

**IN THE UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE**

In re Patent of: Dumas, et al.  
U.S. Patent No.: 9,057,210 Attorney Docket No.: 42746-0006IP1  
Issue Date: June 16, 2015  
Appl. Serial No.: 13/734,671  
Filing Date: January 4, 2013  
Title: WIRELESS ACCESS CONTROL SYSTEM AND  
RELATED METHODS

**Mail Stop Patent Board**

Patent Trial and Appeal Board  
U.S. Patent and Trademark Office  
P.O. Box 1450  
Alexandria, VA 22313-1450

**PETITION FOR *INTER PARTES* REVIEW OF UNITED STATES PATENT  
NO. 9,057,210 PURSUANT TO 35 U.S.C. §§ 311–319, 37 C.F.R. § 42**

**TABLE OF CONTENTS**

<b>I.</b>	<b>MANDATORY NOTICES UNDER 37 C.F.R § 42.8(a)(1)</b> .....	<b>1</b>
	A. Real Party-In-Interest Under 37 C.F.R. § 42.8(b)(1).....	1
	B. Related Matters Under 37 C.F.R. § 42.8(b)(2).....	1
	C. Lead And Back-Up Counsel Under 37 C.F.R. § 42.8(b)(3).....	2
	D. Service Information .....	2
<b>II.</b>	<b>PAYMENT OF FEES – 37 C.F.R. § 42.103</b> .....	<b>2</b>
<b>III.</b>	<b>REQUIREMENTS FOR IPR UNDER 37 C.F.R. § 42.104</b> .....	<b>2</b>
	A. Grounds for Standing Under 37 C.F.R. § 42.104(a).....	2
	B. Challenge Under 37 C.F.R. § 42.104(b) and Relief .....	3
<b>IV.</b>	<b>CLAIM CONSTRUCTION UNDER 37 C.F.R. §§ 42.104(b)(3)</b> .....	<b>4</b>
	A. Construction of the term “communication rate” .....	5
<b>V.</b>	<b>SUMMARY OF THE ’210 PATENT</b> .....	<b>6</b>
	A. A Brief Description.....	6
	B. The Claimed Subject Matter .....	8
	C. The Prosecution History .....	9
<b>VI.</b>	<b>LEVEL OF ORDINARY SKILL IN THE ART</b> .....	<b>10</b>
<b>VII.</b>	<b>MANNER OF APPLYING CITED PRIOR ART TO EVERY CLAIM FOR WHICH AN IPR IS REQUESTED, THUS ESTABLISHING A REASONABLE LIKELIHOOD THAT AT LEAST ONE CLAIM OF THE ’210 PATENT IS UNPATENTABLE</b> .....	<b>11</b>
	A. HOWARTER.....	11
	B. [GROUND 1] – Claims 1, 3, 4, 6, 7, 9, 10, 12-15, 17, 18 and 20 are obvious over Howarter in view of Willats under 35 U.S.C. § 103.....	13
	C. [GROUND 2] – Claim 2 is obvious over Howarter in view of Willats and Hassan under 35 U.S.C. § 103 .....	38
	D. [GROUND 3] – Claims 5, 7, 16 and 18 are obvious over Howarter in view of Willats and Luebke under 35 U.S.C. § 103 .....	40
	E. [GROUND 4] – Claims 21 and 22 are obvious over Howarter in view of Willats and McLintock under 35 U.S.C. § 103 .....	43
	F. [GROUND 5] – Claims 23, 24, 26 and 27 are obvious in view of Howarter under 35 U.S.C. § 103 .....	50
	G. [GROUND 6] – Claims 23, 24, 28, 29 and 31 are obvious over Howarter in view of Popelard under 35 U.S.C. § 103.....	52

H. [GROUND 7] – Claims 25 and 27 are obvious over Howarter in view of Luebke under 35 U.S.C. § 103 .....57

I. [GROUND 8] – Claims 33, 35, 38, 39, 41, 42, 44 and 45 are obvious over Howarter in view of McLintock under 35 U.S.C. § 103 .....58

