		Page 272
1	IN THE UNITED STATES	DISTRICT COURT
	FOR THE EASTERN DIS	TRICT OF TEXAS
2	MARSHALL DI	VISION
3	MOBILE TELECOMMUNICATIONS	)
	TECHNOLOGIES, LLC	)
4		) Civil Action No.
	v.	) 2:12-cv-832-JRG-RSP
5		) (Lead Case)
	SPRINT NEXTEL CORPORATION	)
6	MOBILE TELECOMMUNICATIONS	)
7	TECHNOLOGIES, LLC	)
8	v.	) Civil Action No.
•		) 2:13-cv-259-JRG-RSP
9	SAMSUNG TELECOMMUNICATIONS	)
1.0	AMERICA, LLC	)
10	MOBILE TELECOMMUNICATIONS	)
11	TECHNOLOGIES, LLC	
12	V.	) Civil Action No.
1 2		) 2:13-cv-258-JRG-RSP
13	APPLE INC.	)
14		
15	VIDEOTAPED DEP	OSTTION OF
16	WILLIAM	
17	HELD ON APRIL	
18	VOLUME	
19		
20		
21		
22		
23		
24	JOB NO.1830156	
25	PAGES 272 - 446	

Г

DOCKET A L A R M Veritext National Deposition & Litigation Services 866 299-5127

2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24 25	VIDEOTAPED DEPOSITION of WILLIAM HAYS, produced as a witness at the instance of the Defendant, Samsung Telecommunications America, LLC, and duly sworn, was taken in the above-styled and numbered cause on Tuesday, the 1st day of April, 2014, from 8:55 a.m. to 2:36 p.m., before Steven Stogel, CSR, CLR, in and for the State of Texas, reported by machine shorthand, at the offices of Reed & Scardino, LLP, 301 Congress Avenue, Suite 1250, Austin, Texas, pursuant to the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure; that the Witness will read the deposition.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24 25	PAGE APPEARANCES
	Page 273		Page 275
1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24	A P P E A R A N C E S COUNSEL FOR PLAINTIFF: Mr. Dustin L. Taylor - and - Mr. Steven Tepera REED & SCARDINO, LLP 301 Congress Avenue, Suite 1250 Austin, Texas 78701 Phone: 512.474.2449 Email: dtaylor@reedscardino.com stepera@reedscardino.com COUNSEL FOR DEFENDANT, Samsung Telecommunications America, LLC: Mr. Rick Taché - and - Mr. Erikson C. Squier GREENBERG TRAURIG, LLP 3161 Michelson Drive, Suite 1000 Irvine, California 92612 Phone: 949.732.6500 Email: tacher@gtlaw.com squiere@gtlaw.com squiere@gtlaw.com COUNSEL FOR DEFENDANT, Apple Inc.: Mr. Anish Desai - and - Mr. Christopher T. Marando WEIL, GOTSHAL & MANGES LLP 1300 Eye Street, NW, Suite 900 Washington, D.C. 20005 Phone: 202.682.7000 Email: anish.desai@weil.com christopher.marando@weil.com CVIDEOGRAPHER: Mr. Dane Depinho	1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24 25	EXHIBITS FOR IDENTIFICATIONNUMBERDESCRIPTIONPAGEExhibit 15Australian Patent288No. AU-A-79030/87299Exhibit 16"Predicting the Range and299Throughput of Mobile Data Systems" by P.J. Mabey361Exhibit 17US Patent No. 5,659,891361Exhibit 1811/17/94 Interoffice377Memorandum from William Hays to Candy Hunt382Exhibit 1911/17/94 Interoffice382Memorandum from William Hays to Candy Hunt383Exhibit 20US Patent No. 5,786,748383Exhibit 2111/17/94 Interoffice385 Memorandum from William Hays to Candy HuntExhibit 222/17/95 Interoffice Memo from389 Dinesh ShethExhibit 23US Patent No. 4,644,351404
25		25	

