

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

---

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

---

APPLE INC.,  
Petitioner

v.

IMMERSION CORPORATION  
Patent Owner

U.S. Patent No. 8,773,356

Filing Date: January 31, 2012

Issue Date: July 8, 2014

Title: Method and Apparatus for Providing Tactile Sensations

---

Case IPR2016-01381

---

**PETITIONER'S REPLY TO PATENT  
OWNER'S RESPONSE TO PETITION**

Mail Stop Patent Board  
Patent Trial and Appeal Board  
P.O. Box 1450  
Alexandria, VA 22313-1450

# TABLE OF CONTENTS

	Page
I. INTRODUCTION .....	1
II. The Invention of the '356 Patent .....	2
III. Claim Construction .....	2
A. The Claimed Lookup Table Need not “Contain Associations Between Interactions and Haptic Effect Data” .....	2
B. The Lookup Table Need Not Be “In The Form Of A Table” Under the BRI .....	9
IV. The CHALLENGED Claims are Obvious Under All Proposed Constructions .....	9
A. The record establishes that a LUT is an obvious design choice for many associations disclosed in Rosenberg 737 .....	10
B. A LUT would have been an obvious design choice, even for the dynamic haptic application examples in Rosenberg 737 .....	14
C. Rosenberg 281’s LUT Includes Associations Between Interactions and Haptic Effect Data .....	17
D. PO’s attacks on Petitioner’s expert are without merit.....	19
E. PO’s Expert’s Own Patents Confirms Petitioner’s Positions .....	19
V. Immersion Has Waived All Other Arguments .....	20
VI. conclusion .....	21

## TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

Page(s)

### CASES

<i>Anhydrides &amp; Chem., Inc. v. United States</i> 130 F. 3d 1481 (Fed. Cir. 1997) .....	3
<i>CA, Inc. v. Simple.com, Inc.</i> 780 F. Supp. 2d 196 (E.D.N.Y. 2009) .....	3
<i>In re Fulton</i> 391 F.3d 1195 (2004).....	12
<i>In re Gurley</i> 27 F.3d 551 (Fed. Cir. 1994) .....	11
<i>In re Keller</i> 642 F.2d 413 (CCPA 1981) .....	17, 18
<i>Porto Rico Railway, Light &amp; Power Co. v. Mor</i> 253 U.S. 345 (1920).....	4
<i>Slot Speaker Technologies, Inc. v. Apple Inc.</i> --- F. Appx. ---, 2017 WL 655440 (Fed. Cir. 2017) .....	11
<i>Winner Int'l Royalty Corp. v. Wang</i> 202 F.3d 1340 (Fed. Cir. 2000) .....	12

### OTHER AUTHORITIES

37 C.F.R. § 42.23 .....	1
37 C.F.R. § 42.24 .....	23

## EXHIBIT LIST

Exhibit No.	Description
1001	U.S. Patent No. 8,773,356 (“ <b>356 patent</b> ”)
1002	Declaration of Patrick Baudisch
1003	Immersion’s Preliminary Proposed Constructions
1004	File History of U.S. Patent No. 8,773,356
1005	U.S. Provisional App. No. 60/335,493 (“ <b>First Provisional</b> ”)
1006	U.S. Provisional App. No. 60/399,883 (“ <b>Second Provisional</b> ”)
1007	Certified copy of U.S. Patent Application No. 09/487,737, as filed on January 19, 2000 and as published by the World Intellectual Property Organization on July 26, 2001 (“ <b>Rosenberg 737</b> ”)
1008	WO01/54109, as published by the World Intellectual Property Organization on July 26, 2001 (“ <b>WO 01/54109</b> ”)
1009	U.S. Pat No. 6,429,846 (“ <b>Rosenberg 846</b> ”)
1010	File History of U.S. Patent No. 7,808,488 (the “ <b>488 patent</b> ”), filed as U.S. Pat. App. No. 11/693,117 (the “ <b>117 application</b> ”)
1011	U.S. Pat. App. Pub. No. US2008/0068350 (“ <b>Rosenberg 350</b> ”)
1012	U.S. Pat. App. No. 09/253,132 to Rosenberg (issued as 6,243,078), which is incorporated by reference by Rosenberg 737 (“ <b>Rosenberg 132</b> ”)
1013	U.S. Pat. App. No. 09/103,281 to Rosenberg (issued as 6,088,019), which is incorporated by reference by Rosenberg 737 (“ <b>Rosenberg 281</b> ”)
1014	Newton 2.0 User Interface Guidelines, Apple Press, ISBN 0-201-48838-8, First Printing, May 1996 (“ <b>Newton 2.0</b> ”)
1015	U.S. Provisional App. No. 60/160,401 to Braun et al., which is incorporated by reference by Rosenberg 737 (“ <b>Braun 401</b> ”)
1016	U.S. Pat. App. No. 09/585,741 to Shahoian (“ <b>Shahoian 741</b> ”)
1017	U.S. Pat. No. 5,977,867
1018	U.S. Pat. No. 6,088,019

1019	MPEP 8th ed. 2001, Appendix T Patent Cooperation Treaty
1020	MPEP 7 <sup>th</sup> ed. 1998, Appendix T Patent Cooperation Treaty
1021	MPEP 8 <sup>th</sup> ed. Revised 2004, Appendix T Patent Cooperation Treaty
1022	IPR2016-00807, Paper No. 15, Immersion Corporation's Corrected Patent Owner Preliminary Response
1023	IPR2016-00807, Exhibit 2009, Corrected Declaration of Nathan J. Delson, Ph.D.
1024	Affidavit of Mr. Robert Williams in Support of Motion for Pro Hac Vice Admission; Exhibit to Rob Williams Pro Hac application
1025	Reply Declaration of Patrick Baudisch
1026	U.S. Pat. No. 7,592,999 to Rosenberg et. al.
1027	U.S. Pat. No. 6,002,184 to Delson et. al.
1028	Delson Deposition Tr.
1029	IEEE Dictionary Definition of "lookup table"

# Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

## Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

## Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

## Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

## API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

## LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

## FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

## E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.