

IN THE UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

In re Patent of: Aaron B. Sternberg
U.S. Patent No.: 8,894,066
Issue Date: November 25, 2014
Appl. Serial No.: 14/155,013
Filing Date: January 14, 2014
Title: METHOD OF FACILITATING USER PREFERENCE IN
CREATIVE DESIGN OF A CONTROLLER

Mail Stop Patent Board

Patent Trial and Appeal Board
U.S. Patent and Trademark Office
P.O. Box 1450
Alexandria, VA 22313-1450

CORRECTED PETITION FOR *INTER PARTES* REVIEW
OF UNITED STATES PATENT NO. 8,894,066 PURSUANT
TO 35 U.S.C. §§ 311–319, 37 C.F.R. § 42

TABLE OF CONTENTS

I.	<i>Mandatory Notices Under 37 C.F.R. § 42.8(a)(1)</i>	4
A.	<i>Real Party-In-Interest Under 37 C.F.R. § 42.8(b)(1)</i>	4
B.	<i>Related Matters Under 37 C.F.R. § 42.8(b)(2)</i>	4
C.	<i>Designation of Counsel Under 37 C.F.R. § 42.8(b)(3)</i>	4
D.	<i>Service Information Under 37 C.F.R. § 42.8(b)(4)</i>	5
II.	<i>Payment of Fees – 37 C.F.R. § 42.103</i>	5
III.	<i>Requirements for IPR under 37 C.F.R. § 42.104</i>	5
A.	<i>Grounds for Standing Under 37 C.F.R. § 42.104(a)</i>	5
B.	<i>Challenge Under 37 C.F.R. § 42.104(b) and Relief Requested</i>	5
IV.	<i>Summary of the '066 Patent</i>	7
A.	<i>Overview</i>	7
B.	<i>Prosecution History of the '066 Patent</i>	7
V.	<i>Claim Construction under 37 C.F.R. §§ 42.104(b)(3)</i>	10
VI.	<i>Grounds for Rejection</i>	13
A.	<i>Rejections based on Building Robots as primary reference</i>	13
1.	<i>Ground 1 – Building Robots anticipates claims 1-6 and 8</i>	13
2.	<i>Ground 2 – Building Robots renders obvious claims 1-8</i>	21
B.	<i>Rejections Based on Philo as primary reference</i>	24
1.	<i>Ground 3 – Philo anticipates claims 1-6 and 8</i>	24
2.	<i>Ground 4 – Philo in combination with Building Robots renders obvious claims 1-8</i>	30
3.	<i>Ground 5 – Philo in combination with Building Robots and Gasperi's Mindstorms Sensor Input Page renders obvious claims 2-4</i>	31
C.	<i>Rejections Based on Shackelford as primary reference</i>	33
1.	<i>Ground 6 – Philo anticipates claims 1-4, 6 and 8</i>	33
D.	<i>Rejections Based on Anderson as primary reference</i>	39
1.	<i>Ground 7 – Anderson anticipates claims 1-4, 6 and 8</i>	39
2.	<i>Ground 8 – Anderson in combination with Xbox Forums renders obvious claim 8</i>	45
VII.	<i>Conclusion</i>	45

EXHIBITS

- A1 U.S. Patent No. 8,894,066 to Aaron B. Sternberg et al. (“’066 patent”)
- A2 File History of ’066 patent
- B1 *Building Robots with Lego® Mindstorms™: The ULTIMATE Tool for Mindstorms Maniacs!*, by Mario Ferrari, Giulio Ferrari, and Ralph Hempel, published 2002
- B2 Philo’s Home Page, www.philohome.com
- B3 Gasperi’s Mindstorms RCX Sensor Input Page, www.plazaeearth.com/usr/gasper/lego.htm
- B4 U.S. Patent No. 6,443,796 to Shackelford
- B5 U.S. Patent Publication No. 2002/0196250 to Anderson et al.
- B6 Xbox Forums web page from 2005

Rubicon Communications, LP (“Petitioner”) petitions for *Inter Partes* Review (“IPR”) under 35 U.S.C. §§ 311–319 and 37 C.F.R. § 42 of claims 1-8 of U.S. Patent No. 8,894,066 (the “’066 patent”), entitled “Method of Facilitating Preference in Creative Design of a Controller,” which is assigned to Lego Systems A/S (“Patent Owner”). As discussed in further detail below, there is a reasonable likelihood that Petitioners will prevail with respect to at least one claim challenged herein.

I. Mandatory Notices Under 37 C.F.R. § 42.8(a)(1)

A. Real Party-In-Interest Under 37 C.F.R. § 42.8(b)(1)

Petitioner, Rubicon Communications, LP, and Smallworks, LLC are the real parties-in-interest.

B. Related Matters Under 37 C.F.R. § 42.8(b)(2)

Patent Owner filed an action against Petitioner, alleging infringement of the ’066 patent. *Lego Systems A/S v. Rubicon Communications, LP dba Smallworks and Smallworks, LLC*, Case No. 3:15-cv-00823 (VLB) (D. Connecticut), filed June 10, 2015) (“the Litigation”).

C. Designation of Counsel Under 37 C.F.R. § 42.8(b)(3)

Lead Counsel	Backup Counsel
Eric B. Meyertons, Reg. No. 34,876 1120 S. Capital of Texas Hwy. Building 2, Suite 300 Austin, Texas 78746	Chris D. Thompson, Reg. No. 43,188 1120 S. Capital of Texas Hwy. Building 2, Suite 300 Austin, Texas 78746

(512) 853-8888 emeyertons@intprop.com	(512) 853-8877 cthompson@intprop.com
--	---

D. Service Information Under 37 C.F.R. § 42.8(b)(4)

Please address all correspondence and service to counsel at the address provided above.

II. Payment of Fees – 37 C.F.R. § 42.103

The Petitioners authorize the Patent and Trademark Office to charge the fee set out in 37 C.F.R. § 42.15(a) for this Petition and any additional fees that may be required, or credit any overpayment, to Deposit Account No. 501505/5805-04211/EBM.

III. Requirements for IPR under 37 C.F.R. § 42.104

A. Grounds for Standing Under 37 C.F.R. § 42.104(a)

Petitioner certifies that the '066 patent is available for IPR and that Petitioner is not barred or estopped from requesting IPR on the grounds identified herein.

B. Challenge Under 37 C.F.R. § 42.104(b) and Relief Requested

Petitioner requests IPR of claims 1-8 of the '066 patent on the grounds set forth in the table below and requests that each of these claims be found unpatentable.

Ground	'066 Patent Claims	Basis for Rejection
--------	--------------------	---------------------

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.