

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

Samsung Electronics, Co., Ltd.,
Samsung Electronics America, Inc., and
Samsung Semiconductor, Inc.
Petitioner,

v.

Raytheon Company,
Patent Owner

Case IPR2016-00962

Patent 5,591,678

PATENT OWNER'S OPPOSITION TO MOTION FOR JOINDER

EXHIBIT LIST

<u>EXHIBIT</u>	<u>DESCRIPTION</u>
2001	Defendants' Invalidation Contentions and Disclosures Pursuant to Patent Rules 3-3 and 3-4, October 2, 2015

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	<u>Page(s)</u>
I. BACKGROUND AND RELATED MATTERS	2
II. ARGUMENT OPPOSING JOINDER	4
A. The Petition Was Filed After the One-Year Bar Date	4
B. The Petition is a Serial Petition that Presents the Same Arguments as the 0209 IPR.....	5
C. Samsung has not Demonstrated that Joinder is Appropriate	7
III. CONCLUSION.....	9

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

	Page(s)
CASES	
<i>Initiative for Responsibility In Drug Pricing LLC v. Wyeth LLC</i> , IPR2014-01259, Paper No. 8 (PTAB February 13, 2015)	6
<i>Intelligent Bio-Systems, Inc. v. Illumina Cambridge Limited</i> , IPR2013-00324, Paper No. 19 (PTAB November 21, 2013)	6
<i>LG Electronics, Inc. v. ATI Technologies ULC</i> , IPR2015-01620, Paper No. 10 (PTAB February 2, 2016)	8
<i>Maxlinear, Inc. v. Cresta Technology Corp.</i> , IPR2015-00593, Paper No. 9 (PTAB August 14, 2015)	6, 7
<i>Medtronic, Inc. v. Nuvasive, Inc.</i> , IPR2014-00487, Paper No. 8 (PTAB September 11, 2014).....	6
<i>Medtronic, Inc. v. Robert Bosch Healthcare Systems, Inc.</i> , IPR2014- 00436, Paper No. 17 (PTAB June 19, 2014)	6
<i>Mylan Pharmaceuticals Inc. v. Novartis AG</i> IPR2014-00550, Paper No. 11 (PTAB October 15, 2015).....	8
<i>Mylan Pharmaceuticals Inc. v. Novartis AG</i> IPR2015-00268, Paper Nos 7, 17 (PTAB April 10, 2015).....	7,8
<i>Samsung v. Raytheon</i> , IPR2016-00739, Paper Nos. 1, 4 (PTAB March 10 and 21, 2016).....	3
<i>Sony Corp., et al. v. Memory Integrity, LLC</i> , IPR2015-01353, Paper No. 11 (PTAB October 15, 2015).....	7
<i>Sony v. Raytheon</i> , IPR2015-01201, Paper Nos. 2, 6 (PTAB May 14 and December 3, 2015)	3
<i>Sony v. Raytheon</i> , IPR2016-00209, Paper Nos. 2, 12 (PTAB November 18, 2015 and March 29, 2016)	3, 8

<i>Unified Patents, Inc. v. PersonalWeb Technologies, LLC,</i> IPR2014-00702, Paper 12, 13 (PTAB July 24, 2014).....	5
<i>ZTE Corp. v. Contentguard Holdings Inc.,</i> IPR2013-00454, Paper No. 12 (PTAB September 25, 2013).....	5
STATUTES	
35 U.S.C. 315 (c)	4
35 USC 315(e)(2).....	1
LEGISLATIVE MATERIALS	
157 Cong. Rec. S1376 (daily ed. Mar. 8, 2011)	8
H.R. Rep. No. 112-98, pt. 1 (2011).....	7
CODE OF FEDERAL REGULATIONS	
37 C.F.R. 42.20(c).....	4
37 C.F.R. 42.122(b)	4

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.