

IPR2016-01135
Patent Owner Response
U.S. Patent No. 5,812,789

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

Apple, Inc.
PETITIONER

v.

Parthenon Unified Memory Architecture LLC
PATENT OWNER

Case IPR2016-01135
Patent 5,812,789

Title: VIDEO AND/OR AUDIO DECOMPRESSION AND/OR COMPRESSION DEVICE THAT
SHARES A MEMORY INTERFACE

PATENT OWNER RESPONSE
PURSUANT TO 35 U.S.C. § 316 AND 37 C.F.R. §42.120

TABLE OF CONTENTS

I. INTRODUCTION1

II. STATE OF THE PRIOR ART & THE `789 PATENT2

III. THE CHALLENGED CLAIMS ARE PATENTABLE5

A. Bowes, TMS, and Thomas [claims 1–5 and 12–14]5

1. TMS does not disclose or render obvious “the bus having a sufficient bandwidth to enable the decoder to access the memory and operate in real time when the first device simultaneously accesses the bus.”6

2. Bowes does not disclose “the bus having a sufficient bandwidth to enable the decoder to access the memory and operate in real time when the first device simultaneously accesses the bus.”6

3. Bowes in combination with Thomas does not render obvious “the bus having a sufficient bandwidth to enable the decoder to access the memory and operate in real time when the first device simultaneously accesses the bus.”6

B. Bowes, TMS, Thomas, and Gove [claims 6 and 8]11

C. Bowes, TMS, Thomas, and Ran [claim 7]12

D. Bowes, TMS, Thomas, and Celi [claim 11]12

IV. CONCLUSION13

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

Cases

In re Fine,
837 F.2d 1071 (Fed.Cir.1988) 11, 12, 13

In re Wilson,
424 F.2d 1382 (CCPA 1970)5

Rules

35 U.S.C. § 1031

TABLE OF EXHIBITS

Exhibit No.	Exhibit Description
1001	U.S. Patent No. 5,812,789 (“789 Patent”) ¹
1005	U.S. Patent No. 5,546,547 (“Bowes”)
1007	U.S. Patent No. 5, 001,625 (“Thomas”)
2011	Declaration of Mitchell A. Thornton (Thornton Decl.)
2012	Deposition testimony of Robert Colwell, Ph.D dated February 27, 2017 (“Colwell Depo.”).

¹ Ex. 1001, 1005, and 1007 are already of record and not attached to this Response.

I. INTRODUCTION

The patent owner Parthenon Unified Memory Architecture LLC (“Patent Owner”) hereby submits the following response to the Petition for *Inter Partes* review (“Petition”) filed by Apple, Inc. (“Petitioner”) regarding certain claims of U.S. Patent No. 5,812,789 (“789 Patent”) filed on June 2, 2016 and Decision Granting Institution of *Inter Partes Review* 37 C.F.R. 42.108 issued on December 6, 2016 (“Institution Decision”).

The Board instituted an *Inter Partes* review with respect to the following proposed grounds (collectively “Instituted Grounds”):

1. Obviousness of claims 1–5 and 12–14 under 35 U.S.C. § 103 over Bowes, TMS, and Thomas;
2. Obviousness of claims 6 and 8 under 35 U.S.C. § 103 over Bowes, TMS, Thomas, and Gove;
3. Obviousness of claim 7 under 35 U.S.C. § 103 over Bowes, TMS, Thomas, and Ran; and
4. Obviousness of claim 11 under 35 U.S.C. § 103 over Bowes, TMS, Thomas, and Celi.

For the reasons discussed below, Bowes, TMS, and Thomas do not render claim 1 obvious. Because they depend on claim 1, claims 2–8 and 11–14 are

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.