Veritext National Deposition & Litigation Services 866 299-5127

**DOCKET A L A R M** Find authenticated court documents without watermarks at <u>docketalarm.com</u>.

~	P R O C E E D I N G S	1	electrical engineering? 08:57	
2	THE VIDEOGRAPHER: Good morning. We 08:5	52	MR. TAYLOR: Objection; form. 08:5	7
3	are on the record at 8:55 a.m. on April 1st, 2014. 08:55	3	A. Actually, I've known many technical people	8:57
4	This is the video reported deposition of William 08:55	4	who didn't have degrees, so my answer would be no.	08:57
5	Hays, Volume 2. My name is Dane Depinho, here with 08:55	5	BY MR. TACHÉ: 08:57	
б	our court reporter, Steve Stogel. We are here from 08:55	6	Q. What would you think would be the minimum	08
7	Veritext Legal Solutions at the request of counsel 08:55	7	educational background that one would need to be	08:
8	for the defendant. 08:55	8	considered one skilled in the art of the invention	08:57
9	This deposition is being held at 301 08:55	9	that's the subject of the '428 patent? 08:57	7
10	Congress in Austin, Texas. The caption of this case 08:55	10	MR. TAYLOR: Objection; form. 08:5	7
11	is MTEL versus Samsung, et al., Case 08:55	11	A. You know, again, I look to the founders of 08	:57
12	No. 2:12-CV-832-JRG-RSP. 08:56	12	Apple, for example. The people had very little 08	:57
13	Please note that audio and video 08:56	13	education and they did quite well, so I'm really not 08	8:57
14	recording will take place unless all parties agree 08:56	14	in a position to judge that. 08:58	
15	to go off the record. Microphones are sensitive and 08:56	15	BY MR. TACHÉ: 08:58	
16	may pick up whispers and private conversations and 08:56	16	Q. From your perspective, if one didn't have	08:58
17	cellular interference. 08:56	17	a four-year degree or an equivalent from a well	08:58
18	I am not authorized to administer an 08:56	18		8:58
19	oath. I am not related to any party in this action, 08:56	19	equivalent that you would consider to have as a base	08:5
20	nor am I financially interested in the outcome in 08:56	20		8:58
21	any way. 08:56	21	MR. TAYLOR: Objection; form. 08:5	
22	May I please have an agreement from 08:56	22	A. Again, I really can't comment on that. 08:55	
23	all parties that we can proceed? 08:56	23		, 8:58
24	MR. TACHÉ: Yes. 08:56	23		8.58 18:58
25	MR. TAYLOR: Yes. 08:56	24	can't I can't be certain of what that would be. 08:5	
	Page 277		Page	279
	1050 277			
1	THE VIDEOGRAPHER: At this time, will 08:56	1	BY MR. TACHÉ: 08:58	
2	counsel and all present please identify themselves 08:56	2	Q. Let's take your scenario, then. Assuming	08:58
3	for the record? 08:56	3	that you were going to hire someone at MTEL, what	08
4	MR. TAYLOR: Dustin Taylor and Steven 08:56	4	would the requirements be from an educational	08:5
5	Tepera from Reed & Scardino on behalf of the08:56	5	perspective and a work experience perspective?	08:58
6	plaintiff, MTEL. 08:56	6	A. We would ask for them to have a work 08	:58
Ŭ				
7	MR. TACHÉ: Rick Taché and Erik 08:56	7	history in this industry, and we would add the words	08:58
	MR. TACHÉ: Rick Taché and Erik 08:56 Squier from Greenberg Traurig on behalf of Samsung. 08:5		history in this industry, and we would add the words "or equivalent." 08:59	08:58
7			"or equivalent." 08:59	08:58 <b>08:59</b>
7 8	Squier from Greenberg Traurig on behalf of Samsung. 08:5	58	"or equivalent." 08:59	
7 8 9	Squier from Greenberg Traurig on behalf of Samsung. 08:5 THE VIDEOGRAPHER: Thank you. 08:56	58 9	"or equivalent." 08:59 Q. And define, from your perspective, what	08:59
7 8 9 10	Squier from Greenberg Traurig on behalf of Samsung. 08:55 THE VIDEOGRAPHER: Thank you. 08:56 MR. DESAI: Anish Desai and Chris 08:56	5 8 9 10	"or equivalent." 08:59 Q. And define, from your perspective, what the industry would be. 08:59	<b>08:59</b> 59
7 8 9 10 11	Squier from Greenberg Traurig on behalf of Samsung.08:56THE VIDEOGRAPHER: Thank you.08:56MR. DESAI: Anish Desai and Chris08:56Marando from Weil Gotshal on behalf of Apple.08:56	5 8 9 10 11	"or equivalent." 08:59   Q. And define, from your perspective, what   the industry would be. 08:59   A. Well, that's why we'd keep it very broad. 08:31	<b>08:59</b> 59
7 8 9 10 11 12	Squier from Greenberg Traurig on behalf of Samsung.08:55THE VIDEOGRAPHER:Thank you.08:56MR. DESAI:Anish Desai and Chris08:56Marando from Weil Gotshal on behalf of Apple.08:56WILLIAM HAYS,08:56	5 8 9 10 11 12	"or equivalent." 08:59   Q. And define, from your perspective, what   the industry would be. 08:59   A. Well, that's why we'd keep it very broad. 08:   I don't think we'd zero in on the degree of it. I 08:59	<b>08:59</b> 59 9 59
7 8 9 10 11 12 13	Squier from Greenberg Traurig on behalf of Samsung.08:55THE VIDEOGRAPHER:Thank you.08:56MR. DESAI:Anish Desai and Chris08:56Marando from Weil Gotshal on behalf of Apple.08:56WILLIAM HAYS,08:56having been previously sworn, continued to testify08:56	5 8 9 10 11 12 13	"or equivalent." 08:59   Q. And define, from your perspective, what   the industry would be. 08:59   A. Well, that's why we'd keep it very broad. 08:51   I don't think we'd zero in on the degree of it. I 08:55   think, as I said before, there are many talented 08:52   people out there who are very successful in 08:52	<b>08:59</b> 59 9 59
7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14	Squier from Greenberg Traurig on behalf of Samsung.08:55THE VIDEOGRAPHER:Thank you.08:56MR. DESAI:Anish Desai and Chris08:56Marando from Weil Gotshal on behalf of Apple.08:56WILLIAM HAYS,08:56having been previously sworn, continued to testify08:56as follows:08:56	5 8 9 10 11 12 13 14	"or equivalent." 08:59   Q. And define, from your perspective, what   the industry would be. 08:59   A. Well, that's why we'd keep it very broad. 08:51   I don't think we'd zero in on the degree of it. I 08:55   think, as I said before, there are many talented 08:52   people out there who are very successful in 08:52	<b>08:59</b> 59 59 59 59 59
