

Filed: May 24, 2017

Filed on behalf of Patent Owner Voip-Pal.com Inc.

By:

Kerry S. Taylor

John M. Carson

William R. Zimmerman (pro hac vice)

KNOBBE, MARTENS, OLSON

& BEAR, LLP

2040 Main Street, 14th Floor

Irvine, CA 92614

Ryan Thomas (pro hac vice)

Ph.: (435) 630-6005

E-mail:

thomasattorney711@gmail.com

Ph.: (858) 707-4000

E-mail: BoxDigifonica@knobbe.com

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

---

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

---

**APPLE INC.**

Petitioner,

v.

**VOIP-PAL.COM, INC.,**

Patent Owner

---

Case No. IPR2016-01198

U.S. Patent 9,179,005

---

**PATENT OWNER OBJECTIONS TO APPLE EVIDENCE  
SERVED WITH PETITIONER'S REPLY**

Pursuant to 37 C.F.R. § 42.64(b)(1), Patent Owner Voip-Pal.com, Inc. (“Voip-Pal”) hereby timely files its objections to the admissibility of evidence served with the Petitioner’s Reply to Patent Owner Response on May 17, 2017 (Paper 34).

<b>Exhibit Number and Description</b>	<b>Objections</b>
<b>Exhibit 1010</b>  Mangione-Smith Deposition Transcript	Completeness, Foundation, Relevance, Misleading ( <b>FRE 106, 602, 401, 402, 403</b> ). Outside Scope of Direct Testimony.  26:20-22 Does not support the contention for which it is cited, and the use of this testimony is misleading and incomplete when taken in isolation, and is used in a misleading manner.  45:8-21 The use of this testimony is misleading and incomplete when taken in isolation, and is used in a misleading manner.  47:25-49:14 Does not support the contention for which it is cited, and the use of this testimony is misleading and incomplete when taken in isolation, and is used in a misleading manner.  100:18-101:24 The use of this testimony is misleading and incomplete when taken in isolation, and is used in a misleading manner.  117:15-19 The use of this testimony is misleading and incomplete when taken in isolation, and is used in a misleading manner.  142:11-143:9 The use of this testimony is misleading and incomplete when taken in isolation, and is used in a misleading manner. Testimony lacked foundation.

<b>Exhibit Number and Description</b>	<b>Objections</b>
	<p>Testimony based on questions outside scope of direct testimony.</p> <p>143:17-144:11 The use of this testimony is misleading and incomplete when taken in isolation, and is used in a misleading manner.</p> <p>150:21-154:1 Does not support the contention for which it is cited, and the use of this testimony is misleading and incomplete when taken in isolation, and is used in a misleading manner.</p> <p>157:22-158:2 Does not support the contention for which it is cited, and the use of this testimony is misleading and incomplete when taken in isolation, and is used in a misleading manner.</p>
<p><b>Exhibit 1011</b></p> <p>Rutter Deposition Transcript</p>	<p>Completeness, Relevance, Misleading (<b>FRE 106, 401, 402, 403</b>)</p> <p>16:14-21:2 The use of this testimony is misleading and incomplete when taken in isolation, and is used in a misleading manner.</p> <p>23:1-22 Does not support the contention for which it is cited, and the use of this testimony is misleading and incomplete when taken in isolation, and is used in a misleading manner.</p> <p>24:15-19 and 25:1-5 The use of this testimony is misleading and incomplete when taken in isolation, and is used in a misleading manner.</p> <p>31:14-32:4 The use of this testimony is misleading and incomplete when taken in isolation, and is used in a misleading manner</p>

<b>Exhibit Number and Description</b>	<b>Objections</b>
<b>Exhibit 1012</b>  Terry Deposition Transcript	Completeness, Relevance, Misleading ( <b>FRE 106, 401, 402, 403</b> )  24:23-25:18 The use of this testimony is misleading and incomplete when taken in isolation, and is used in a misleading manner.  39:21-41:7 The use of this testimony is misleading and incomplete when taken in isolation, and is used in a misleading manner.  59:19-22 The use of this testimony is misleading and incomplete when taken in isolation, and is used in a misleading manner.  60:19-61:17 The use of this testimony is misleading and incomplete when taken in isolation, and is used in a misleading manner.
<b>Exhibit 1013</b>  Perreault Deposition Transcript	Completeness, Relevance, Misleading ( <b>FRE 106, 401, 402, 403</b> )  45:8-46:9 Does not support the contention for which it is cited, and the use of this testimony is misleading and incomplete when taken in isolation, and is used in a misleading manner.  48:22-24 Does not support the contention for which it is cited, and the use of this testimony is misleading and incomplete when taken in isolation, and is used in a misleading manner.  48:25-50:12 The use of this testimony is misleading and incomplete when taken in isolation, and is used in a misleading manner.

<b>Exhibit Number and Description</b>	<b>Objections</b>
	<p>57:18-20 The use of this testimony is misleading and incomplete when taken in isolation, and is used in a misleading manner.</p> <p>59:3-23 Does not support the contention for which it is cited, and the use of this testimony is misleading and incomplete when taken in isolation, and is used in a misleading manner.</p> <p>66:23-67:13 Does not support the contention for which it is cited, and the use of this testimony is misleading and incomplete when taken in isolation, and is used in a misleading manner.</p> <p>79:25-80:21 The use of this testimony is misleading and incomplete when taken in isolation, and is used in a misleading manner.</p>
<p><b>Exhibit 1015</b> Bjorsell Deposition Transcript</p>	<p>Completeness, Relevance, Misleading (<b>FRE 106, 401, 402, 403</b>)</p> <p>25:5-28:6 and 29:2-8 Do not support the contention for which they are cited, and the uses of this testimony are misleading and incomplete when taken in isolation, and are used in a misleading manner.</p> <p>83:15-86:5 and 85:24-86:5 Do not support the contention for which they are cited, and the uses of this testimony are misleading and incomplete when taken in isolation, and are used in a misleading manner.</p> <p>120:12-121:6 The use of this testimony is misleading and incomplete when taken in isolation, and is used in a misleading manner.</p> <p>120:24-122:1 The use of this testimony is misleading and</p>

# Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

## Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

## Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

## Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

## API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

## LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

## FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

## E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.