

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

APPLE INC.,
Petitioner,

v.

LIMESTONE MEMORY SYSTEMS LLC,
Patent Owner.

Case IPR2016-01567
U.S. Patent No. 5,894,441

DECLARATION OF DR. PINAKI MAZUMDER IN SUPPORT OF
PETITION FOR *INTER PARTES* REVIEW

Apple – Ex 1001

TABLE OF CONTENTS

I.	INTRODUCTION	1
II.	BACKGROUND AND QUALIFICATIONS	1
III.	ASSIGNMENT AND MATERIALS REVIEWED	9
IV.	UNDERSTANDING OF THE LAW	10
	A. Anticipation	10
	B. Obviousness.....	10
	C. Claim Construction	12
V.	LEVEL OF ORDINARY SKILL IN THE ART	13
VI.	TECHNOLOGY BACKGROUND.....	14
	A. DRAM Memory Cell	14
	B. Basics of DRAM Architecture	15
	C. An Architectural Snapshot of a Multi-Bank DRAM Chip	17
	D. DRAM Chip Size Growth and Yield	24
	E. Using Spare Memory Cells to Replace Defective Cells	26
	F. Redundancy Techniques for Word Lines.....	30
	G. Redundancy Technique for Bit Lines	34
	H. Redundancy Techniques in Commercial DRAM Devices	35
VII.	THE '441 PATENT.....	36
	A. Background	36
	B. The Admitted Prior Art	39
	C. The Alleged Invention.....	44

VIII.	THE CHALLENGED CLAIMS	51
IX.	PRIOR PROSECUTION	54
	A. Original Prosecution.....	54
	B. <i>Inter Partes</i> Review.....	54
X.	DESCRIPTION OF PRIOR ART	56
	1. U.S. Patent No. 5,265,055 (“Horiguchi”).....	56
	2. U.S. Patent No. 5,126,973 (“Gallia”)	65
XI.	PATENTABILITY ANALYSIS	75
	A. Horiguchi Discloses Each of the Limitations of Claims 6- 12, 14 and 15	75
	1. Horiguchi Anticipates Independent Claim 6	75
	2. Horiguchi anticipates dependent claim 7	86
	3. Horiguchi anticipates dependent claim 8	89
	4. Horiguchi anticipates dependent claim 9	91
	5. Horiguchi anticipates dependent claim 10.....	93
	6. Horiguchi anticipates dependent claim 11	96
	7. Horiguchi anticipates dependent claim 12.....	98
	8. Horiguchi anticipates dependent claim 14.....	100
	9. Horiguchi anticipates dependent claim 15.....	101
	B. Gallia Discloses Each of the Limitations of Claims 6, 7, 9, 11, 12, 14, and 15	102
	1. Gallia anticipates independent claim 6	102
	2. Gallia anticipates dependent claim 7	115
	3. Gallia anticipates dependent claim 9	117
	4. Gallia anticipates dependent claim 11	119
	5. Gallia anticipates dependent claim 12	120
	6. Gallia anticipates dependent claim 14	123
	7. Gallia anticipates dependent claim 15	124

C.	Gallia in view of Horiguchi Discloses Each of the Limitations of Claims 8 and 10	126
1.	Gallia and Horiguchi disclose every limitation of dependent claim 8	126
2.	Gallia and Horiguchi disclose every limitation of dependent claim 10	127
3.	A person of ordinary skill in the art would have been motivated to combine the teachings of Gallia and Horiguchi, rendering claims 8 and 10 obvious.....	130

EXHIBITS

Exhibit #	Exhibit Description
1001	Declaration of Dr. Pinaki Mazumder
1002	Curriculum Vitae of Dr. Pinaki Mazumder
1003	U.S. Patent No. 5,894,441
1004	File History for U.S. Patent No. 5,894,441
1005	U.S. Patent No. 5,265,055 to Horiguchi
1006	U.S. Patent No. 5,126,973 to Gallia
1007	<i>Inter Partes</i> Review No. IPR2016-00094, Petition for <i>Inter Partes</i> Review filed October 27, 2015 (without exhibits)
1008	U.S. Patent No. 5,270,975 to McAdams
1009	Japanese Patent Appl. No. H06-052696 to Minami
1010	<i>Inter Partes</i> Review No. IPR2016-00094, Patent Owner's Preliminary Response filed January 27, 2016
1011	<i>Inter Partes</i> Review No. IPR2016-00094, Decision Denying Institution filed April 12, 2016
1012	U.S. Patent No. 5,956,285 to Watanabe
1013	Masashi Horiguchi et al., <i>A Flexible Redundancy Technique for High-Density DRAMs</i> , IEEE JOURNAL OF SOLID-STATE CIRCUITS, VOL. 26, No. 1, Jan. 1991, at 12-17
1014	U.S. Patent No. 5,267,214 to Fujishima
1015	U.S. Patent No. 5,349,556 to Lee
1016	U.S. Patent No. 5,355,339 to Oh
1017	U.S. Patent No. 5,359,560 to Suh
1018	U.S. Patent No. 5,798,974 to Yamagata

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.