7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15	Squier from Greenberg Traurig on behalf of Samsung.08:55THE VIDEOGRAPHER:Thank you.08:56MR. DESAI:Anish Desai and Chris08:56Marando from Weil Gotshal on behalf of Apple.08:56WILLIAM HAYS,08:56having been previously sworn, continued to testify08:56as follows:08:56EXAMINATION08:56	5 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15	"or equivalent."08:59Q. And define, from your perspective, whatthe industry would be.08:59A. Well, that's why we'd keep it very broad.08:1I don't think we'd zero in on the degree of it. I08:59think, as I said before, there are many talented08:59people out there who are very successful in08:59technical areas that weren't constrained by training08:59	<b>08:59</b> 59 59 59 59 59
7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	Squier from Greenberg Traurig on behalf of Samsung.08:55THE VIDEOGRAPHER: Thank you.08:56MR. DESAI: Anish Desai and Chris08:56Marando from Weil Gotshal on behalf of Apple.08:56Marando from Weil Gotshal on behalf of Apple.08:56BY MR. TACHÉ:08:56	5 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	"or equivalent." 08:59   Q. And define, from your perspective, what   the industry would be. 08:59   A. Well, that's why we'd keep it very broad. 08:51   I don't think we'd zero in on the degree of it. I 08:52   think, as I said before, there are many talented 08:52   people out there who are very successful in 08:52   technical areas that weren't constrained by training 08:59	<b>08:59</b> 59 59 59 59 3:59
7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	Squier from Greenberg Traurig on behalf of Samsung.08:56THE VIDEOGRAPHER: Thank you.08:56MR. DESAI: Anish Desai and Chris08:56Marando from Weil Gotshal on behalf of Apple.08:56Marando from Weil Gotshal on behalf of Apple.08:56Barando from Weil Gotshal on behalf of Apple.08:56Barando from Weil Gotshal on behalf of Apple.08:56BY MR. TACHÉ:08:56Q. Good morning, Mr. Hays.08:56	5 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	"or equivalent." 08:59   Q. And define, from your perspective, what the industry would be. 08:59   A. Well, that's why we'd keep it very broad. 08:51   I don't think we'd zero in on the degree of it. I 08:52   think, as I said before, there are many talented 08:52   people out there who are very successful in 08:52   technical areas that weren't constrained by training 08:59   Q. Would one need to have an understanding of 08:59	08:59 59 59 59 59 3:59 08:5
7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	Squier from Greenberg Traurig on behalf of Samsung.08:55THE VIDEOGRAPHER: Thank you.08:56MR. DESAI: Anish Desai and Chris08:56Marando from Weil Gotshal on behalf of Apple.08:56WILLIAM HAYS,08:56having been previously sworn, continued to testify08:56as follows:08:56EXAMINATION08:56BY MR. TACHÉ:08:56Q. Good morning, Mr. Hays.08:56A. Good morning.08:57	5 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19	"or equivalent." 08:59   Q. And define, from your perspective, what 08:59   the industry would be. 08:59   A. Well, that's why we'd keep it very broad. 08:51   I don't think we'd zero in on the degree of it. I 08:52   think, as I said before, there are many talented 08:52   people out there who are very successful in 08:59   or background. 08:59   Q. Would one need to have an understanding of the paging of paging systems to be considered for	08:59 59 59 59 59 3:59 08:55 08:55
7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	Squier from Greenberg Traurig on behalf of Samsung.08:56THE VIDEOGRAPHER: Thank you.08:56MR. DESAI: Anish Desai and Chris08:56Marando from Weil Gotshal on behalf of Apple.08:56Marando from Weil Gotshal on behalf of Apple.08:56Investigation of the Samsung.08:56BY MR. TACHÉ:08:56A. Good morning.08:57Q. You testified yesterday that you have a08:57degree from the University of Virginia in electrical08:57	5 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	"or equivalent." 08:59   Q. And define, from your perspective, what 08:59   the industry would be. 08:59   A. Well, that's why we'd keep it very broad. 08:51   I don't think we'd zero in on the degree of it. I 08:55   think, as I said before, there are many talented 08:52   people out there who are very successful in 08:59   or background. 08:59   Q. Would one need to have an understanding of the paging of paging systems to be considered for a position? 08:59   MR. TAYLOR: Objection; form. 08:59	08:59 59 59 59 59 3:59 08:5 08:5
7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	Squier from Greenberg Traurig on behalf of Samsung.08:56THE VIDEOGRAPHER: Thank you.08:56MR. DESAI: Anish Desai and Chris08:56Marando from Weil Gotshal on behalf of Apple.08:56Marando from Weil Gotshal on behalf of Apple.08:56Invite Statistical Colspan="2">08:56BY MR. TACHÉ:08:56Q. Good morning.08:57Q. You testified yesterday that you have a08:57degree from the University of Virginia in electrical08:57engineering. Is that correct?08:57	5 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	"or equivalent." 08:59   Q. And define, from your perspective, what the industry would be. 08:59   A. Well, that's why we'd keep it very broad. 08:59   A. Well, that's why we'd keep it very broad. 08:59   I don't think we'd zero in on the degree of it. I 08:59   think, as I said before, there are many talented 08:59   people out there who are very successful in 08:59   or background. 08:59   Q. Would one need to have an understanding of the paging of paging systems to be considered for   a position? 08:59   MR. TAYLOR: Objection; form. 08:55   A. I don't think that would be a requirement. 08:59	08:59 59 59 59 59 3:59 08:5 08:5 9
