

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

---

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

---

General Electric Company,  
Petitioner,

v.

United Technologies Corporation,  
Patent Owner

---

PETITION FOR INTER PARTES REVIEW

OF

U.S. PATENT NO. 7,060,360

Table of Contents

I.	MANDATORY NOTICES .....	1
A.	Real Party-in-Interest .....	1
B.	Related Matters.....	1
C.	Lead and Back-up Counsel and Service Information .....	1
II.	GROUNDS FOR STANDING.....	1
III.	INTRODUCTION .....	2
A.	Technology Overview .....	4
1.	Engine Materials: High-Temperature Oxidation Resistance .....	4
2.	Engine Materials: Environmental Barrier Coatings .....	7
B.	Prosecution History of the 360 Patent.....	9
C.	The 360 Patent Claims .....	12
IV.	STATUTORY GROUNDS FOR THE CHALLENGES .....	14
V.	CLAIM CONSTRUCTION .....	16
A.	“refractory metal disilicide/silicon eutectic” (claim 1 et al.) .....	16
B.	“bond layer” (claims 1, 5, 7, and 9) .....	17
VI.	IDENTIFICATION OF HOW THE CLAIMS ARE UNPATENTABLE.....	18
A.	Overview of the Prior Art.....	18
1.	Terentieva.....	18
2.	Eaton 456 .....	20
3.	Webster .....	21
4.	Suzuki.....	21
B.	Ground 1: Claims 1-14 of the 360 Patent are rendered obvious under 35 U.S.C. § 103 by Terentieva in view of Eaton 456 .....	22
1.	Claim 1 .....	22
2.	Claims 2 and 3.....	30
3.	Claim 4.....	31
4.	Claim 5.....	32

5.	Claim 6.....	33
6.	Claim 7.....	34
7.	Claim 8.....	35
8.	Claim 9.....	35
9.	Claim 10.....	36
10.	Claims 11-14.....	36
C.	Ground 2: Claims 1-14 of the 360 Patent are rendered obvious under 35 U.S.C. § 103 by Terentieva in view of Webster, Suzuki and Admitted Prior Art.....	39
1.	Claim 1.....	39
2.	Claims 2 and 3.....	44
3.	Claim 4.....	44
4.	Claim 5.....	45
5.	Claim 6.....	45
6.	Claim 7.....	46
7.	Claim 8.....	46
8.	Claim 9.....	46
9.	Claim 10.....	47
10.	Claims 11-14.....	47
VII.	CONCLUSION.....	48

**Table of Exhibits**

GE-1001	U.S. Patent No. 7,060,360 to Eaton et al.
GE-1002	Prosecution File History of U.S. Patent No. 7,060,360.
GE-1003	Declaration of Dr. Andreas M. Glaeser Under 37 C.F.R. § 1.68.
GE-1004	Curriculum Vitae of Dr. Andreas M. Glaeser.
GE-1005	U.S. Patent No. 5,677,060 to Terentieva et al.
GE-1006	U.S. Patent No. 6,387,456 to Eaton et al.
GE-1007	A.K. Vasudévan & J.J. Petrovic, <i>A Comparative Overview of Molybdenum Disilicide Composites</i> , Materials Science and Engineering, vol. A155, Nos. 1-2 (Jun. 1992), pp. 1-17.
GE-1008	European Patent App. No. 1142850 A1 to Wang et al. (“Wang”).
GE-1009	U.S. Patent No. 6,517,341 to Brun et al. (“Brun”).
GE-1010	D.R. Clarke & C.G. Levi, <i>Materials Design for the Next Generation Thermal Barrier Coatings</i> , 33 Annu. Rev. Mater. Res., Apr. 18, 2003, pp. 383-417.
GE-1011	K.N. Lee, <i>Current Status of Environmental Barrier Coatings for Si-Based Ceramics</i> , Surface and Coatings Technology, vols. 133-134 (Nov. 2000) pp. 1-7.
GE-1012	N. Bornstein, <i>Oxidation of Advanced Intermetallic Compounds</i> , Journal de Physique IV, vol. 3, No. C9 (Dec. 1993), pp. C9-367-73.
GE-1013	U.S. Patent No. 5,985,470 to Spitsberg et al. (“Spitsberg”).
GE-1014	K.N. Lee et al., <i>Environmental Barrier Coatings for Silicon-Based Ceramics</i> , High Temperature Ceramic Matrix Composites, 4th Int’l Conf. on High Temp. Ceramic Matrix Composites (HT-CMC4), Oct. 1-3, 2001.
GE-1015	R. Gibala et al., <i>Mechanical behavior and interface design of MoSi<sub>2</sub>-based Alloys and Composites</i> , Materials Science and Engineering, vol. A155, No. 1-2 (Jun. 1992) pp.147-158.

