

IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
FOR THE DISTRICT OF DELAWARE

ENZO LIFE SCIENCES, INC.,)	
)	
Plaintiff.)	
)	
v.)	C.A. No. 12-104-LPS
)	
GEN-PROBE, INCORPORATED,)	
)	
Defendant.)	
_____)	
ENZO LIFE SCIENCES, INC.,)	
)	
Plaintiff.)	
)	
v.)	C.A. No. 12-105-LPS
)	
LIFE TECHNOLOGIES,)	
CORPORATION,)	
)	
Defendant.)	
_____)	
ENZO LIFE SCIENCES, INC.,)	
)	
Plaintiff.)	
)	
v.)	C.A. No. 12-106-LPS
)	
ROCHE MOLECULAR SYSTEMS, INC.,)	
et al.,)	
)	
Defendants.)	
_____)	
ENZO LIFE SCIENCES, INC.,)	
)	
Plaintiff.)	
)	
v.)	C.A. No. 12-274-LPS
)	
ABBOTT LABORATORIES, et al.,)	
)	
Defendants.)	
_____)	

ENZO LIFE SCIENCES, INC.,)
)
Plaintiff.)

v.)

C.A. No. 12-275-LPS

BECTON, DICKINSON AND COMPANY;)
et al.,)
)
Defendants.)

ENZO LIFE SCIENCES, INC.,)
)
Plaintiff.)

v.)

C.A. No. 12-276-LPS

HOLOGIC, INC.,)
)
Defendant.)

ENZO LIFE SCIENCES, INC.,)
)
Plaintiff.)

v.)

C.A. No. 12-433-LPS

AFFYMETRIX, INC.,)
)
Defendant.)

ENZO LIFE SCIENCES, INC.,)
)
Plaintiff.)

v.)

C.A. No. 12-434-LPS

AGILENT TECHNOLOGIES, INC.,)
)
Defendant.)

ENZO LIFE SCIENCES, INC.,)
)
Plaintiff.)

v.)

C.A. No. 12-435-LPS

ILLUMINA, INC.,)
)
Defendant.)

ENZO LIFE SCIENCES, INC.,)
)
Plaintiff.)

v.)

C.A. No. 12-505-LPS

SIEMENS HEALTHCARE DIAGNOSTICS,)
INC.,)
)
Defendant.)

Brian E. Farnan, FARNAN LLP, Wilmington, DE
John M. Desmarais, Michael P. Stadnick, Jordan Malz, Justin P.D. Wilcox, Peter C. Magic,
Joseph C. Akalski, Jessica A. Martinez, Danielle A. Shultz, DESMARAIS LLP, New York, NY

Attorneys for Plaintiff.

Karen L. Pascale, Pilar G. Kraman, YOUNG CONAWAY STARGATT & TAYLOR LLP,
Wilmington, DE
Matthew M. Wolf, ARNOLD & PORTER LLP, Washington, DC
Jennifer Sklenar, Wallace Wu, ARNOLD & PORTER LLP, Los Angeles, CA

Attorneys for Defendants Hologic, Inc. and Gen-Probe Incorporated

Jack B. Blumenfeld, Karen Jacobs, Michael J. Flynn, MORRIS, NICHOLS, ARSHT &
TUNNELL LLP, Wilmington, DE
Ron E. Shulman, Terry Kearney, Michael R. Seringhaus, LATHAM & WATKINS LLP, Menlo
Park, CA
Jennifer R. Saionz, LATHAM & WATKINS LLP, New York, NY
Ryan R. Owens, LATHAM & WATKINS LLP, Costa Mesa, CA
Jennifer Koh, LATHAM & WATKINS LLP, San Diego, CA
Katherine Nolan-Stevaux, THERMO FISHER SCIENTIFIC INC., Foster City, CA

Attorneys for Defendant Life Technologies Corporation

Frederick L. Cottrell, III, Katharine C. Lester, RICHARDS, LAYTON & FINGER, P.A.,
Wilmington, DE
William G. McElwain, Jamie T. Wisz, WILMER CUTLER PICKERING HALE AND DORR
LLP, Washington, DC
Robert J. Gunther, Jr., Jane M. Love, PhD., Omar Khan, Christopher R. Noyes, WILMER
CUTLER PICKERING HALE AND DORR LLP, New York, NY
Gregory P. Teran, WILMER CUTLER PICKERING HALE AND DORR LLP, Boston, MA
William W. Kim, WILMER CUTLER PICKERING HALE AND DORR LLP, Palo Alto, CA

Attorneys for Defendants Becton, Dickinson and Company, Becton Dickinson
Diagnostics Inc., and Geneohm Sciences, Inc., Roche Molecular Systems, Inc., Roche
Diagnostics Operations, Inc., Roche Diagnostics Corporation, and Roche NimbleGen,
Inc.

Richard L. Horwitz, David E. Moore, Bindu A. Palapura, POTTER ANDERSON & CORROON
LLP, Wilmington, DE
James F. Hurst, Maureen Rurka, Elizabeth Thompson, WINSTON & STRAWN LLP, Chicago,
IL
Melinda Lackey, WINSTON & STRAWN LLP, Houston, TX

Attorneys for Defendants Abbott Laboratories and Abbott Molecular Inc.

Denise S. Kraft, Brian A. Biggs, DLA PIPER LLP, Wilmington, DE
John Guaragna, Aaron G. Fountain, DLA PIPER, Austin, TX
Stanley Panikowski, Erica Pascal, DLA PIPER, San Diego, CA

Attorneys for Intervenor-Defendant and Counterclaim-Plaintiff Luminex Corporation

Jack B. Blumenfeld, Maryellen Noreika, Derek J. Fahnestock, MORRIS, NICHOLS, ARSHT &
TUNNELL LLP, Wilmington, DE
Michael J. Malecek, Peter E. Root, Sean M. Boyle, KAYE SCHOLER LLP, Palo Alto, CA

Attorneys for Defendant Affymetrix Inc.

Jack B. Blumenfeld, Maryellen Noreika, Derek J. Fahnestock, Paul Saindon, Ethan H.
Townsend, MORRIS, NICHOLS, ARSHT & TUNNELL LLP, Wilmington, DE

Attorneys for Defendant Agilent Technologies, Inc.

Steven J. Balick, Lauren E. Maguire, ASHBY & GEDDES, Wilmington, DE
Kevin M. Flowers, Mark H. Izraelewicz, Cullen N. Pendleton, Amanda K. Antons,
MARSHALL, GERSTEIN & BORUN LLP, Chicago, IL

Attorneys for Defendant Illumina, Inc.

Jack B. Blumenfeld, Derek J. Fahnestock, MORRIS, NICHOLS, ARSHT & TUNNELL LLP,
Wilmington, DE
Nagendra Setty, George L. Kanabe, ORRICK, HERRINGTON & SUTCLIFFE LLP, San
Francisco, CA
Anthony C. Kuhlmann, ORRICK, HERRINGTON & SUTCLIFFE LLP, Irvine, CA
Ryan C. Micallef, ORRICK, HERRINGTON & SUTCLIFFE LLP, New York, NY

Attorneys for Defendants Siemens Healthcare Diagnostics Inc.

MEMORANDUM OPINION

July 7, 2015
Wilmington, Delaware

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.