7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	Squier from Greenberg Traurig on behalf of Samsung.08:55THE VIDEOGRAPHER: Thank you.08:56MR. DESAI: Anish Desai and Chris08:56Marando from Weil Gotshal on behalf of Apple.08:56WILLIAM HAYS,08:56having been previously sworn, continued to testify08:56as follows:08:56EXAMINATION08:56BY MR. TACHÉ:08:56Q. Good morning, Mr. Hays.08:56A. Good morning.08:57Q. You testified yesterday that you have a08:57degree from the University of Virginia in electrical08:57A. Yes.08:57	5 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	"or equivalent." 08:59   Q. And define, from your perspective, what 08:59   A. Well, that's why we'd keep it very broad. 08:59   A. Well, that's why we'd keep it very broad. 08:59   I don't think we'd zero in on the degree of it. I 08:59   think, as I said before, there are many talented 08:59   people out there who are very successful in 08:59   or background. 08:59   Q. Would one need to have an understanding of the paging of paging systems to be considered for a position? 08:59   MR. TAYLOR: Objection; form. 08:5   A. I don't think that would be a requirement. 08:59	08:59 59 59 59 3:59 08:59 08:59 9 59
7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	Squier from Greenberg Traurig on behalf of Samsung.08:56THE VIDEOGRAPHER: Thank you.08:56MR. DESAI: Anish Desai and Chris08:56Marando from Weil Gotshal on behalf of Apple.08:56WILLIAM HAYS,08:56having been previously sworn, continued to testify08:56as follows:08:56EXAMINATION08:56BY MR. TACHÉ:08:56Q. Good morning, Mr. Hays.08:56A. Good morning.08:57Q. You testified yesterday that you have a08:57degree from the University of Virginia in electrical engineering. Is that correct?08:57Q. In order for someone to understand the08:57	5 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	"or equivalent."    Q. And define, from your perspective, what   the industry would be. 08:59   A. Well, that's why we'd keep it very broad. 08:51   I don't think we'd zero in on the degree of it. I 08:55   think, as I said before, there are many talented 08:52   people out there who are very successful in 08:59   O. Would one need to have an understanding of the paging of paging systems to be considered for a position? 08:59   MR. TAYLOR: Objection; form. 08:59   A. I don't think that would be a requirement. 08:59   Q. Would one need to have an understanding of the paging of paging systems to be considered for a position? 08:59   MR. TAYLOR: Objection; form. 08:59   Q. Would one need to have an understanding of the paging of paging systems to be considered for a position? 08:59   MR. TAYLOR: Objection; form. 08:59   MR. TAYLOR: Objection; form. 08:59   Q. Would one need to have an understanding of the paging of paging systems to be considered for the paging of paging systems to be considered for the paging of paging systems to be considered for the paging of paging systems (form.) 08:59   MR. TAYLOR: Objection; form. 08:59   Q. Would one need to have an understanding of the paging of paging systems (form.)	08:59 59 59 59 59 3:59 08:5 9 59 08:5
7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24	Squier from Greenberg Traurig on behalf of Samsung.08:55THE VIDEOGRAPHER: Thank you.08:56MR. DESAI: Anish Desai and Chris08:56Marando from Weil Gotshal on behalf of Apple.08:56WILLIAM HAYS,08:56having been previously sworn, continued to testify08:56as follows:08:56EXAMINATION08:56BY MR. TACHÉ:08:56Q. Good morning, Mr. Hays.08:56A. Good morning.08:57Q. You testified yesterday that you have a08:57degree from the University of Virginia in electrical engineering. Is that correct?08:57Q. In order for someone to understand the invention that is the subject of the '428 patent,08:57	5 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24	"or equivalent." 08:59   Q. And define, from your perspective, what 08:59   A. Well, that's why we'd keep it very broad. 08:59   A. Well, that's why we'd keep it very broad. 08:59   I don't think we'd zero in on the degree of it. I 08:59   think, as I said before, there are many talented 08:59   people out there who are very successful in 08:59   or background. 08:59   Q. Would one need to have an understanding of the paging of paging systems to be considered for a position? 08:59   MR. TAYLOR: Objection; form. 08:59   MR. TAYLOR: Objection; form. 08:59   Q. Would one need to have an understanding of the paging of paging systems to be considered for a position? 08:59   MR. TAYLOR: Objection; form. 08:59   Q. Would one need to have an understanding of cellular networks to be considered one skilled in	08:59 59 59 59 3:59 08:5 08:5 9 59
7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	Squier from Greenberg Traurig on behalf of Samsung.08:56THE VIDEOGRAPHER: Thank you.08:56MR. DESAI: Anish Desai and Chris08:56Marando from Weil Gotshal on behalf of Apple.08:56WILLIAM HAYS,08:56having been previously sworn, continued to testify08:56as follows:08:56EXAMINATION08:56BY MR. TACHÉ:08:56Q. Good morning, Mr. Hays.08:56A. Good morning.08:57Q. You testified yesterday that you have a08:57degree from the University of Virginia in electrical engineering. Is that correct?08:57Q. In order for someone to understand the08:57	5 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	"or equivalent."    Q. And define, from your perspective, what   the industry would be. 08:59   A. Well, that's why we'd keep it very broad. 08:51   I don't think we'd zero in on the degree of it. I 08:55   think, as I said before, there are many talented 08:52   people out there who are very successful in 08:59   O. Would one need to have an understanding of the paging of paging systems to be considered for a position? 08:59   MR. TAYLOR: Objection; form. 08:59   A. I don't think that would be a requirement. 08:59   Q. Would one need to have an understanding of the paging of paging systems to be considered for a position? 08:59   MR. TAYLOR: Objection; form. 08:59   Q. Would one need to have an understanding of the paging of paging systems to be considered for a position? 08:59   MR. TAYLOR: Objection; form. 08:59   MR. TAYLOR: Objection; form. 08:59   Q. Would one need to have an understanding of the paging of paging systems to be considered for the paging of paging systems to be considered for the paging of paging systems to be considered for the paging of paging systems (form.) 08:59   MR. TAYLOR: Objection; form. 08:59   Q. Would one need to have an understanding of the paging of paging systems (form.)	08:59 59 59 59 59 08:59 08:59 9 9 59 08:59