GE-1016	Dilip M. Shah, <i>MoSi<sub>2</sub> and Other Silicides as High Temperature Structural Materials</i> , <i>Superalloys</i> (1992) pp. 409-422.
GE-1017	J.-C. Zhao & J. H. Westbrook, <i>Ultra-high-Temperature Materials for Jet Engines</i> , <i>MRS Bulletin</i> , vol. 28, No. 9 (Sep. 2003) pp. 622-626.
GE-1018	M. Tsirlin et al., <i>Experimental Investigation of Multifunctional Interphase Coatings on SiC Fibers for Non-Oxide High Temperature Resistant CMCs</i> , <i>High Temperature Ceramic Matrix Composites</i> , 4th Int'l Conf. on High Temp. Ceramic Matrix Composites (HT-CMC4), Oct. 1-3, 2001.
GE-1019	Nathan S. Jacobson, <i>Corrosion of Silicon-Based Ceramics in Combustion Environments</i> , <i>J. Am. Ceram. Soc.</i> , vol. 76, No. 1 (Jan. 1993) pp. 3-28.
GE-1020	Paul J. Jorgensen et al., <i>Effects of Water Vapor on Oxidation of Silicon Carbide</i> , <i>J. Am. Ceram. Soc.</i> , vol. 44, No. 6 (Jun. 1961) pp. 258-261.
GE-1021	Yongdong Xu et al., <i>Oxidation Behavior and Mechanical Properties of C/SiC Composites with Si-MoSi<sub>2</sub> Oxidation Protection Coating</i> , <i>J. Mater. Sci.</i> , vol. 34, No. 24, pp. 6009-14 (Dec. 1999).
GE-1022	S. Kamakshi Sundaram et al., <i>Molten Glass Corrosion Resistance of Immersed Combustion-Heating Tube Materials in E-Glass</i> , <i>J. Am. Ceram. Soc.</i> , vol. 78, No. 7 (Jul. 1995) pp. 1940-46.
GE-1023	Y. L. Jeng, E. J. Lavernia, <i>Processing of Molybdenum Disilicide</i> , <i>J. Mater. Sci.</i> , vol. 29, No. 10, pp. 2557-2571 (Jan. 1994).
GE-1024	Yoshikazu Suzuki et al., <i>Improvement in Mechanical Properties of Powder-Processed MoSi<sub>2</sub> by the Addition of Sc<sub>2</sub>O<sub>3</sub> and Y<sub>2</sub>O<sub>3</sub></i> , <i>J. Am. Ceram. Soc.</i> , vol. 81, No. 12 (Dec. 1998) pp. 3141-49.
GE-1025	J. D. Webster et al., <i>Oxidation Protection Coatings for C/SiC Based on Yttrium Silicate</i> , <i>J. Eur. Cer. Soc.</i> , vol. 18, No. 16 (Dec. 1998) pp. 2345-50.
GE-1026	J.J. Petrovic et al., <i>Molybdenum Disilicide Materials for Glass Melting Sensor Sheaths</i> , 25th Annual Conf. on Composites, Advanced Ceramics, Materials, and Structures: A, <i>Ceramic Engineering and Science Proceedings</i> , vol. 22, No. 3 (Jan. 2001) pp. 59-64.

# Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

## Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

## Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

## Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

## API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

## LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

## FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

## E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.