| UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE                          |
|--|
| BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD                           |
| SAMSUNG ELECTRONICS AMERICA, INC. and SAMSUNG ELECTRONICS CO. LTD. |
| Petitioners,   |
| V.   |
| FASTVDO LLC<br>Patent Owner.                                       |
| U.S. Patent No. 5,850,482<br>Case IPR2016-01179                    |
|  |

SAMSUNG ELECTRONICS AMERICA, INC. AND SAMSUNG ELECTRONICS CO. LTD.'S REPLY TO PATENT OWNER FASTVDO'S RESPONSE



# TABLE OF CONTENTS

|      |             |   | Page(s) |
|------|-------------|---|---------|
| I.   | INTE        | RODUCTION   | 1       |
| II.  | OBV<br>THE  | TVDO'S SOLE CHALLENGE TO THE TOUSNESS OF MOST CLAIMS IS TO CHALLENGE COMBINATION OF KATO'S COMPLEMENTARY SODIMENTS                            | 1       |
|      | A.          | Kato Provides A Reason To Combine Embodiments – Adding Unequal Error Protection To Prevent Error Propagation                                  | 1       |
|      | B.          | In Combining Kato's Embodiments, There Is A Reasonable Expectation Of Success   | 10      |
| III. | CLA<br>OR S | TVDO ALLEGES ONLY ONE<br>IM ELEMENT IS "NOT DISCLOSED<br>SUGGESTED," AN ELEMENT THAT IS OBVIOUS<br>IEW OF KATO'S ERROR-RESILIENT DATA STORAGE | 16      |
|      | A.          | Storage In Kato's Fourth Embodiment   | 20      |
|      | B.          | Storage In Kato's First Embodiment  | 20      |
| IV.  | SEC         | O TEACHES AN "ASSOCIATED<br>OND PORTION OF EACH CODE WORD<br>LUDES INFORMATION REPRESENTATIVE OF  |         |
|      | A RE        | ESPECTIVE PORTION OF THE ORIGINAL DATA"   | 22      |
| V.   | THE         | "DATA LINK" CLAIMS ARE SIMILARLY OBVIOUS  | 24      |
| VI.  | CON         | STITUTIONALITY  | 25      |
| VII. | CON         | CLUSION   | 26      |
| CER' | TIFIC       | ATE OF WORD COUNT   | 1       |
| CER' | TIFIC       | ATE OF SERVICE  | 2       |



# **TABLE OF AUTHORITIES**

| Cases  | Page(s) |
|--|---------|
| Apple, Inc., Requester v. ClassCo Inc., Patent<br>Appeal No. 2015-000186, 2015 WL 187150 |         |
| ClassCo, Inc. v. Apple, Inc.,<br>838 F.3d 1214 (Fed. Cir. 2016)                          |         |
| Pers. Web Techs., LLC v. Apple, Inc.,<br>848 F.3d 987 (Fed. Cir. 2017)                   | 14      |



### **LIST OF PREVIOUSLY FILED EXHIBITS**

Exhibits 1001-1013: Filed and served June 16, 2016 with Petitioner's Petition for *Inter Parties* Review of U.S. Patent No. 5,850,482 (Dkt. 3).

Exhibit 1014: Filed and served November 16, 2016 with Petitioner's Updated Mandatory Notice Under 37 C.F.R. § 42.8(a)(3) (Dkt. 14).

Exhibit 1015: Filed and served February 1, 2017 with the Joint Motion To Terminate Proceedings As To Microsoft Mobile Inc., And Microsoft Corporation (Dkt. 17).

## **OTHER CITED EXHIBITS**

Exhibit 2006: Filed and served March 23, 2017 with FastVDO, LLC's Response (Dkt. 22).

## **LIST OF NEWLY-FILED EXHIBITS**

**Exhibits 1016-1017:** Concurrently filed with this Petitioners' Reply:

| No.  | Description  |
|------|--|
| 1016 | Declaration of Kenneth A. Zeger, Ph.D. in FastVDO LLC v. AT&T Mobility LLC <i>et al.</i> , Case No. 3:16-cv-00385 (Dkt 157-1). |
| 1017 | Transcript of June 2, 2017 Deposition of Kenneth A. Zeger, Ph.D.   |



### I. <u>INTRODUCTION</u>

FastVDO's Response is more notable for what it does *not* say than for what it does say. FastVDO does not dispute that the primary Kato reference teaches or suggests the vast majority of claim elements. Rather, FastVDO focuses on purported shortcomings in Petitioners' presentation of the rationale for combining Kato's embodiments with one another and with the Wei reference. As even FastVDO's expert admitted at his deposition, however, the facts do not necessarily bear out FastVDO's assertions. The challenged claims are obvious in view of Petitioners' proposed combinations.

- II. FASTVDO'S SOLE CHALLENGE TO THE OBVIOUSNESS OF MOST CLAIMS IS TO CHALLENGE THE COMBINATION OF KATO'S COMPLEMENTARY EMBODIMENTS
  - A. Kato Provides A Reason To
    Combine Embodiments Adding Unequal
    Error Protection To Prevent Error Propagation

After spending the bulk of its Response discussing data storage elements found in only three claims (see Section III) FastVDO on page 34 for the first time presents its sole global non-obviousness argument. The central thrust of FastVDO's argument is encapsulated in its statement that "the Petition and Dr. Stevenson propose to incorporate Kato's fourth embodiment into the first embodiment in order to provide a benefit that Kato's first embodiment already possesses." Response at 35. As FastVDO's expert Dr. Zeger later admitted during



# DOCKET

# Explore Litigation Insights



Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

# **Real-Time Litigation Alerts**



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time** alerts and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

## **Advanced Docket Research**



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

# **Analytics At Your Fingertips**



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

#### API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

#### **LAW FIRMS**

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

#### **FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS**

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

#### **E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS**

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.