Pages 277 to 280

Veritext National Deposition & Litigation Services 866 299-5127

DOCKET ALARM Find authenticated court documents without watermarks at <u>docketalarm.com</u>.

1	MR. TAYLOR: Objection; form. 08:59	1	BY MR. TACHÉ: 09:02
2	A. That would not be a primary requirement, 09:00	2	Q. Prior to being prior to joining MTEL 09:02
3	no. 09:00	3	and I know we went through your educational 09:02
4	BY MR. TACHÉ: 09:00	4	background yesterday how much direct experience 09:0
5	Q. Is there are there any other special 09:00	5	did you have in paging systems? 09:02
6	knowledge or skill required that you would consider 09:00	6	A. I didn't have any direct experience in 09:02
7	necessary for one to be skilled in the art relating 09:00	7	paging systems per se, only in electronics 09:02
8	to the '428 patent? 09:00	8	development, testing of systems. 09:02
9	-	9	
	5	10	
10	A. The '428 patent has many broad concepts 09:00		
11	expressed in it, and lots of disciplines would be 09:00	11	'428 patent have a common set of minimum educational 09
12	would benefit from the execution of it, I'm sure, 09:00	12	requirements? 09:02
13	but I can't I can't think of any particular one 09:00	13	A. Not to my knowledge. 09:02
14	that stands out. 09:00	14	Q. So the named inventors did not all have 09:03
15	BY MR. TACHÉ: 09:00	15	four-year degrees? 09:03
16	Q. Okay. I sort of have the same series of 09:00	16	A. Well, I understood your question to say 09:03
17	questions with respect to the '946 patent. In your 09:00	17	were there any requirements, and I'm saying I don't 09:03
18	own mind, can you explain what you would consider 09:00	18	know that there were any requirements. So I'm not 09:03
19	one skilled in the art to be relating to the '946 09:00	19	sure about their individual backgrounds. Many of 09:03
20	patent? 09:00	20	them did have degrees, I know. 09:03
21	MR. TAYLOR: Objection; form. 09:00	21	Q. Do you know of anyone that's a named 09:03
22	A. Well, again, that's conjecture on my part. 09:00	22	inventor on the '428 patent that didn't have a 09:03
23	I I would go back to the fact that there have 09:00	23	four-year degree? 09:03
24	been many skilled people who don't have particular 09:01	24	A. Let me let me refresh my list on that. 09:03
25	educational backgrounds that would be very capable 09:01	25	Q. I believe that's Exhibit 3. 09:03
	Page 281		Page 283
1	of using this information. 09:01	1	A. Just a second. Well, I don't think I have 09:03
2	BY MR. TACHÉ: 09:01	2	Exhibit 3. 09:03
3	Q. The same question with respect to the '946 09:01	3	Q. We have an extra copy, if that would help 09
4	patent as it relates to work experience. Is there a 09:01	4	you. 09:04
5	minimum requirement? 09:01	5	A. Okay. 09:04
6	MR. TAYLOR: Objection; form. 09:01	6	Q. We're also going to be asking the same 09:0
7	A. I would say the same answer, that there 09:01	7	questions with respect 09:04
8	have been many people in history in technology that 09:01	8	A. Okay. I did 09:04
9	have not had particular educational backgrounds that 09:01	9	O to Exhibit 9 if that's 09:04
10	do quite well. And so I would not restrict their 09:01	10	A. You might want to get it. 09:04
11	their involvement. 09:01	11	6 6
12	BY MR. TACHÉ: 09:01	12	THE WITNESS: Is that 3? 09:04
13	Q. Okay. So an understanding of paging, 09:01	13	MR. TAYLOR: That's 3. 09:04
14	two-way paging systems, or two-way paging networks 09:01	14	THE WITNESS: Oh, this is 3. All 09:04
15	would not be required from your perspective to be 09:01	15	right. 09:04
16	one skilled in the art? 09:01	16	A. Masood Garahi did have a degree and 09:04
17	MR. TAYLOR: Objection; form. 09:01	17	BY MR. TACHÉ: 09:04
18	A. It would certainly be helpful, but not 09:01	18	Q. Do you happen to recall what that was in? 09
19	essential. 09:01	19	A. No. It was a technical degree, but I 09:04
20	BY MR. TACHÉ: 09:01	20	don't know what the what the actual degree was. 09:
21	Q. What about an understanding of cellular 09:02	21	Pinter also had a degree, and I'm not 09:04
	networks in terms of being one skilled in the art? 09:02	22	sure what the degree was in. Gregory Pinter had a 09:
22	MR. TAYLOR: Objection; form. 09:02	23	degree. 09:04
			John Hole Long Long not contain 00.04
22	A. Again, it would be good background but not 09:02	24	John Hale, I am I am not certain 09:04
22 23	-	24 25	about John. 09:04
22 23 24	A. Again, it would be good background but not 09:02		

