

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

PAR PHARMACEUTICAL, INC.
Petitioner

v.

NOVARTIS AG
Patent Owner

Case IPR2016-_____
U.S. Patent No. 9,006,224

**DECLARATION OF MARK J. RATAIN, M.D. IN SUPPORT OF PETITION
FOR *INTER PARTES* REVIEW OF U.S. PATENT NO. 9,006,224**

CONTENTS

I.	INTRODUCTION AND QUALIFICATIONS	1
II.	UNDERSTANDING OF THE GOVERNING LAW	4
	A. Invalidity by Obviousness	4
	B. Interpreting Claims Before the Patent Office.....	6
	C. Materials Relied on in Forming My Opinions	7
III.	The Person of Ordinary Skill in the Art of the '224 Patent.....	7
IV.	Perspective Applied in This Declaration	8
V.	OVERVIEW OF THE '224 PATENT	9
	A. Disclosure of the '224 Patent	9
	B. Prosecution History of the '224 Patent	12
VI.	CLAIM CONSTRUCTIONS	16
	A. Legal Standard.....	16
	B. “pancreatic neuroendocrine tumor”	17
	C. “advanced tumors”	18
	D. “unit dose”	19
	E. “islet cell tumor”	20
VII.	State of the Prior Art to the '224 Patent	21
	A. The Prior Art Taught Rapamycin and Its Derivatives Were Potent Immunosuppressants and Antitumor Agents	22
	B. The Prior Art Taught the Mechanism of Action for the Immunosuppressant and Antitumor Activity of Rapamycin and Its Derivatives.....	32
	C. Understanding and Classification of NETs.....	36
VIII.	THE PRIOR ART Relied Upon	40
	A. Oberg 2004	40
	B. Boulay 2004	44
	C. O'Donnell.....	46
	D. Tabernero.....	47
	E. Duran	49

IX.	MOTIVATIONS TO COMBINE THE PRIOR ART	50
A.	Motivation to Combine Oberg 2004 with Boulay 2004 and O'Donnell	50
B.	Motivation to Combine Boulay 2004 with O'Donnell and Duran	53
C.	Motivation to Combine Oberg 2004, Boulay 2004, O'Donnell, and Duran with Tabernero	55
X.	GROUNDS OF INVALIDITY	56
A.	Ground 1: Claims 1-3 of the '224 Patent are invalid under 35 U.S.C. § 103 on the ground that they are rendered obvious by Oberg 2004 in view of Boulay 2004 and O'Donnell	56
1.	Claim 1	56
2.	Claim 2	58
3.	Claim 3	60
B.	Ground 2: Claim 2 of the '224 Patent is invalid under 35 U.S.C. § 103 on the ground that it is rendered obvious by Oberg 2004, Boulay 2004, and O'Donnell in view of Tabernero	61
C.	Ground 3: Claims 1-3 of the '224 Patent are invalid under 35 U.S.C. § 103 on the ground that they are rendered obvious by Boulay 2004 in view of O'Donnell and Duran	62
1.	Claim 1	62
2.	Claim 2	64
3.	Claim 3	65
D.	Ground 4: Claim 2 of the '224 Patent is invalid under 35 U.S.C. § 103 on the ground that it is rendered obvious by Boulay 2004, O'Donnell, and Duran in view of Tabernero	66
XI.	Secondary Considerations	67

I, Mark J. Ratain, M.D., resident of Chicago, Illinois, hereby declare as follows:

I. INTRODUCTION AND QUALIFICATIONS

1. I have been retained by Par Pharmaceutical, Inc. (“Par”) to provide my opinion concerning the validity of U.S. Patent No. 9,006,224 (Exhibit 1001; “the ’224 patent”) in support of Par’s Petition for *Inter Partes* Review of the ’224 patent (“’224 Petition”).

2. I graduated from Harvard University *magna cum laude* in 1976 with an A.B. in Biochemical Sciences. I obtained my M.D. from Yale University School of Medicine in 1980. I completed my internship and residency at the Johns Hopkins Hospital in Baltimore, MD from 1980-1983. I completed a fellowship in Hematology/Oncology at the Department of Medicine at the University of Chicago from 1986-1988.

3. In 1986, I joined the Department of Medicine, Section of Hematology/Oncology and Committee on Clinical Pharmacology at the University of Chicago as an Instructor and become a Professor in that department in 1995. In 2002, I became the Leon O. Jacobson Professor in the Department of Medicine, Section of Hematology/Oncology and Committee on Clinical Pharmacology and Pharmacogenomics, and Comprehensive Cancer Center at the University of Chicago.

4. In 1991, I became the Director of the Developmental Therapeutics Program at the Cancer Research Center at the University of Chicago. In 1992, I became Chairman of the Committee on Clinical Pharmacology and Pharmacogenomics at the University of Chicago. In 1995, I became Co-Director of the Clinical and Experimental Therapeutics Program of the Cancer Research Center at the University of Chicago. In 1999, I became the Associate Director for Clinical Sciences at the Comprehensive Cancer Center at the University of Chicago. In 2010, I became the founding Director of the Center for Personalized Therapeutics and Chief Hospital Pharmacologist at the University of Chicago.

5. I have received numerous honors and awards over my career. These include election to the Association of American Physicians in 2007, and awards from multiple institutions (MD Anderson Cancer Center, University of North Carolina, University of Nebraska, University of Utah), foundations (Pharmaceutical Research and Manufacturer's Association of America Foundation) and professional societies (American Association of Pharmaceutical Scientists, American Society for Clinical Pharmacology and Therapeutics, American Society of Clinical Oncology, American College of Clinical Pharmacology).

6. I have also had extensive involvement with the American Society of Clinical Oncology (ASCO), dating back to 1990 when I was appointed Chair of ASCO's Audit and Finance Committee. I was subsequently elected to the position

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.