

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

LUPIN LTD. AND LUPIN PHARMACEUTICALS INC.,
Petitioner

v.

HORIZON THERAPEUTICS, INC.,
Patent Owner

Case IPR 2016-00829
Patent 9,095,559

**PATENT OWNER HORIZON THERAPEUTICS, INC.'S
PRELIMINARY RESPONSE**

TABLE OF CONTENTS

I. INTRODUCTION 1

II. BACKGROUND 1

III. SUMMARY OF ARGUMENT 2

IV. LEVEL OF ORDINARY SKILL IN THE ART AND CLAIM CONSTRUCTION 4

 A. Level of Ordinary Skill in the Art 4

 B. Claim Construction 5

V. THE PETITION FAILS TO DEMONSTRATE A REASONABLE LIKELIHOOD THAT ANY CHALLENGED CLAIM IS UNPATENTABLE 7

 A. The '559 Patent Claims Recite an Upper Limit for Drug Adjustment 7

 B. Ground 1 of the Petition Should Be Denied 11

 1. The '859 Publication Teaches Away from Adjusting the Dosage of Nitrogen Scavenging Medication Based on Plasma Ammonia Levels 12

 2. The '859 Publication Teaches Away from Relying on a Single Fasting Plasma Ammonia Level in Making a Dosing Decision 14

 3. The '859 Publication Teaches Away from Increasing the Dosage of Nitrogen Scavenging Medication based on a Fasting Plasma Ammonia Level Less than the ULN but Greater than Half the ULN 15

 4. The '859 Publication Does Not Teach Comparison of Fasting Plasma Ammonia Levels to the ULN 19

 5. Simell and Blau Fail to Cure the Deficiencies of the '859 Publication 20

 C. Ground 2 of the Petition Should be Denied 24

1.	The Petition Does Not Provide a Basis on which the Board Could Find Claim 3 Obvious	24
2.	Brusilow '84 Fails to Cure the Deficiencies of the '859 Publication	27
3.	The Petition Does Not Provide a Basis on which the Board Could Find Claim 6 Obvious	31
VI.	THE PETITION SHOULD BE REJECTED UNDER 35 U.S.C. § 325(D).....	33
VII.	THE PETITION SHOULD BE DENIED FOR VIOLATING 37 C.F.R. §§ 42.104(B)(4) AND 42.22(A)(2).....	34
VIII.	CONCLUSION.....	41

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

Cases

<i>Apotex Inc. v. Wyeth LLC</i> , IPR2015-00873, Paper 8 (PTAB Sept. 16, 2015)	40
<i>C.R. Bard, Inc. v. Medical Components, Inc.</i> , IPR2016-01660, Paper 9 (PTAB February 9, 2016).....	35
<i>Cisco Systems Inc. v. C-CATION Techs., Inc.</i> , IPR2014-00454, Paper 12 (PTAB Aug. 29, 2014)	35
<i>Excelsior Med. Corp. v. Lake</i> , IPR2013-00494, Paper 10 (PTAB Feb. 6, 2014)	34
<i>Hospitality Core Services LLC v. Nomadix, Inc.</i> , 2016 WL 2909164 (PTAB Apr. 27, 2016).....	5
<i>In re Am. Acad. of Sci. Tech. Ctr.</i> , 367 F.3d 1359 (Fed. Cir. 2004).....	39
<i>In re Bigio</i> , 381 F.3d 1320 (Fed Cir. 2004)	5
<i>In re Paulsen</i> , 30 F.3d 1475 (Fed. Cir. 1994).....	6
<i>In re Translogic Tech., Inc.</i> , 504 F.3d 1249 (Fed. Cir. 2007).....	5
<i>In re Van Geuns</i> , 988 F.2d 1181 (Fed. Cir. 1993)	6
<i>Integrated Global Concepts v. J2 Global, Inc.</i> , IPR2014-01028, Paper 13 (PTAB Dec. 22, 2014).....	34
<i>Merial Ltd. v. Virbac</i> , IPR2014-01279, Paper 13 (PTAB Jan. 22, 2015).....	34
<i>Tissue Transplant Tech. Ltd. et al. v. Mimedx Group, Inc.</i> , IPR2015-00320, Paper 13 (PTAB June 29, 2015).....	40

Zimmer Biomet Holdings, Inc. v. Four Mile Bay, LLC,
IPR2016-00011, Paper 8 (PTAB Apr. 1, 2016)35

Statutes

35 U.S.C. § 103(a) 12, 24
35 U.S.C. § 3131
35 U.S.C. § 314(a)7
35 U.S.C. § 325(d)33

Other Authorities

Office Patent Trial Practice Guide, 77 Fed. Reg. 48,756 (Aug. 14, 2012)35

Rules

37 C.F.R. § 42.104(b)(4)..... 34, 39
37 C.F.R. § 42.1071
37 C.F.R. § 42.22(a)(2) 34, 39, 40

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.