

**UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE**

---

**BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD**

---

Prime Focus Creative Services Canada Inc.,

Petitioner

v.

Legend3D, Inc.,

Patent Owner

---

U.S. Patent No. 7,907,793  
IPR2016-01243

---

**PETITIONER'S OPPOSITION TO  
PATENT OWNER'S MOTION TO AMEND**

Mail Stop: PATENT BOARD  
Patent Trial and Appeal Board  
U.S. Patent & Trademark Office  
P.O. Box 1450  
Alexandria, VA 22313-1450

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

|  | <u>Page</u> |
|--|-------------|
| I. THE MOTION TO AMEND IS PROCEDURALLY DEFECTIVE.....  | 1           |
| A. Legend should not be allowed to amend a patent that was<br>procured by inequitable conduct. ....    | 1           |
| B. The amended claims constitute double patenting. ....  | 1           |
| C. Legend did not adequately analyze the prior art. ....   | 2           |
| i. Legend did not consider prior art of record Sandrew. ....   | 2           |
| ii. Legend did not consider known prior art Burt. ....   | 6           |
| iii. Legend did not consider other known prior art. ....   | 8           |
| iv. Legend did not adequately analyze the added<br>limitation in the context of the prior art. ....    | 10          |
| v. Conclusion regarding Legend’s failure to consider the<br>known prior art. ....                      | 10          |
| II. THE AMENDED CLAIMS ARE NOT PATENTABLY<br>DISTINCT .....  | 11          |
| A. All amended claims are anticipated by the ‘081 and ‘670<br>Patents. ....                            | 11          |
| B. Amended claim 21 is anticipated by Burt and is also obvious<br>over Burt in view of Irani ‘96. .... | 12          |
| C. Amended claim 21 is anticipated by and obvious over<br>Odone. ....                                  | 13          |
| D. Amended claims 22-25 are obvious over Odone in view of<br>Szeliski. ....                            | 15          |
| i. Motivation to Combine .....   | 15          |

|   | <u>Page</u> |
|---|-------------|
| ii. Proposed Amended Claim 22 .....   | 17          |
| iii. Proposed Amended Claim 23 .....  | 17          |
| iv. Proposed Amended Claim 24 .....   | 18          |
| v. Proposed Amended Claim 25 .....  | 18          |
| E. Amended claims 22 and 25 are obvious over Odone in view<br>Nielsen.....        | 18          |
| F. Amended claim 26 is obvious over Odone in view Irani '98. ....                 | 19          |
| G. Amended claim 27 is anticipated by and obvious over<br>Sandrew.....            | 20          |
| H. Amended claims 21 and 23 are anticipated by and obvious<br>over Irani '96..... | 20          |
| I. Amended claims 22-25 are obvious over Irani '96 in view of<br>Szeliski. ....   | 22          |
| J. Amended claim 26 is obvious over Irani '96 in view of Irani<br>'98.....        | 23          |
| K. Amended claim 28 is obvious over Odone in view of<br>Sandrew.....              | 23          |
| L. Amended claim 28 is obvious over Irani '96 in view of<br>Sandrew.....          | 24          |

**TABLE OF AUTHORITIES**

**Page(s)**

**Cases**

*Corning Optical Commc'n RF, LLC, v. PPC Broadband, Inc.,*  
Case IPR2014-00441 (PTAB Oct. 20, 2014) ..... 10

*Encyclopaedia Britannica, Inc. v. Alpine Electronics of America,*  
*Inc.,*  
609 F.3d 1345 (Fed. Cir. 2010) ..... 11

*Woodbolt Distribution, LLC v. Natural Alternatives International,*  
*Inc.,*  
Appeal No. 2015-000225, 2015 WL 4455026 (PTAB July 17,  
2015) ..... 12

**Other Authorities**

37 C.F.R. § 42.11 ..... 2

37 C.F.R. § 42.12 ..... 1

MPEP § 1122 III ..... 11

## EXHIBIT LIST

| Exhibit | Description  |
|---------|--|
| 1001    | U.S. Patent No. 7,907,793 (“the ‘793 Patent”)  |
| 1002    | File History for the ‘793 Patent   |
| 1003    | U.S. Patent No. 7,181,081 (“the ‘081 Patent”)  |
| 1004    | U.S. Patent No. 7,333,670 (“the ‘670 Patent”)  |
| 1005    | U.S. Patent Application No. 12/241,992 (“Passmore”)  |
| 1006    | U.S. Patent No. 7,573,475 (“Sullivan”)   |
| 1007    | Declaration of Rob S. Schmitt from Business Wire, Inc. attaching: <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Exhibit 1: “Legend Films Successfully Raise \$5 Million in Venture Capital Funding” (press release)</li><li>• Exhibit 2: “‘Night of the Living Dead’ to Be Released in Color and 3D” (press release)</li></ul>     |
| 1008    | <i>Curriculum Vitae</i> of Dr. David Forsyth   |
| 1009    | CORRECTED DECLARATION of David Forsyth, Ph.D.  |
| 1010    | U.S. Patent No. 7,577,312  |
| 1011    | Article: “ <i>How do 3D firms work?</i> ” available at <a href="http://www.physics.org/article-questions.asp?id=56">http://www.physics.org/article-questions.asp?id=56</a>   |
| 1012    | Book excerpt: <u>Rendering Techniques 2001</u> , edited by Steven J. Gortler and Karol Myszkowski (2001)   |
| 1013    | Article: Matt Sullivan, “ <i>Trick and Treat: Behind the Scenes of the New Nightmare Before Christmas and the 3D Movie Revolution,</i> ” Popular Mechanics, available at <a href="http://www.popularmechanics.com/technology/gadgets/a3607/4200796/">http://www.popularmechanics.com/technology/gadgets/a3607/4200796/</a> . |
| 1014    | Redline of specification from '081 Patent to '793 Patent   |
| 1015    | Redline of specification from '670 Patent to '793 Patent   |

# Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

## Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

## Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

## Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

## API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

## LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

## FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

## E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.