B: CLAIMS 1, 4, AND 7-8 ARE UNPATENTABLE UNDER 35 U.S.C. § 102(e) and § 103 AS BEING ANTICIPATED AND RENDERED OBVIOUS BY KREBS	30
1. Claim 1 Is Anticipated and Rendered Obvious by Krebs.....	33
2. Claim 4 Is Anticipated and Rendered Obvious by Krebs.....	42
3. Claim 7 Is Anticipated and Rendered Obvious by Krebs.....	42
4. Claim 8 Is Anticipated and Rendered Obvious by Krebs.....	46
B. GROUND 4: CLAIMS 1, 2, 4, AND 7-9 ARE UNPATENTABLE UNDER 35 U.S.C. § 103(a) AS BEING OBVIOUS OVER KREBS IN VIEW OF SCHWENDEMAN AND YOSHIDA	53
1. Claim 1 Is Rendered Obvious by Krebs in View of Schwendeman and Yoshida	55
2. Claim 2 Is Rendered Obvious by Krebs in View of Schwendeman and Yoshida	60
3. Claim 4 Is Rendered Obvious by Krebs in View of Schwendeman and Yoshida	61
4. Claim 7 Is Rendered Obvious by Krebs in View of Schwendeman and Yoshida	62
5. Claim 8 Is Rendered Obvious by Krebs in View of Schwendeman and Yoshida	65
6. Claim 9 Is Rendered Obvious by Krebs in View of Schwendeman and Yoshida	69
VII. CONCLUSION.....	70
CERTIFICATE OF COMPLIANCE.....	72
CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE	73

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

	Page(s)
CASES	
<i>Chi Mei Innolux v. SEL</i> , IPR2013-00065 (PTAB April 30, 2013)	7
<i>In re Freeman</i> , 30 F.3d 1459 (Fed. Cir. 1994)	16, 17
<i>In re Rambus, Inc.</i> , 694 F.3d 42 (Fed. Cir. 2012)	7, 16
<i>KSR International Co. v. Teleflex, Inc.</i> , 550 U.S. 398 (2007).....	49
<i>Mobile Telecommunications Technologies, LLC v. Apple Inc.</i> , 2-13-cv-00258, Case 2:12-cv-00832 (E.D. Tex., Nov. 7, 2014) Dkt. 384	17
<i>Mobile Telecommunications Technologies, LLC v. Microsoft</i> , 2-15-cv-02122 (E.D. Tex. Dec. 31, 2015).....	1, 3
<i>Phillips v. AWH Corp.</i> , 415 F.3d 1303 (Fed. Cir. 2005)	7, 16
STATUTES	
35 U.S.C. § 102	<i>passim</i>
35 U.S.C. § 103	<i>passim</i>
35 U.S.C. § 112	<i>passim</i>
35 U.S.C. § 311	1, 7
35 U.S.C. § 312	3, 7
35 U.S.C. § 313	7
35 U.S.C. § 314	2, 7
35 U.S.C. § 315	5, 7

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.