

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

**ZTE (USA) INC., HTC CORPORATION, HTC AMERICA,
SAMSUNG ELECTRONICS CO., LTD., and SAMSUNG ELECTRONICS
AMERICA, INC., Petitioners,**

v.

**Evolved Wireless LLC,
Patent Owner**

Case IPR2016-00757¹

Patent 7,881,236 B2

Declaration of Todor Cooklev, Ph. D.

Evolved Wireless
Exhibit 2006
ZTE/HTC/Samsung v. Evolved Wireless
IPR2016-00757

¹ IPR2016-01345 has been consolidated with this proceeding.

CONTENTS

I.	Introduction.....	3
II.	Qualifications	4
III.	Scope and Summary of opinions.....	6
IV.	Legal standards	6
A.	Presumption of Validity	7
B.	Anticipation.....	7
C.	Obviousness	9
V.	Level of Ordinary Skill in the Art	13
VII.	Overview of the technology	15
A.	Overview of the LTE Prior Art System.....	15
B.	Acquiring Radio Resources—UL Grants	19
C.	HARQ.....	21
D.	Contention-based Random Access Procedures	24
E.	The four phases of the Random Access Procedure	25
1.	Phase 1 – Random Access preamble	25
2.	Phase 2 – Random Access Response (RAR)	26
3.	Phase 3 – msg3	27
4.	Phase 4—Contention Resolution, msg4	28
VIII.	Overview of the ‘236 patent.....	30
IX.	Validity.....	35
A.	The 321 reference.....	35
1.	Dr. Min’s analysis of the penultimate limitation of claim 1 is incorrect	37
2.	The prior art 321 document does not employ the If- Then-Else construct relevant to the penultimate claim limitation, but claim 1 of the ‘236 patent does	39
B.	The 300 reference.....	51

I. INTRODUCTION

1. My name is Todor Cooklev. I have been retained by Evolved Wireless LLC (“Evolved Wireless” or “Evolved”).

2. I have been asked to prepare this Declaration in connection with Case No. IPR2016-00757 (consolidated with IPR2016-01345) for *inter partes* review of U.S. Patent No. 7,881,236 (“the ‘236 patent’) and the Declaration of Dr. Paul Min (“the Min Declaration”). I understand that Dr. Paul Min has been retained by ZTE (USA) Inc., HTC Corporation, and HTC America, Inc., (collectively “Petitioners”) to determine if the ‘236 patent’s claims are invalid. *See* Min Declaration at ¶ 1. I have been asked to consider the opinions of Dr. Min, and provide my opinions regarding the validity of the ‘236 patent’s claims.

3. I base my Declaration on information currently available to me. I reserve the right to continue my investigation. I further reserve the right to expand, modify, and/or supplement this Declaration and my opinions as additional information becomes available to me.

4. In this Declaration, I cite to various documents and testimony. These citations are meant to be exemplary, and not exhaustive. Citations to documents or testimony are not intended to signify that my conclusions

or opinions are limited to the cited sources, or supported by the cited sources only.

II. QUALIFICATIONS

5. My qualifications are stated more fully in my *Curriculum Vitae*, a copy of which is attached hereto as Appendix 1.

6. I have a Ph.D. in electrical engineering from Tokyo Institute of Technology in 1995. Currently I work as the Founding Director of the Wireless Technology Center at Indiana University-Purdue University Fort Wayne and hold an endowed faculty position as Harris Chair of Wireless Communication and Applied Research.

7. I have received research funding from the National Science Foundation (NSF), the U.S. Air Force Research Laboratory, the Defense Advanced Research Projects Agency (DARPA), and several major companies such as Raytheon, Harris (formerly ITT), France Telecom, and other smaller technology companies.

8. I am a named inventor on thirty (30) patents issued in the United States relating to the design of integrated circuits for wireless communications systems. I have also authored and co-authored more than

100 peer-reviewed articles. (A list of my publications and patents appears in my *Curriculum Vitae* attached as Appendix 1.)

9. I received a 1994 Asia-Pacific Conference on Circuits and Systems Best Paper Award and a 2012 IEEE Standards Association award for “outstanding contributions to IEEE 802.11aa.”

10. I have experience working on the design of integrated circuits (“ICs”) for wireless communication systems implementing algorithms of the types that are at issue in this investigation.

11. I have been actively involved in professional organizations, in particular relevant to standards for wireless communications systems. I have served the IEEE Standards Association in several capacities, including as the first Chair of the IEEE Standards Education Committee during 2006-2007.

12. I have served on standards committees, such as IEEE 802 and 3GPP, and have directly contributed to the development of several standards for communications systems. I have chaired a number of standards committee meetings and served in other leadership roles. In particular, I have attended meetings of 3GPP, and have prepared documents submitted to 3GPP.

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.