J. [GROUND 9] – Claim 34 is obvious in view of Howarter in view of McLintock and Hassan under 35 U.S.C. § 103 .....59

K. [GROUND 10] – Claim 37 is obvious in view of Howarter in view of McLintock and Willats under 35 U.S.C. § 103 .....59

L. [GROUND 11] – Claims 40 and 42 are obvious in view of Howarter in view of McLintock and Luebke under 35 U.S.C. § 103.....59

**VIII. CONCLUSION .....59**

**EXHIBITS**

- ASSA-1001 U.S. Patent No. 9,057,210 to Dumas, et al. (“the ’210 Patent”)
- ASSA-1002 Excerpts from the Prosecution History of the ’210 Patent (“the Prosecution History”)
- ASSA-1003 Provisional Appl. No. 61/453,737 to Dumas, et al.
- ASSA-1004 Declaration of Dr. Richard T. Mihran
- ASSA-1005 U.S. Patent Publication No. 2010/0075656 to Howarter, et al. (“Howarter”)
- ASSA-1006 U.S. Patent Publication No. 2003/0008675 to Willats, et al. (“Willats”)
- ASSA-1007 U.S. Patent Publication No. 2010/0171642 to Hassan, et al. (“Hassan”)
- ASSA-1008 U.S. Patent No. 6,034,617 to Luebke, et al. (“Luebke”)
- ASSA-1009 U.S. Patent Publication No. 2002/0099945 to McLintock, et al. (“McLintock”)
- ASSA-1010 U.S. Patent Publication No. 2011/0181387 to (“Popelard”)
- ASSA-1011 Webopedia Computer Dictionary, What is clock speed?, [https://web.archive.org/web/20080105061159/http://www.webopedia.com/TERM/C/clock\\_speed.html](https://web.archive.org/web/20080105061159/http://www.webopedia.com/TERM/C/clock_speed.html) (archived via Wayback Machine Internet Archive January 5, 2008, retrieved February 23, 2016)
- ASSA-1012 Excerpt From Embedded Systems: Architecture, Programming and Design, Raj Kamal, p.18 (Tata McGraw-Hill Publishing Co. Ltd. 12th reprint 2007) (2003)
- ASSA-1013 Excerpt from Embedded Systems: Architecture, Programming and Design, Raj Kamal, p.109 (Tata McGraw-Hill Publishing Co. Ltd. 12th reprint 2007)

(2003)

- ASSA-1014 U.S. Patent Publication No. 2010/0148921 to Bliding, et al. (“Bliding”)
- ASSA-1015 Intel, Research In Motion Collaborate on Next Generation BlackBerry Devices, [https://web.archive.org/web/20070322153255/http://www.intel.com/pressroom/archive/releases/20050927corp\\_a.htm](https://web.archive.org/web/20070322153255/http://www.intel.com/pressroom/archive/releases/20050927corp_a.htm) (archived via Wayback Machine Internet Archive March 22, 2007, retrieved February 23, 2016)
- ASSA-1016 BlackBerry Curve 8300 Review, <http://www.brighthand.com/phonereview/blackberry-curve-8300-review/>, (archived via Wayback Machine Internet Archive June 26, 2007, retrieved February 25, 2016)
- ASSA-1017 ARM and Intel Battle over the Mobile Chip’s Future, Technology News, Brad Smith, IEEE Computer Society, May 2008, at 15-18
- ASSA-1018 U.S. Patent No. 8,907,768 to Faith, et al. (“Faith”)
- ASSA-1019 U.S. Patent Publication No. 2005/0242923 to Pearson, et al. (“Pearson”)
- ASSA-1020 U.S. Provisional Application No. 61/424,501 to Talty, et al. (“Talty”) (published June 21, 2012 on the record of U.S. Publication No. 2012/0158244 to Talty, et al.)
- ASSA-1021 U.S. Patent No. 6,236,333 to King (“King”)
- ASSA-1022 U.S. Patent Publication No. 2006/0145811 to Nantz, et al. (“Nantz”)
- ASSA-1023 U.S. Patent Publication No. 2009/0284345 to Ghabra, et al. (“Ghabra”)
- ASSA-1024 U.S. Patent Publication No. 2010/0043524 to Takata (“Takata”)
- ASSA-1025 *Curriculum vitae* of Dr. Richard T. Mihran

# Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

## Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

## Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

## Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

## API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

## LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

## FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

## E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.