

By: B. Jefferson Boggs, Esq.  
Matthew L. Fedowitz, Esq.  
Daniel R. Evans, Esq.  
MERCHANT & GOULD P.C.  
1701 Duke Street, Suite 310  
Alexandria, VA 22314  
Main Telephone: (703) 684-2500  
Main Facsimile: (703) 684-2501

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

---

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

---

BRECKENRIDGE PHARMACEUTICAL, INC.  
Petitioner

v.

NOVARTIS AG  
Patent Owner

---

Case No. To Be Assigned  
Patent No. 5,665,772

---

**PETITION FOR INTER PARTES REVIEW OF U.S. PATENT NO. 5,665,772  
UNDER 35 U.S.C. §§ 311-319 and 37 C.F.R. § 42.100 et seq.**

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

I.	INTRODUCTION .....	1
II.	MANDATORY NOTICES PURSUANT TO 37 C.F.R. § 42.8 .....	6
	A. Real Party-In-Interest .....	6
	B. Related Matters.....	7
	C. Lead and Backup Counsel.....	7
	D. Service Information .....	8
III.	PAYMENT OF FEES .....	8
IV.	REQUIREMENTS UNDER 37 C.F.R. § 42.104.....	9
	A. Grounds for Standing .....	9
	B. Identification of Challenge and Precise Relief Requested.....	9
	1. Claims for Which <i>Inter Partes</i> Review is Requested .....	9
	2. Statutory Grounds on Which the Challenge is Based.....	10
	3. Evidence Relied Upon to Support the Challenge .....	10
	4. How the Challenged Claims Are to be Construed.....	10
V.	DESCRIPTION OF THE PURPORTED INVENTION.....	11
VI.	PERSON HAVING ORDINARY SKILL IN THE ART .....	13
VII.	TECHNICAL BACKGROUND AND STATE OF THE ART .....	14
	A. Rapamycin Was Known as a Powerful Immunosuppressant with Limited Solubility .....	14
	B. Rapamycin Derivatives at C40 Had Been Synthesized and Shown to Have Immunosuppressant Activity.....	15
	C. Rapamycin’s Interactions With Its Targets Were Known .....	16

D.	Solubility-Enhancing Modifications Were Well-Known .....	20
E.	Standard Assays Were Available to Evaluate Immunosuppressant Activity of Rapamycin Derivatives .....	23
F.	Computer-Aided Drug Design Provided Quantitative Assessment of Modifications to Known Compounds.....	23
VIII.	THE SCOPE AND CONTENT OF THE PRIOR ART.....	24
A.	Morris Teaches that Rapamycin Is a Promising Lead Compound with Limited Solubility .....	24
B.	Rossmann Teaches How to Obtain Three-Dimensional Coordinates from Stereo Diagrams .....	25
C.	Van Duyne Revealed the Structural Interactions Between Rapamycin and FKBP-12.....	26
D.	The Full Coordinates of the Van Duyne Structure Show that C40 of Rapamycin Is the Optimal Position for Modification.....	30
E.	Flexible Side Chains Were Known to Improve Solubility .....	31
F.	The Addition of Solubilizing Substituents Was Well-Known.....	32
G.	Rapamycin Derivatives at C40 Were Shown to Have Immunosuppressant Activity and Were Evaluated in Standard Assays.....	33
H.	Computer-Aided Design Allowed For the Screening of Potential Modifications to Determine Promising Derivatives to Synthesize and Evaluate.....	34
IX.	MOTIVATIONS TO COMBINE THE PRIOR ART REFERENCES.....	36
X.	PRECISE REASONS FOR THE RELIEF REQUESTED .....	37
A.	<u>Ground 1</u> : Claims 1-3 and 10 are Invalid under 35 U.S.C. § 103 on the Ground That They Are Rendered Obvious in View of Morris, Van Duyne, Rossmann, Lemke, and Yalkowsky .....	39
1.	A Person of Ordinary Skill in The Art Would Have	

	Selected Rapamycin as a Lead Compound and Would Have Been Motivated to Improve Rapamycin’s Solubility .....	40
2.	Van Duyne Teaches that Modifications of Rapamycin at the C40 Position Should Not Interfere with Activity .....	41
3.	Yalkowsky and Lemke teach that solubility can be improved with the addition of small, flexible side chains containing solubilizing groups .....	44
B.	<u>Ground 2</u> : Claims 8 and 9 are Invalid under 35 U.S.C. § 103 on the Ground That They Are Rendered Obvious in View of Morris, Van Duyne, Rossmann, Lemke, Yalkowsky, and in further view of Hughes .....	48
XI.	SECONDARY CONSIDERATIONS DO NOT RENDER CLAIMS 1-3 AND 8-10 NONOBVIOUS .....	50
XII.	CONCLUSION.....	51

## EXHIBIT LIST

1001	U.S. Patent No. 5,665,772 (“the ’772 Patent”)
1002	File History for the ’772 Patent
1003	Declaration of William L. Jorgensen, Ph.D. in Support of Petition for <i>Inter Partes</i> Review of U.S. Patent No. 5,665,772
1004	Curriculum Vitae of William L. Jorgensen
1005	Randall Ellis Morris, <i>Rapamycins: Antifungal, Antitumor, Antiproliferative, and Immunosuppressive Macrolides</i> , 6 TRANSPLANTATION REVIEWS 39 (1992) (“Morris”)
1006	Gregory D. Van Duyne <i>et al.</i> , <i>Atomic Structure of the Rapamycin Human Immunophilin FKBP-12 Complex</i> , 113 J. AM. CHEMICAL SOC’Y 7433 (1991) (“Van Duyne”)
1007	Samuel H. Yalkowsky, <i>Estimation of Entropies of Fusion of Organic Compounds</i> , 18 INDUS. & ENG’G CHEMISTRY FUNDAMENTALS 108 (1979) (“Yalkowsky”)
1008	Thomas L. Lemke, <i>Chapter 16: Predicting Water Solubility</i> , REVIEW OF ORGANIC FUNCTIONAL GROUPS 113 (2d ed. 1988)
1009	U.S. Patent No. 5,233,036 (“Hughes”)
1010	U.S. Patent No. 4,650,803 (“Stella”)
1011	U.S. Patent No. 5,100,883 (“Schiehser”)
1012	Stuart L. Schreiber, <i>Chemistry and Biology of the Immunophilins and Their Immunosuppressive Ligands</i> , 251 SCI. 283 (1991) (“Schreiber”)
1013	Joseph B. Moon & W. Jeffrey Howe, <i>Computer Design of Bioactive Molecules: A Method for Receptor-Based de Novo Ligand Design</i> , 11 PROTEINS: STRUCTURE, FUNCTION, & GENETICS 314 (1991) (“Moon”)

# Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

## Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

## Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

## Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

## API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

## LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

## FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

## E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.