

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

---

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

---

UNIFIED PATENTS INC.,  
Petitioner,

v.

ADVANCED SILICON TECHNOLOGIES LLC  
Patent Owner

---

Case IPR2016-01060  
U.S. Patent No. 8,933,945 B2

---

**DECLARATION OF JOHN C. HART, PH.D. IN SUPPORT OF PATENT  
OWNER ADVANCED SILICON TECHNOLOGIES LLC'S  
PRELIMINARY RESPONSE**

## I. INTRODUCTION

1. I have been retained by counsel for Patent Owner Advanced Silicon Technologies LLC (“Patent Owner” or “AST”) as an expert to provide this declaration and certain opinions regarding claims 1-3, 9, 10 and 21 of United States Patent No. 8,933,945 (“the ‘945 Patent”). More specifically, I have been asked to form opinions on whether Claims 1-3, 9, 10 and 21 of the ‘945 patent are rendered obvious by certain combinations of prior art references, including European Patent Application No. EP 1 195 717 to Seiler et al. (“Seiler”), U.S. Patent No. 6,864,896 to Perego (“Perego”), and U.S. Patent No. 5,757,385 to Narayanaswami et al. (“Narayanaswami”). All of the opinions and conclusions found in this declaration are my own and I have personal knowledge of all the facts set forth herein. If called to testify, I would competently testify and verify that contained herein.

2. I am being compensated at my hourly rate of \$550. I am also being separately reimbursed for out of pocket expenses. My compensation does not depend in any way on the outcome of these cases or the particular testimony or opinions I express.

3. I understand that Unified Patents Inc. (“Unified”) has filed a petition in this proceeding contending claims 1-3, 9, 10 and 21 of the ‘945 Patent are

obvious over certain multi-reference combinations of Seiler, Perego and Narayanaswami.

## **II. EXPERT QUALIFICATIONS**

4. I have been a professor of computer graphics since 1992. I am currently a tenured Professor in the Department of Computer Science at the University of Illinois at Urbana-Champaign, a department consistently ranked in the top-5 by US News and World Report. I am also the Executive Associate Dean of the Graduate College of the University of Illinois at Urbana-Champaign.

5. I received a Bachelor's of Science degree in Computer Science from Aurora University in 1987, a Master's of Science in Electrical Engineering and Computer Science from the University of Illinois at Chicago in 1989, and a Ph.D. in Electrical Engineering and Computer Science from the University of Illinois at Chicago in 1991.

6. I worked as an intern in 1998 at the IBM TJ Watson Research Center in Hawthorn, New York, and in 1999 at AT&T Pixel Machines in Holmdel, New Jersey. I worked as a postdoc in 1991-1992 at the Electronic Visualization Laboratory at the University of Illinois at Chicago with funding from the National Center for Supercomputing Applications at the University of Illinois at Urbana-Champaign. I worked as a visiting researcher in the summer of 2007 for the Graphics Research Group of Adobe Systems in Seattle, Washington.

7. From 1997-2000, I designed, simulated and patented graphics hardware for Silicon Reality and the Evans & Sutherland Computer Corp. I have also consulted for visual effects companies (e.g., Kleiser-Walczak, Blue Sky VIFX), defense contractors (e.g., SAIC, Pratt & Whitney) and medical imaging companies (e.g., Intrinsic Medical Imaging).

8. My research in computer graphics has been supported by Adobe, DARPA, Intel, Nokia, NVIDIA, NSF and Microsoft. I have published over 75 reviewed papers on computer graphics, including papers in the most rigorous and prestigious venues, including the SIGGRAPH Annual Conference Proceedings, the ACM Transactions on Graphics, and the IEEE Transactions on Visualization and Computer Graphics. From 2002-2008, I was the longest-serving Editor-in-Chief of ACM Transactions on Graphics, the top journal in the field of computer graphics.

9. I was an Executive Producer for the ACM SIGGRAPH documentary “The Story of Computer Graphics” in 1999. I served from 1996-2000 on the ACM SIGGRAPH Executive Committee. I am currently the computer graphics area editor of the ACM Books series, and oversaw the recent publication of “The VR Book: Human Centered Design for Virtual Reality.”

10. I co-authored the book “Real-Time Shading” in 2002 on the implementation of procedural shaders on graphics processors because they became fully user programmable GPU’s. I contributed two chapters to the book “Modeling

and Texturing: A Procedural Approach” in 2002, including a chapter on procedural texturing using rasterization and texturing operations.

11. My CV is attached as Exhibit A.

### **III. MATERIALS CONSIDERED**

12. In forming the opinions set forth in this declaration, I have considered and relied upon my education, knowledge of the relevant field, and experience.

The materials I have reviewed and considered include Unified’s Petition, the ‘945 Patent, its prosecution history, and the prior art cited by Unified.

### **IV. PERSON OF ORDINARY SKILL IN THE ART**

13. The field of the ‘945 Patent is computer graphics hardware. Professionals in the field of computer graphics hardware will generally be electrical engineers, computer engineers, or computer scientists.

14. It is my opinion that a POSITA of computer graphics hardware would have a degree in electrical engineering, computer engineering, computer science, or a related field. Such a person would also have at least 3-5 years' experience working in computer graphics hardware/computer architecture or related fields, or an equivalent combination of graduate education and/or work experience.

15. I meet this criteria and I consider myself a person with at least ordinary skill in the art pertaining to the ‘945 Patent. In addition, I would have been a POSITA at the time of the invention of the ‘945 Patent.

# Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

## Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

## Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

## Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

## API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

## LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

## FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

## E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.