

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

H&S MANUFACTURING COMPANY, INC.

Petitioner,

v.

OXBO INTERNATIONAL CORPORATION

Patent Owner.

Case No.: IPR2016-00950

U.S. Patent No. 8,166,739

REPLY TO PATENT OWNER'S RESPONSE

Table of Contents

I.	INTRODUCTION	1
II.	PATENTEE’S PROPOSED CLAIM CONSTRUCTIONS ARE WRONG ..	2
	A. <i>The Use of “Window Merger” in the Preamble Does Not Limit the Claim</i>	3
	B. <i>“Material” Is Not Limited to Either Cut Crops or Cut Hay</i>	7
	C. <i>“Pickup Assembly” Is Not Limited to a Particular Pickup Mechanism or a Particular Kind of Material</i>	9
	D. <i>Patentee Could Have Filed a Motion to Amend Claim 1 to Recite These Narrowing Constructions, But Did Not</i>	12
III.	PATENTEE’S EXPERT TESTIMONY IS FLAWED	12
	A. <i>Chaplin’s Opinions Rely On Patentee’s Narrow Claim Constructions</i>	13
	B. <i>Chaplin’s Testimony Is Incomplete, Inaccurate, Inconsistent and Unreliable</i>	14
	C. <i>Chaplin’s Testimony on Secondary Considerations Should Not Be Considered</i>	17
IV.	PATENTEE DOES NOT OVERCOME THE REASONED RATIONALE FOR COMBINING THE REFERENCES	20
	A. <i>Patentee’s Challenges to the Combination of References All Rely on Narrowed or Non-Existent Claim Limitations</i>	21
	B. <i>Farm Implement Components and Functions Were Known To Be Interchangeable</i>	23
	C. <i>The Problems Addressed by the ‘739 Patent Were Known Problems with a Limited Number of Available Solutions Involving Advantageous Mechanical Rearrangement of Known Components</i>	24
V.	CONCLUSION.....	27

Table of Authorities

<u>Case</u>	<u>Page</u>
<i>Am. Med. Sys., Inc. v. Biolitic, Inc.</i> , 618 F.3d 1354 (Fed.Cir.2010).....	4
<i>Allen Eng'g Corp. v. Bartell Indus., Inc.</i> , 299 F.3d 1336 (Fed.Cir.2002).....	5
<i>Catalina Mktg. Int'l v. Coolsavings.com, Inc.</i> , 289 F.3d 801 (Fed.Cir.2001)	6
<i>Corning Glass Works v. Sumitomo Elec. U.S.A., Inc.</i> , 868 F.2d 1251 (Fed.Cir.1989).....	4
<i>Cuozzo Speed Techs., LLC. v. Lee</i> , 136 S.Ct. 2131 (2016)	2
<i>Dystar Textilfarben GmbH & Co. Deutschland KG v. C.H. Patrick</i> , 464 F.3d 1356 (Fed. Cir. 2006).....	25
<i>Graham v. John Deere</i> , 383 U.S. 1 (1966).....	25, 26
<i>Howmedica Osteonics Corp. Zimmer, Inc.</i> , 640 Fed.Appx. 951 (Fed.Cir.2016).....	4, 5
<i>In re Heck</i> , 699 F.2d 1331,1333 (Fed.Cir.1983)	23
<i>In re Kahn</i> , 441 F.3d 977 (Fed.Cir.2006)	23
<i>In re Kao</i> , 639 F.3d 1057 (Fed.Cir.2011)	18
<i>KSR Int'l Co. v. Teleflex Inc.</i> , 127 S. Ct. 1727 (2007).....	25
<i>Lumenton Holdings, Inc. v. Capella Photonics, Inc.</i> IPR2015-01971, Paper 13 (Oct. 14, 2016)	6
<i>McAfee v. Cap. Co.</i> , IPR2016-00222, Paper 40 (Mar. 2, 2017).....	6
<i>Netcraft Corp. v. Ebay Inc.</i> , 549 F.3d 1394 (Fed.Cir.2008).....	4
<i>On Demand Mach. Corp. v. Ingram Indus.</i> , 442 F.3d 1331 (Fed.Cir.2006).....	3
<i>Pitney Bowes, Inc. v. Hewlett-Packard Co.</i> , 182 F.3d 1298 (Fed.Cir.1999).....	5

<i>Rowe v. Dror</i> , 112 F.3d 473 (Fed.Cir.1997).....	5
<i>R.R. Street & Co. Inc. v. Chemische Fabrik Kreussler & Co. GMBH</i> , IPR2015-00289, Paper 9 (May 26, 2015)	6
<i>Sharp Corp. v. Surpass Tech Innovation, LLC</i> , IRP2015-00021, Paper 44 (Feb. 26, 2016)	12
<i>Superguide Corp. v. DirecTV Enterprises, Inc.</i> , 358 F.3d 870 (Fed.Cir.2004).....	2
<i>Symantec Corp. v. Computer Associates Intern., Inc.</i> , 522 F.3d 1279 (Fed.Cir.2008)	2
<i>Tokai Corp. v. Easton Enters., Inc.</i> , 632 F.3d 1358 (Fed.Cir.2011)	19
<i>Wyers v. Master Lock Co.</i> , 616 F.3d 1231 (Fed.Cir.2010).....	17

Statutes & Rules

37 C.F.R. §41.200(b)	2
----------------------------	---

Other Authorities

MPEP § 2123	23
MPEP § 2144(II).....	25

List of Evidence and Exhibits Relied Upon in the Petition

Exhibit #	Name
1001	U.S. Patent No. 7,310,929 (the '929 Patent)
1002	<i>RESERVED</i>
1003	U.S. Patent No. 8,166,739 (the '739 Patent)
1004	Prosecution History for the '739 Patent
1005	<i>RESERVED</i>
1006	<i>RESERVED</i>
1007	Power of Attorney for Petitioner H&S Manufacturing Company, Inc.
1008	Declaration of Dan Undersander
1009	Declaration of Ralph Shirley
1010	U.S. Patent No. 4,409,780 (Beougher)
1011	U.S. Patent No. 4,932,196 (Schnittjer)
1012	U.S.S.R. Inventor's Certificate No. SU 835359A1 (Zhavoronkin)
1013	U.S. Patent No. 6,205,757 (Dow)
1014	U.S. Patent No. 3,468,107 (van der Lely)
1015	EP Patent Application 0789990A1 (Declementi)
1016	U.S. Patent No. 6,415,590 (Lohrentz)
1017	U.S. Patent No. 5,031,394 (US Honey)
1018	Canadian Patent No. 1151431B (CA Honey)
1019	U.S. Patent No. 6,775,969 (Wuebbels)

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.