Pages 281 to 284

Veritext National Deposition & Litigation Services 866 299-5127

**DOCKET A L A R M** Find authenticated court documents without watermarks at <u>docketalarm.com</u>.

1	Q. Do you know how much work experience John	09:0		A. He was in his he was older than his 09:07	
2	had prior to joining MTEL? 09:04		2	20's. 09:07	
3	A. No. 09:04		3	Q. So is it fair to say that he would have 09:07	
4	Q. Was there anyone else named as a 09	:04	4	had at least ten years work experience prior to 09:0	7
5	co-inventor on the '428 patent that, to your 09	9:04	5	joining MTEL? 09:07	
б	knowledge, did not have a degree other than	09:05	6	A. That would be an assumption on my part. I 09:07	
7	Mr. Hale? 09:05		7	would I would think so, but I don't know. 09:07	
8	A. That covers the list, so, no. 09:05		8	Q. If you had to characterize from your 09:07	
9	Q. Thank you. If you could turn to 09:0	5	9	perspective who your contemporaries would have been	09
10	Exhibit 9, which is the '946 patent. 09:05		10	at the time of the '428 and '946 inventions in terms 09:	07
11	MR. TAYLOR: Let me take this one, 09:	05	11	of an educational background and a technical 09:0	07
12	just to keep everything. 09:05		12	background, can you articulate that for me, please? 09	9:07
13	A. Oh, here it is. Exhibit 9? 09:05		13	MR. TAYLOR: Objection; form. 09:07	
14	BY MR. TACHÉ: 09:05		14	A. The named inventors are certainly I 09:08	
15	Q. 9, yes. 09:05		15	would certainly be comfortable in their group in a 09:08	
16	A. Okay. 09:05		16	technical forum. 09:08	
17	Q. Thank you. If you could walk through the	09:05	17	BY MR. TACHÉ: 09:08	
18	list of inventors named other than the ones already	09:05	18	Q. And is it fair to say that at least the 09:08	
19	covered in the '428 patent, and let me know if any	09:05	19	majority had at least a four-year degree from a 09:	08
20	of them did or didn't have a degree. 09:0	5	20	four-year technical degree and/or commensurate work	09
21	A. Dennis Cameron has a has a degree. 09:	05	21	experience? 09:08	
22	-	09:05	22	MR. TAYLOR: Objection; form. 09:08	
23	is in? 09:05		23	A. Yes. 09:08	
24	A. It's in it's in some electronics 09:05		24	BY MR. TACHÉ: 09:08	
25	related field, but I don't know the exact 09:05		25	Q. Would you consider your work experience 09	:09
	Page	285		Page 28	37
1	Q. But it's a technical degree? 09:05		1		9:09
2	A. It's a technical degree. 09:05		2		:09
3	Q. Thank you. 09:05		3	8	09:
4	A. Walt Roehr was a consultant. I'm not I 09:05		4	MR. TAYLOR: Objection; form. 09:09	
5	can't recall what his educational background was. 09:	05	5	A. I would have I would have no basis to 09:09	
6	Dr. Petrovic had a degree in 09:05		6	really say that. As I said before, I would be 09:09	
7	electrical engineering, a doctorate degree. 09:06		7	comfortable in a forum involving them. 09:09	
8	Jai Bhaget had degrees in electrical 09:06		8	BY MR. TACHÉ: 09:09	
9	engineering. 09:06		9	Q. Thank you. 09:09	
1.0				MR. TACHÉ: Could you mark that? 09:09	1
10	Masood Garahi, I think we just 09:06		10	(F) 1 11 1 NI 16 1 N 00 00	
11	covered him, he has a technical degree. 09:06		11	(Exhibit No. 15 marked) 09:09	
11 12	covered him, he has a technical degree.09:06David Ackerman, I don't know his09:06		11 12	BY MR. TACHÉ: 09:10	
11 12 13	covered him, he has a technical degree.09:06David Ackerman, I don't know his09:06educational background.09:06	00.05	11 12 13	BY MR. TACHÉ: 09:10 Q. If you could, please take a look at what's 09:1	
11 12 13 14	covered him, he has a technical degree. 09:06   David Ackerman, I don't know his 09:06   educational background. 09:06   Q. Are you familiar with Mr. Ackerman's work	09:06	11 12 13 14	BY MR. TACHÉ: 09:10   Q. If you could, please take a look at what's 09:10   been marked as Exhibit 15 in front of you. I would 09:10	09:
11 12 13 14 15	covered him, he has a technical degree. 09:06   David Ackerman, I don't know his 09:06   educational background. 09:06   Q. Are you familiar with Mr. Ackerman's work experience prior to joining MTEL?	6	11 12 13 14 15	BY MR. TACHÉ: 09:10   Q. If you could, please take a look at what's 09:10   been marked as Exhibit 15 in front of you. I would represent that it's an Australian patent numbered 09:10	09:
11 12 13 14 15 16	covered him, he has a technical degree. 09:06   David Ackerman, I don't know his 09:06   educational background. 09:06   Q. Are you familiar with Mr. Ackerman's work experience prior to joining MTEL? 09:00   A. I'm familiar with some of his experience. 09:06	6	11 12 13 14 15 16	BY MR. TACHÉ: 09:10   Q. If you could, please take a look at what's 09:10   been marked as Exhibit 15 in front of you. I would represent that it's an Australian patent numbered AU-A-79030/87. 09:10	09:
11 12 13 14 15 16 17	covered him, he has a technical degree. 09:06   David Ackerman, I don't know his 09:06   educational background. 09:06   Q. Are you familiar with Mr. Ackerman's work experience prior to joining MTEL? 09:06   A. I'm familiar with some of his experience. 09:06 09:06   Q. Was any of it technical based? 09:06	6	11 12 13 14 15 16 17	BY MR. TACHÉ: 09:10   Q. If you could, please take a look at what's 09:10   been marked as Exhibit 15 in front of you. I would represent that it's an Australian patent numbered   AU-A-79030/87. 09:10   And what I'd like to do is focus your 09:10	09: 09:
11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	covered him, he has a technical degree. 09:06   David Ackerman, I don't know his 09:06   educational background. 09:06   Q. Are you familiar with Mr. Ackerman's work experience prior to joining MTEL? 09:06   A. I'm familiar with some of his experience. 09:06   Q. Was any of it technical based? 09:06   A. Yes. He worked for the for the one 09:06	6	11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	BY MR. TACHÉ: 09:10   Q. If you could, please take a look at what's 09:10   been marked as Exhibit 15 in front of you. I would represent that it's an Australian patent numbered   AU-A-79030/87. 09:10   And what I'd like to do is focus your 09:10   attention on Page 15, Lines 15 through 29. 09:	09: 09: 10
11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19	covered him, he has a technical degree. 09:06   David Ackerman, I don't know his 09:06   educational background. 09:06   Q. Are you familiar with Mr. Ackerman's work experience prior to joining MTEL? 09:06   A. I'm familiar with some of his experience. 09:06   Q. Was any of it technical based? 09:06   A. Yes. He worked for the for the one 09:06   of the big telcos out of New York City. One of his 09:06	6	11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19	BY MR. TACHÉ: 09:10   Q. If you could, please take a look at what's 09:10   been marked as Exhibit 15 in front of you. I would represent that it's an Australian patent numbered   AU-A-79030/87. 09:10   And what I'd like to do is focus your 09:10   attention on Page 15, Lines 15 through 29. 09:   Actually, I'm sorry. Page 15, Lines 15 through 34. 00	09: 09: 10 09:1
11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	covered him, he has a technical degree. 09:06   David Ackerman, I don't know his 09:06   educational background. 09:06   Q. Are you familiar with Mr. Ackerman's work experience prior to joining MTEL? 09:06   A. I'm familiar with some of his experience. 09:06 09:06   A. I'm familiar with some of his experience. 09:06 09:06   A. Yes. He worked for the for the one 09:06 09:06   of the big telcos out of New York City. One of his 09:06   fortes was intelligent networks. 09:06	<b>6</b> 5 06	11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	BY MR. TACHÉ: 09:10   Q. If you could, please take a look at what's 09:10   been marked as Exhibit 15 in front of you. I would represent that it's an Australian patent numbered   AU-A-79030/87. 09:10   And what I'd like to do is focus your 09:10   attention on Page 15, Lines 15 through 29. 09:   Actually, I'm sorry. Page 15, Lines 15 through 34. 0   And that continues to the top of Page 16, the first 09	09: 09: 10 09:1
11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	covered him, he has a technical degree. 09:06   David Ackerman, I don't know his 09:06   educational background. 09:06   Q. Are you familiar with Mr. Ackerman's work experience prior to joining MTEL? 09:06   A. I'm familiar with some of his experience. 09:06 09:06   Q. Was any of it technical based? 09:06 09:06   A. Yes. He worked for the for the one 09:06 09:06   of the big telcos out of New York City. One of his 09:06 09:06   Q. Do you do you recall how many years 09:06 09:06	6 5 06 9:06	11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	BY MR. TACHÉ: 09:10   Q. If you could, please take a look at what's 09:10   been marked as Exhibit 15 in front of you. I would represent that it's an Australian patent numbered   AU-A-79030/87. 09:10   And what I'd like to do is focus your 09:10   attention on Page 15, Lines 15 through 29. 09:   Actually, I'm sorry. Page 15, Lines 15 through 34. 09:   And that continues to the top of Page 16, the first two lines. 09:10	09: 09: 10 09:1 9:10
11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	covered him, he has a technical degree.09:06David Ackerman, I don't know his09:06educational background.09:06Q. Are you familiar with Mr. Ackerman's workexperience prior to joining MTEL?09:06A. I'm familiar with some of his experience.09:06Q. Was any of it technical based?09:06A. Yes. He worked for the for the one09:06of the big telcos out of New York City. One of his09:06Q. Do you do you recall how many years09experience Mr. Ackerman had prior to joining MTEL?	<b>6</b> 5 06	11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 21 5 22	BY MR. TACHÉ: 09:10   Q. If you could, please take a look at what's 09:10   been marked as Exhibit 15 in front of you. I would represent that it's an Australian patent numbered   AU-A-79030/87. 09:10   And what I'd like to do is focus your 09:10   attention on Page 15, Lines 15 through 29. 09:   Actually, I'm sorry. Page 15, Lines 15 through 34. 09   And that continues to the top of Page 16, the first 09   Mol lines. 09:10   And then let me show you a second 09:10	09: 09: 10 09:1 9:10
