

IN THE UNITED STATES
PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE
BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

- - - - - x

APPLE, INCORPORATED,
Petitioner,
v.
PERSONALIZED MEDIA
COMMUNICATIONS, LLC,
Patent Owner.

Case IPR2016-00754
Patent 8,559,635 B1
-and-

Case IPR2016-01520
Patent 8,559,635 B1
- - - - -

CONFERENCE CALL

April 26, 2017; 1:00 pm

BEFORE: TRENTON A. WARD
KARL D. EASTHOM
Administrative Patent Judges

Reported By:
Robin LaFemina
Job no: 18689

1 A P P E A R A N C E S:

2

3 For Petitioner

4 KIRKLAND & ELLIS LLP

5 300 North LaSalle

6 Chicago, Illinois 60654

7 BY: JOEL MERKIN, ESQ.

8 joel.merkin@kirkland.com

9 -and-

10 KIRKLAND & ELLIS LLP

11 601 Lexington Avenue

12 New York, New York 10022

13 BY: ALAN RABINOWITZ, ESQ.

14 alan.rabinowitz@kirkland.com

15

16 For Patent Owner

17 PERSONALIZED MEDIA COMMUNICATIONS, LLC

18 BY: THOMAS J. SCOTT, JR., General Counsel

19 tscott@pmcip.com

20 -and-

21 GOODWIN & PROCTER LLP

22 901 New York Avenue, N.W.

23 Washington, DC 20001

24 BY: KRUPA PARIKH, ESQ.

25 kparikh@goodwinlaw.com

1 JUDGE WARD: Good afternoon.
2 This is Judge Ward with the Patent
3 Trial and Appeal Board, joined by my
4 colleague Judge Easthom. This is a
5 conference call for Inter Partes Review
6 Matter Number IPR2016-754, case in
7 which Apple is the Petitioner and PMC
8 is the Patent Owner.

9 Who do we have on the line for
10 Petitioner?

11 MR. MERKIN: Good afternoon,
12 Your Honor, this is Joel Merkin for
13 Petitioner Apple, and with me is Alan
14 Rabinowitz.

15 JUDGE WARD: Thank you, Mr.
16 Merkin and Mr. Rabinowitz.

17 Anyone else going to be joining
18 from Petitioner?

19 MR. MERKIN: No one else.

20 JUDGE WARD: Thank you. Great.

21 And who do we have on the call
22 for Patent Owner?

23 MR. SCOTT: We have Thomas J.
24 Scott, Jr., general counsel of
25 Personalized Media Communications, and

1 I have with me Krupa Parikh of the law
2 firm of Goodwin Procter.

3 JUDGE WARD: Okay. Mr. Scott,
4 is it?

5 MR. SCOTT: Yes, that's correct.

6 JUDGE WARD: Thank you,
7 Mr. Scott. And Ms. Parikh, thank you
8 for joining us.

9 Is anyone else going to be
10 joining from Patent Owner?

11 MR. SCOTT: No.

12 JUDGE WARD: Okay. I understand
13 a court reporter is on the line. Who
14 is it that retained the court reporter?

15 MR. MERKIN: Petitioner Apple
16 has.

17 JUDGE WARD: Okay. Thank you,
18 Mr. -- is that Mr. Merkin?

19 MR. MERKIN: Yes, it is.

20 JUDGE WARD: Mr. Merkin, if you
21 could please make sure to file a copy
22 of that transcript in our record as
23 soon as it becomes available to you
24 after the call.

25 MR. MERKIN: Will do, Your

1 Honor.

2 JUDGE WARD: Thank you. And
3 also, counsel, please remember when
4 you're speaking today if you could just
5 announce your name when you begin to
6 speak, that way it will make it easier
7 for the court reporter to keep track.

8 We scheduled this conference
9 call today at Mr. Merkin's request, his
10 request to have a discussion for
11 authorization regarding a motion to
12 strike Exhibit 2140 in this case or in
13 the alternative for the ability to file
14 a sur-reply to Patent Owner's Motion to
15 Amend. Mr. Merkin, I'm going to give
16 you a chance to address those issues
17 and then allow Patent Owner to respond,
18 so Mr. Merkin, you have the floor.

19 MR. MERKIN: Thank you, Your
20 Honor. Yes, it's -- Exhibit 2140 is a
21 new exhibit that Patent Owner filed
22 with its reply to its Motion to Amend.
23 It's a 143 page declaration submitted
24 by an employee at PMC, and again filed
25 for the first time with the reply.

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.