

trials@uspto.gov

571-272-7822

IPR2016-00948, Paper No. 36

IPR2016-00949, Paper No. 37

June 23, 2017

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

VALVE CORPORATION,
Petitioner,

v.

IRONBURG INVENTIONS LTD.,
Patent Owner.

IPR2016-00948 (Patent 8,641,525 B2)

IPR2016-00949 (Patent 9,089,770 B2)

RECORD OF ORAL HEARING
Oral Hearing Held: Monday, June 5, 2017

Before PHILLIP J. KAUFFMAN, MEREDITH C. PETRAVICK, and
MITCHELL G. WEATHERLY, Administrative Patent Judges.

The above-entitled matter came on for hearing on Monday, June
5, 2017, at the U.S. Patent and Trademark Office, 600 Dulany
Street, Alexandria, Virginia, in Courtroom B, at 1:00 p.m.

IPR2016-00948 (Patent 8,641,525 B2)

IPR2016-00949 (Patent 9,089,770 B2)

A P P E A R A N C E S

ON BEHALF OF THE PETITIONER, VALVE CORPORATION:

JOSHUA C. HARRISON, ESQUIRE
REYNALDO BARCELO, ESQUIRE
BARCELO, HARRISON & WALKER, LLP
2901 West Coast Highway
Suite 200
Newport Beach, California 92663
(949) 340-9736

ON BEHALF OF THE PATENT OWNER, IRONBURG
INVENTIONS LTD.:

EHAB SAMUEL, ESQUIRE
YASSER M. EL-GAMAL, ESQUIRE
MANATT, PHELPS & PHILLIPS, LLP
695 Town Center Drive
Fourteenth Floor
Costa Mesa, California 92626
(714) 338-2740

1 PROCEEDINGS

2 JUDGE KAUFFMAN: Thank you. Please be seated.

3 Give us just a minute to get started.

4 Petitioner, would you please kindly introduce
5 yourself and anyone else from your party that you would like
6 to introduce for today?

7 MR. HARRISON: Yes, Your Honor. Joshua Harrison
8 for Petitioner Valve, and with me is my partner, Reynaldo
9 Barcelo, also for Petitioner Valve, lead and backup counsel
10 in this case.

11 JUDGE KAUFFMAN: Thank you, Mr. Harrison.

12 And, Patent Owner, the same, please.

13 MR. SAMUEL: My name is Ehab Samuel on behalf of
14 the Patent Owner, as well as with me, cocounsel, Yasser
15 El-Gamal, on behalf of the Patent Owner.

16 JUDGE KAUFFMAN: Thank you.

17 Mr. Samuel, did you give one of your business
18 cards to the court reporter?

19 MR. SAMUEL: Yes, Your Honor.

20 JUDGE KAUFFMAN: And, Mr. Harrison.

21 MR. HARRISON: Yes.

22 JUDGE KAUFFMAN: And are you able to hear me okay?

1 THE REPORTER: Yes.

2 JUDGE KAUFFMAN: Thank you.

3 We are going to make one transcript for both
4 cases, and that entire transcript will be entered in each
5 case. So if you would, please, be careful today to -- if
6 something applies to just one of them, make sure which one it
7 applies to.

8 I also find the transcript very helpful when
9 writing the final written decision, and so I would like for
10 you to please, if you're talking about Slide 8, tell me
11 you're on Slide 8. Now I'm on Slide 9.

12 That makes it much more useful to put that
13 together with the exhibits and see what you're talking about.
14 So I will get the most out of what you're saying if you would
15 do that for me, please.

16 Each side has their time, and unlike in a
17 courtroom, we're not going to interrupt each other. If you
18 have an issue with something the other party is saying, then
19 we can talk about that afterwards, but please, no
20 interrupting each other.

21 Petitioner, how would you like to divide your time
22 today?

1 MR. HARRISON: Well, Your Honor, you had mentioned
2 on our last call that there were going to be some issues that
3 we discuss ahead of time that don't go against time.

4 JUDGE KAUFFMAN: There are.

5 MR. HARRISON: In the case in chief, I would
6 probably end up reserving half of my time for rebuttal,
7 depending on how it goes. If there's a lot of questions from
8 the Board, you know, I might end up reserving less than half
9 the time for rebuttal.

10 JUDGE KAUFFMAN: So you would like to reserve 30?

11 MR. HARRISON: Yes.

12 JUDGE KAUFFMAN: Okay. There are a couple issues
13 we're going to talk about today. We had a call on the 2nd of
14 June, and we discussed supplemental information and
15 objections to the slides. There won't be a separate order
16 about that call. Our discussion today will cover that.

17 So what I'd like to do first is for Mr. Samuel to
18 tell us what he's asking for regarding supplemental
19 information, and then we'll deal with the slide objections.

20 MR. SAMUEL: Sure. Thank you, Your Honor.

21 May I approach?

22 JUDGE KAUFFMAN: Please.

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.