11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	covered him, he has a technical degree.09:06David Ackerman, I don't know his09:06educational background.09:06Q. Are you familiar with Mr. Ackerman's workexperience prior to joining MTEL?09:06A. I'm familiar with some of his experience.09:06Q. Was any of it technical based?09:06A. Yes. He worked for the for the one09:06of the big telcos out of New York City. One of his09:06Q. Do you do you recall how many years09experience Mr. Ackerman had prior to joining MTEL?A. No.A. No.09:07	6 5 06 <b>1:06</b> <b>09:0</b> 6	11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 21 5 22 23	BY MR. TACHÉ: 09:10   Q. If you could, please take a look at what's 09:10   been marked as Exhibit 15 in front of you. I would represent that it's an Australian patent numbered   AU-A-79030/87. 09:10   And what I'd like to do is focus your 09:10   attention on Page 15, Lines 15 through 34. 09   And that continues to the top of Page 16, the first 09   two lines. 09:10   And then let me show you a second 09:10   Iocation, because I think it might be helpful, is to 09:10	09: 09: 10 09:1 9:10 ) :11
11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24	covered him, he has a technical degree. 09:06   David Ackerman, I don't know his 09:06   educational background. 09:06   Q. Are you familiar with Mr. Ackerman's work experience prior to joining MTEL? 09:06   A. I'm familiar with some of his experience. 09:06   Q. Was any of it technical based? 09:06   A. Yes. He worked for the for the one 09:06   A. Yes. He worked for the for the one 09:06   of the big telcos out of New York City. One of his 09:06   Q. Do you do you recall how many years 09   A. No. 09:07   Q. Was he a man in his 20's when he joined 09:05	6 5 06 9:06	11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24	BY MR. TACHÉ: 09:10   Q. If you could, please take a look at what's 09:10   been marked as Exhibit 15 in front of you. I would represent that it's an Australian patent numbered   AU-A-79030/87. 09:10   And what I'd like to do is focus your 09:10   attention on Page 15, Lines 15 through 29. 09:10   attention on Page 15, Lines 15 through 34. 09   And that continues to the top of Page 16, the first 09   two lines. 09:10   And then let me show you a second 09:10   location, because I think it might be helpful, is to 09   also take a look at Figure 2, which appears three or 09	09: 09: 10 09:1 9:10 ) :11 09:1
11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	covered him, he has a technical degree.09:06David Ackerman, I don't know his09:06educational background.09:06Q. Are you familiar with Mr. Ackerman's workexperience prior to joining MTEL?09:06A. I'm familiar with some of his experience.09:06Q. Was any of it technical based?09:06A. Yes. He worked for the for the one09:06of the big telcos out of New York City. One of his09:06Q. Do you do you recall how many years09experience Mr. Ackerman had prior to joining MTEL?A. No.A. No.09:07	6 5 06 <b>1:06</b> <b>09:0</b> 6	11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 21 5 22 23	BY MR. TACHÉ: 09:10   Q. If you could, please take a look at what's 09:10   been marked as Exhibit 15 in front of you. I would represent that it's an Australian patent numbered   AU-A-79030/87. 09:10   And what I'd like to do is focus your 09:10   attention on Page 15, Lines 15 through 34. 09   And that continues to the top of Page 16, the first 09   two lines. 09:10   And then let me show you a second 09:10   Iocation, because I think it might be helpful, is to 09:10	09: 09: 10 09:1 9:10

Pages 285 to 288

Veritext National Deposition & Litigation Services 866 299-5127

DOCKET ALARM Find authenticated court documents without watermarks at <u>docketalarm.com</u>.

## DOCKET A L A R M



# Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

## **Real-Time Litigation Alerts**



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

### **Advanced Docket Research**



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

## **Analytics At Your Fingertips**



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

#### API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

#### LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

#### FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

#### E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.